

>MALCOLM THURLBY

Seven of the eight essays in this volume derive from papers presented in sessions on Canadian Gothic at the thirty-ninth Annual Conference of the Society for the Study of Architecture in Canada held at Carleton University, May 23rd to 26th, 2012. The undersigned's paper was presented at the 2010 Annual Conference of the Society in Lunenburg, Nova Scotia, and was submitted for publication only to get lost somewhere in cyberspace. As it turns out, that delay may not have been such a bad thing, as it afforded me time to clarify my thoughts on the topic. All the essays explore aspects of Gothic revival architecture in Canada from the 1840s to the early twentieth century. Consideration is given to the largely English focus for the theoretical background for Canadian Gothic. Specific aspects of the links with England are investigated with the view to demonstrate how Gothic ideas—iconographic, stylistic, and practical—were transmitted across the Atlantic and/or within North America and, in the case of rural domestic architecture, throughout Ontario.

Paul Christianson's essay, "St. John's Anglican Church, Portsmouth, and the Gothic Revival in Canada West," explores the impact of the Cambridge Camden Society (renamed Ecclesiological Society in 1846) on church design in the late 1840s. He attributes St John's to Kingston architect William Coverdale. On the one hand, he considers the background of conservatism in style perhaps demanded by the building committee. On the other hand, he investigates the more progressive Gothic elements of St. John's Church in association with contemporary developments in Anglican ecclesiastical architecture in the Kingston region. And, in light of stylistic and liturgical correctness, along with the requirement for more space, he explores the 1863-1864 enlargement of the church with the extension of the nave to the east and the construction of transepts and a new chancel.

I also deal with Anglican church design of the same time period in New Brunswick and specifically with Christ Church, Maugerville (NB). Like Christianson, I consider the influence of the Cambridge Camden Society on the appearance of the church, which in this case was strongly promoted by John Medley, who became Bishop of Fredericton in 1845. Medley was founder of the Exeter Diocesan Architectural Society, which was in essence the southwest England branch of the Camden Society. Dedicated as he was to ecclesiological propriety for churches

constructed in his diocese, he was particularly keen to oversee the process of wooden church design in relation to English sources. I argue that the design of Christ Church, Maugerville, was probably a team effort based on drawings by the London-based architect William Butterfield for Fredericton Cathedral, which were reworked by Bishop Medley and his architect, Frank Wills.

Barry Magrill's "Open Timber Roofs: New Thoughts on Nineteenth-Century Architectural Literature" complements the previous two papers with an investigation of open timber roofs in western Canadian churches from a practical point of view. He indicates that publications like Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon's *Open Timber Roofs of the Middle Ages* (1847) provide the vehicle for the transmission of Gothic roof designs to western Canada.

Jessica Mace's "Beautifying the Countryside: Rural and Vernacular Gothic in Late Nineteenth-Century Ontario" considers rural and vernacular in housing in late nineteenth-century Ontario. Here there is no obsession with the "correctness" of Gothic detail, but the matter of the dissemination of house designs is an essential aspect of the architectural press. Mace's paper focuses on designs by "Mr. Smith, a successful and rising Architect of Toronto"—alias James A. Smith (1832–1918), later of the successful Toronto-based firm of Smith and Gemmell—published in *The Canada Farmer* in 1864. This bi-weekly journal, delivered to post offices free of charge with a subscription of one dollar for the year, included a regular column on the topic of rural architecture. Smith's work is seen against background of English and American architectural pattern books, and the impact of his designs is illustrated with reference to houses in southern Ontario.

"The Canadian Churches of Stephen C. Earle," by Peter Coffman, explores the English Gothic background for Anglican wooden church commissions in Nova Scotia and Newfoundland as translated by American architect Stephen Earle. The paper complements Magrill's, McKendry's, and my own articles on the dissemination of designs, and provides interesting insights into the cultural meaning of Gothic in nineteenth-century Atlantic Canada ideas.

Candace Iron focuses on the Roman Catholic commissions of prolific Toronto architect Henry Langley (1836–1907). In the vast majority of his church designs Langley follows the *True Principles* of the Gothic Revival advocated by Augustus Welby Pugin (1812–1852), which he learned during his apprenticeship in Toronto with William Hay. Yet for his Roman Catholic churches, reference to Cardinal Charles Borromeo's *Instructiones Fabricae et Supellectilis Ecclesasticae* is of fundamental importance, something that has been largely overlooked in studies of Roman Catholic Gothic churches in Canada. More commonly known as *The Instructiones*, this document was drafted in 1577, fourteen years after the Council of Trent (1545–1563), as a summation of the Catholic Church's traditions pertaining to the design of churches. Essentially, Borromeo applied the Tridentine Creed, the decrees of the Council, to architecture and concomitantly codified the canons of Catholic Church building. The *Instructiones* was released and republished with very few revisions at least nineteen times between the years of 1577 and 1952.

Jennifer McKendry investigates various applications of Gothic in the 1864 and 1886 designs of Queen Street Methodist (now United) Church in Kingston, Ontario. Reference is made to Frederick J. Jobson's 1850 publication, *Chapel and School*

Architecture, as Appropriate to the Buildings of Nonconformists, particularly to Those of the Wesleyan Methodists: with Practical Directions for the Erection of Chapels and School-Houses. Jobson's text advocates the application of Pugin's principles to Methodist church architecture, and, as McKendry puts it, he provides instructions on "how to build Methodist churches." She gives us a careful analysis of the 1864 fabric and the expansion of the church in 1884 by Kingston architect John Power, in the context of enlargement of Methodist churches in the last quarter of the nineteenth century. With the destruction by of the recently remodeled church in January 1886, Sidney Rose Badgley (1850–1917) was appointed to design a new church. Badgley was born in Ontario, trained with Richard Windeyer in Toronto, but established his practice in Cleveland, Ohio. As McKendry points out, Badgley designed a number of churches in Canada, as well as in the United States, and "he has quite revolutionized modern church architecture"—possibly through self-promotion! It is against this background that she provides an exemplary study of Badgley's Queen Street church.

Kristie Dubé explores two early twentieth-century rural churches in Saskatchewan, Kaposvar Roman Catholic Church and Bekovar Presbyterian Church. She investigates Belgian and Hungarian analogues respectively in association with the ethnic origins of the patrons.

MALCOLM THURLBY,
York University