

J. C. Gray

EMPTINESS AND FULFILLMENT AS STRUCTURAL

PATTERN IN *PARADISE LOST*

The dramatic action of *Paradise Lost* begins at the end of an expulsion scene and ends at the beginning of an expulsion scene. Satan and crew have just completed their physical fall of nine days' duration through space; Adam and Eve are just beginning to descend to the subjected plain. Of course, the beginning and the ending actions of the poem stretch much further backward and forward than do these two physical and spiritual events. The earliest action in the poem is God's proclaiming of the Son, and the latest action looks forward to a time when God shall be All in All. The dynamics of the poem, both the foreground drama of Satan's and man's falls and the background of the entire Christian drama of creation, fall, redemption, judgment and restoration occur between the two nodal points of equilibrium represented by the earliest and latest events in the remote past and remote future. These points represent both original and restored divine and cosmic equilibrium.

The second equilibrium will not be a *status quo ante*; rather there will be a return to obedience and to standing steadfast on the pillars of eternity. There will be a fulfillment of a great drama with its numberless occasions and opportunities and promises gained and lost, culminating in a temporal, spatial, and cosmic catharsis. Mankind will be "Wak't in the renovation of the just" (XI, 65) after his life is "Tri'd in sharp tribulation, and refin'd/By Faith and faithful works, to second Life" (XI, 63-64).¹

Among the poetic strategies Milton uses to increase dramatic tension as his epic moves from the original to the restored points of equilibrium is

his frequent metaphorical conception of persons and places not only as containers but as containers that are in process of being filled and emptied. For example, when God instructs Michael to evict Adam and Eve from Paradise he issues instructions that a "Cherubic watch" be mounted "Lest Paradise a receptacle prove/To Spirits foul" (XI, 123-124). More often, Milton employs the more dynamic metaphors of containers filling and emptying. 'The moon, for example, with borrowed light "Hence fills and empties to enlighten the Earth" (III, 731). What the containers are filling with or being emptied of and how the processes are occurring become indicators of certain actions and conditions of the person or place being described. In fact, as one examines Milton's uses of these metaphors, one can observe an important structural pattern emerging which reinforces other structural and image patterns in the poem² and which leads to the recognition of Milton's parallel conception of the divine Word also as an emptying and filling container.

Milton's frequent conception of place and person as containers probably arises, in part, from the Genesis account of creation as a two-fold process. Prior to creation, "the earth was without form and void". God's creative actions have two steps: first, the void is bounded, and second, it is filled. A finitude is selected from infinity, and then it is realized; that is, it is given shape, colour, and abundance of detailed variety and content. Spenser in *Colin Clout's Come Home Again* treats creation similarly:

Through him [Love] the cold began to couet heat,
And water fire: the light to mount on hie,
And th'heavie downe to peize; the hungry to eat
And voydness to seek, full satietie (ll. 847-50).³

God creates and completes so that each part of his creation is as full as it can be, an idea that Pope repeatedly stresses in his *Essay on Man*: God "fills, he bounds, connects, and equals all" (I, 280).⁴ God leaves no void or vacancy, no imperfection in his works: "For it pleased the Father that in him should all fullness dwell" (Col 1:19). When one part of creation attempts to occupy a sphere other than its own, such disobedience, in Pope's words, "in the full creation leave[s] a void" (*Essay on Man*, I, 243). Although Milton stands to one side of the seventeenth-century debates and discussions on the doctrine of plenitude in that he does not insist that the universe is as full as the creating goodness of God demands that it can be,⁵ his conception of infinity is that it is full of God—"I am who fill/Infinitude" (VII, 168-9)—if not of his created works. And space is not vacuous, despite the fact, paradoxically, that God remains uncircumscribed.

Within the created universe, everything, every place and every person, is circumscribed. Because a thing is created, it must perforce be bounded and filled. Thus, little effort is required to conceive of such created things as persons and places as containers. In Milton's account of creation the divine agencies of creation having initially demarcated the site—"This be thy just Circumference, O World" (VII, 329)—commence the process of completion until the site is replete and has full satiety. The embryonic Earth is formed "Sate with genial moisture" (VII, 282). Once the waters recede, the Earth, at first, is "desert and bare, unsightly, unadorn'd" and then it is filled. The tender grass appears; then creation ascends to herbs, flowers, clustering vine and smelling gourd, rises to the bush, the stately trees hung with copious fruit, rising further to the high woods, till "earth now/Seem'd like to Heav'n, a seat⁶ where Gods might dwell" (VII, 328-9).

The sun is created and filled, "made porous to receive/And drink the liquid light" (VII, 361-2). Once the earth is replete with vegetable life, the three lower elements are endowed with abundant animal life:

Air, Water, Earth,
By Fowl, Fish, Beast, was flown, was swum, was walkt
Frequent (VII, 502-4).

Within the created earth, in addition to the spheres, there is a series of places contained within each other: Eden, Paradise, and Adam and Eve's bower. As originally created, each is a definitely bounded place and each is filled with enormous bliss and joy and love.

Outside of the created universe there are at least three other bounded places, and there is chaos, which inasmuch as it is uncreated and unbounded is, strictly speaking, not a place. Immediately outside the *primum mobile* is the Paradise of Fools, a fiction "too ludicrous for its place" in Dr. Johnson's opinion. Like Hell, the Paradise of Fools is an "ill Mansion" prepared in advance by omniscient Providence.⁷ Whereas Hell is just starting to fill as the poem opens, the Paradise of Fools will not begin to fill until human history begins. All who will fill the Paradise of Fools are those whose works on earth will be filled with vanity. (Here it should be noted that Milton frequently uses *vain* as a direct translation of the Latin *vanus*, empty. Satan, Hell, and the works of the damned are filled with vanity in the double sense of pride and emptiness). The fiend walks the Paradise of Fools alone for no other creature is yet there:

None yet, but store hereafter from the earth
 Up hither like Aereal vapors flew
 Of all things transitory and vain, when Sin
 With vanity had fill'd the works of men:
 Both all things vain and all who in vain things
 Built thir fond hopes of Glory or lasting fame,
 Or happiness in this or th'other life;
 All who have thir reward on Earth, the fruits
 Of painful Supersition and blind Zeal,
 Naught seeking but the praise of men, here find
 Fit retribution, empty as thir deeds (III, 444-454).

Heaven, of course, is also bounded,⁸ although Milton is silent about its creation and purposefully ambiguous about the exact shape of the boundaries of Heaven, "undetermin'd square or round" (II, 1048). Critics of the Big-Endian persuasion hold that Milton's Heaven is round and critics of the Little-Endian persuasion hold that it is square.⁹ Important here is the point that Heaven is a bounded and fulfilled site, "the seat of bliss" (VI, 273) replete with the variety that Earth has from Heaven (VI, 640-1). The poise of Heaven is disturbed when the "seated hills" are rooted up, and a vacancy occurs when the rebellious host is expelled. Milton follows the popular tradition that the race of man was created to repopulate Heaven, the tradition that Spenser alludes to in *An Hymne of Heavenly Love*:

But that eternal fount of loue and grace,
 Still flowing forth his goodnesse vnto all,
 Now seeing left a waste and emptie place
 In his wyde Pallace, through those Angels fall
 Cast to supply the same, and to enstall
 A new vnknown Colony therein,
 Whose root from earths base groundworke should begin (II. 96-105).

C. A. Patrides carefully points out that the repopulation theory is not the "capital reason for God's creation of the universe. The capital reason was, both for Milton and for Christian tradition, the dissemination of divine goodness".¹⁰ Tasso, in *Gerusalemme Liberata* uses the repopulation theory to explain Satan's contempt for man on the grounds

That sinful creature man elected is,
 And in our place the heavens possess he must,
 Vile man! begot of clay and born of Dust (Fairfax trans., IV, X).

Milton's Satan is not quite so certain of God's motives in creation, but he does tell Sin and Death of "A race of upstart Creatures, to supply/Perhaps our vacant room" (II, 834-5).

Hell, unlike earlier conceptions of it, is placed well outside the created universe in *Paradise Lost* and was apparently created almost simultaneously with the universe. It is a negative place in that as place it is created and bound, but it is filled wholly with negations. It is described as the "seat of desolation" (I, 181), and it is filled with emptiness;¹¹ it is void of light, of hope, of joy, of peace and rest, and it is filled with darkness visible, despair, pain, and woe. It has begun to fill with the fallen angels as the poem opens, but it will not be sated until the Second Coming, and then, as God announces in Book III: "Hell, her numbers full,/Thenceforth shall be for ever shut".

When a void upsets cosmic and spiritual equilibrium in *Paradise Lost*, there must be, sooner or later, additional creative acts to reestablish equilibrium. Through the permissive will of God and Milton's theodicy, evil can be brought from good, and through the active will of God, good can once again be brought from ill. Metaphorically, that which is filled can be empty (partially or wholly), and that which is empty (partially or wholly) can be eventually refilled. Milton clearly seems to follow, as C. S. Lewis stresses, the Augustinian notion that evil is the privation of good, a notion that occurs often in the theoretical discussion of the doctrine of plenitude. But Milton does not see privation as a necessary corollary of creation. All that is created in its pristine, prelapsarian goodness in *Paradise Lost* is wholly good, replete and fulfilled. A near exception is Hell, "Created evil", but "for evil only good" (II, 623), and Hell is evil in that it is a place of privation only, wholly empty of goodness and ironically filled with emptiness. If there is a partial void in Heaven, then one might logically conclude that some sort of ill exists in Heaven once the Satanic host is exiled. Milton seems to recognize this problem and deals with it briefly. God announces that

I can repair
That detriment, if such it be to lose
Self-lost (VII, 152-154).

God will bring "a better race" into the "vacant room" of the malign spirits (VII, 186). The void in Heaven is created not by the absence of good but by the absence of ill, of "Spirits malign", and the void will be resupplied with good. If we allow the void in Heaven to mean that evil exists in Heaven after the expulsion of the rebels, we encounter intolerable heresies.

There is one other location to consider in *Paradise Lost*—Chaos. It is a locale in the poem, but because it is not created, it is non-place, nowhere, utopia. Chaos is

a dark

Illimitable Ocean without bound,
Without dimension, where length, breadth, and highth,
And time and place are lost. (II, 891-4).

It is uncreated, potential matter, *prima materia*, and it is therefore empty, but empty in a way different from the ironic emptiness of Hell. Chaos is empty because it has not yet been filled through the two-fold creative process. It is empty of God's goodness, not because goodness has been emptied from it through the transgression of boundaries, but because God has not yet extended His goodness (and therefore boundaries and repletion) to it. Chaos is a "vast vacuity", a "void profound/Of unessential Night . . . Wide gaping".¹²

But there can be no absolute vacuums in Milton's universe. Everything is filled with something, even if it is filled with emptiness, or filled with nothing in the sense that nothing is potentially something. Thus in describing a dimensionless, directionless, timeless non-place that is somehow vast,¹³ Milton must resort to oxymoron. *Abyss*, of course, literally means *bottomless*, yet Chaos is "the vast immeasurable Abyss", is "Up from the bottom turned by furious winds" (VII, 211, 213). The main point about Chaos is, I believe, that it is empty in the sense that it is "empty of the substantial form" as Milton paraphrases Aristotle in describing first matter.¹⁴ Professor Jackson Cope notes that "there is a consistent connotative antithesis throughout the poem between circumscription and spaciousness".¹⁵ But spaciousness, at least in one sense, is not necessarily antithetical to circumscription. God is unbounded and Chaos is unbounded. Hell is bounded and Paradise is bounded, yet Hell is spacious compared to Paradise. There is in Paradise "To all delight of human sense expos'd/In narrow room Nature's whole wealth" (IV, 206-7). All is contained in little. But to the unimaginative Satan, that which is bigger is better; he cannot learn what Tellus learns at the conclusion of Lyly's *Endymion*: "for stars to their bigness have their lights, and the sun hath no more, and little pitchers, when they can hold no more, are as full as great vessels that run over" (V, iii, 198-202).¹⁶ Contemplating the Fall of Man, Satan soliloquizes:

Hell shall unfold,
To entertain you two, her widest Gates,

And send forth all her Kings; there will be room,
Not like these narrow limits (IV, 381-4).

Hell, circumscribed and large, is empty. Chaos, uncircumscribed, yet vast, is empty. Heaven, circumscribed and "extended wide/In circuit" (II, 1047-8), is full. Second Eden will be circumscribed, too, and larger than the first:

for then the Earth
Shall all be Paradise, far happier place
Than this of Eden. (XII, 463-5)

Thus I cannot fully accept Professor Cope's distinction between circumscription and spaciousness.¹⁷ Hamlet could be bounded in a nutshell and count himself God of infinite space if he didn't have bad dreams, and Ferdinand in *The Tempest* asserts: "Space enough have I in such a prison". The quality of the restriction or circumscription depends on state of mind. Rather the antithesis seems to be between fulfillment and vacancy. The key question is whether or not the container is full or wholly or partially empty, filling or emptying, not how spacious it is.

Person may also be conceived as a vessel that fills and empties. A created entity, person is bounded and then filled or emptied. Also within the poem certain persons are closely associated with certain sites: God and the Son with Heaven, Adam and Eve with Paradise, and Satan, of course, with Hell. The physical descriptions of the various places in the poem frequently suggest the psychical condition of the characters there located. When Satan "views/The dismal situation", he is surveying his fallen condition as well as his new location. Hell is Satan's state of mind as well as a locale in the poem. Similarly, as Frye points out, "Paradise is internalized, transformed from an outward place to an inner state of mind".¹⁸ Satan addresses Hell and commands it to "Receive thy new Possessor" (I, 252), but, in fact, the opposite is true. Hell contains Satan, but as Satan admits, which way he flies is Hell, and the Hell that he contains even when geographically absent from Hell indicates that Hell always possesses him.

Another emphatic use of the metaphorical equation of person with place occurs in Eve's final speech to Adam:

. . . but now lead on;
In mee is no delay; with thee to go
Is to stay here; without thee here to stay,
Is to go hence unwilling; thou to mee

Art all things under Heav'n, all places thou (XII, 614-8).

Although Satan's assertion that the mind is its own place has been challenged as a heresy and another of his lies, no one so far as I know, has indicated that Eve may be committing heresy in equating Adam with all things and all places under heaven. Chambers has suggested that Satan's insistence on mind as place unaffected by time and place indicates Satan's inability to accept what he cannot escape—the ultimate placing of himself by God.¹⁹ Eve qualifies her assertion with the key phrase "under Heav'n", and if we read the qualification properly, then Eve is not attempting to use mind as a substitute for spirit and to expel God from her hierarchy of values. Rather the speech may be read to indicate a turning back to the prelapsarian hierarchy: "Hee for God only, shee for God in him" (IV, 299).

Person as container becomes conflated with alimentary metaphors when Adam is discoursing with Raphael and later Michael. Filling with food and drink is a dynamic process but a bit too homely to carry the ideas of spiritual filling and emptying. Milton does not place that kind of pressure on the metaphor in these two instances. Alimentary filling, if too indecorous to carry spiritual analogies, can be used to carry mental ones. Raphael's words to Adam "bring to thir sweetness no satiety" (VIII, 216). A little knowledge begets the appetite for more knowledge, and Adam realizes this when, using alimentary metaphors, he tells Raphael that

Knowledge is as food, and needs no less
Her Temperance over Appetite, to know
In measure what the mind may well contain (VII, 126-128).

After a certain amount of dramatic suspense, Adam is filled, at least temporarily, with sufficient knowledge. Adam thanks Raphael for his expounding of the doctrine that earthly wisdom is to be lowly wise, and he thanks the archangel: "How fully hast thou satisfi'd me" (VIII, 180). To seek knowledge of the infinite, beyond the bounds of what the container can contain "is fume,/Or emptiness, or fond impertinence" (VIII, 194-5). And, Adam, might have added, impossible, since the finite cannot contain the infinite.

Earlier in the poem, God had bade Adam and Eve to enjoy

Your fill what happiness this happy state
Can comprehend, incapable of more (V, 503-5).

In gorging themselves on the forbidden fruit Adam and Eve forgot what God and Raphael had told them, and physically, mentally, and spiritually leap over all boundaries. Neutrally, to be satiated is to be filled, to hold as much as can be or ought to be contained. But in a pejorative, "fallen" sense, to be satiated is to be glutted, to contain more than ought to be contained. For place or person to be sated as originally created is to be temperate, virtuous, free, obedient, and happy. To want more than enough, to want all, is to overleap all rational and temperate bounds and thus to participate in the demonic condition. Adam must be reinstructed through the visions and narration of Books XI and XII. When Michael finishes, Adam represents himself as a filled container:

Greatly instructed I shall hence depart,
Greatly in peace of thought, and have my fill
Of knowledge, what this Vessel can contain;
Beyond which was my folly to aspire (XII, 557-60).

The transgression of Adam and Eve ironically makes possible the fulfillment of a promise that Satan had made to his son (and grandson) Death. Satan has promised Paradise to Sin and Death, and when he bids Death enjoy the fruits of Paradise, he refuses to recognize capacity. His invitation to be fed and filled never moves beyond the physical. It has no metaphorical force at all. Because the reader has so often observed the idea of filling in metaphorical contexts when ideas of mental and spiritual filling are richly suggested, the ironic emptiness of any metaphorical content is startling:

. . . dwell at ease, and up and down unseen
Wing silently the buxom Air, imbalm'd
With odors; there ye shall be fed and fill'd
Immeasurably, all things shall be your prey (II, 840).

Once Adam and Eve have eaten of Death, Death can eat of them.²⁰ Satan returns to Hell and stands expectantly awaiting the demons' "Universal shout and high applause/To fill his ear" (X, 505-6). Instead, he and the others are metamorphosed into serpents and are stricken with compulsive appetites for the fair fruit that grows upon a grove of trees. They cannot but eat, yet the fruit of their victory turns to ashes in their mouths. They remain eternally unfulfilled, eternally beset by insatiable hatred and the insatiable appetite for revenge.

Thus far we have seen that with some consistency, Milton metaphorically conceives of place and person as containers, created, bounded, and filled

copiously but within measure, and emptied if they are filled beyond measure or capacity. God creates by bounding and fulfilling; Satan destroys by violating boundaries and emptying. But Milton extends the container metaphor with even richer variation by applying it to the Divine Word. The Word as container also fills and empties but with meanings somewhat different from those employed in describing person and place.

Christ, as the creating, omnific Word, bounds and fills, especially in Books VII and VIII. But the Word of God is also a kind of container, bound by itself and to be fulfilled by the deed. What God says he will perform, he does perform, usually through the agency of the Son. In part, the relationship between the Father and the Son is that between conception and execution. Everything conceived by the Father is executed by the Son from the earliest action of the poem, the proclamation of the Son as Messiah, to Final Judgment and the joining of the faithful with the Father through the Son (VI, 723-33).

In contrast, Satan speaks empty words; he vaunts and boasts, verbs connoting emptiness. Satan himself recognizes that if he could recant and take vows of obedience to God, they would be only "Vows made in pain, as violent and void" (IV, 96-97). He promises fulfillment for the appetites of Sin and Death; ironically, Satan's promises will be fulfilled since eventually Sin and Death are to consume themselves. Satan promises that personified oxymoron, the Umpire Chaos, that he will win back some of Chaos' dominion, a promise he never fulfills. He can partially lay waste and partially empty God's creation of goodness, but he can never return it to the condition of *prima materia*, for the boundaries still exist. In *Of Christian Doctrine*, Milton expresses the view that he had earlier defended in a Cambridge Prolusion, that "no created thing can be finally annihilated".²¹ Satan also promises regained liberty to his followers, and they think that their ability to move from Hell up to Earth is liberty, confusing ability to move about in outer space with ability to move about in inner space which is true liberty.

Satan uses vain words when he raises "Vain hopes, vain aims, inordinate desires" (IV, 808) in Eve during her dream, and of course, he directly lies to Eve about his eating of the fruit and about the veil that will be lifted from her eyes when she eats of the fruit. Instead, a veil descends. He uses words to induce Eve to disbelieve the words of God; he uses words in a marvellous tangle of false logic, offering his followers the false choice of "Awake, arise, or be forever fall'n" (I, 330). In contrast to Christ, the Divine Logos, Satan is the empty, vain, perverted logos.

In Book XII, the eventual restoration of equilibrium is foretold. Michael tells Adam that eventually the original Eden will be washed away in the Flood, stressing the point that locale is not so important as condition. Satan really has no metaphorical imagination and takes place to mean specific locality, as he makes clear when he boasts that he will be punished only by "local wounds". But Michael makes it clear to Adam that one should not be a literalist of the imagination in taking the phrase at face value.

Adam and Eve also learn that God is as good as His word, that Divine Justice must be satisfied when the law is transgressed. Michael reinforces what Raphael had earlier told Adam, that Eve's fruitful womb (V, 388), that is the seed of man, will eventually fill the earth. Michael both shows and tells Adam what will be will be, pointing out that Divine Love and Divine Justice will be reconciled and that the fulfillment of the Word as flesh opens the way to mankind to regain Paradise. For the Word to become flesh, the Son must empty himself of his Godhead in the theological process known as kenosis, literally an emptying. But this emptying is a fulfillment, the central fulfillment of Christianity and of history from a Christian viewpoint. Milton is specific about the process in "Upon the Circumcision":

Just law indeed, but more exceeding love.
 For we by rightful doom remediless
 Were lost in death, till he that dwelt above
 High-thron'd in secret bliss, for us frail dust
 Emptied his glory, ev'n to nakedness;
 And that great Cov'nant which we still transgress
 Entirely satisfied.

At the end of Book XI, God looks down and sees "The whole Earth fill'd with violence". Book XII ends with the vision of the fulfillment of man's destiny, the fulfillment of God's covenants, and the fulfillment of the Word as flesh. Once human history is completed, death, corruption, and fraud will be emptied from the earth, and God shall be All in All. All this will come about when the second Adam, through obedience and love, will supply the vacancy created through the disobedience and willfulness of the first Adam. God says to the Son: "Be thou in *Adam's* room/The Head of all mankind, though *Adam's* son" (III, 285-6). The sacrifice of Christ, undertaken from boundless love, will fulfill that which Adam and Eve did want:

Obedience to the Law of God, impos'd
 On penalty of death, and suffering death,

The penalty to thy transgression due,
 And due to theirs which out of thine will grow:
 So only can high Justice rest appaid.
 The Law of God exact he shall fulfil
 Both by obedience and by love, through love
 Alone fulfil the Law (XII, 397-404).

Paradise Lost opens with the results of the violation of the Divine Equilibrium: Heaven is being emptied; Hell is being filled. Then at the centre of the poem, God creates the pendant universe, bounded, filled, complete, and perfect. Through man's disobedience, the equilibrium is disturbed once again; Eden is emptied and Adam and Eve are emptied of innocence and original bliss. But they are not dismissed disconsolate, and sadly, but filled with hope and repentance; they leave the garden with wandering steps and slow to begin the long process of human history where eventual fulfillment is again made available through Divine Love that empties itself of glory, even unto nakedness, in order that mankind can eventually be filled with that Paradise within, happier far. The poem moves from emptiness, to fulfillment, to a second emptiness, to the hope and vision and promise of a second fulfillment. The structural limits of *Paradise Lost* have been drawn; the poem has been filled with copious detail and variety, and the epic comes to a close as man's voyage through history begins.

NOTES

1. *John Milton: Complete Poem and Major Prose*, ed. Merritt Y. Hughes (New York, 1957). All line references to Milton's poetry are to this edition and are cited in the text.
2. Such other patterns are the mythic patterns of exile, wandering, and return studied by Isabel MacCaffery in *Paradise Lost as 'Myth'* (Cambridge, Mass., 1959); the relationships between the patterns of light and dark and those of ascent and descent studied by D. C. Allen in "Milton and the Descent to Light", *Milton Studies in Honor of Harris Francis Fletcher* (Urbana, 1961), pp. 6-22; and the image patterns of flowers, fruit, and seeds studied by Joseph Summers, *The Muse's Method: An Introduction to Paradise Lost* (Cambridge, Mass., 1962). In various ways the cited patterns poetically embody Milton's themes of obedience and disobedience, of creation and destruction, of innocence and knowledge, and of evil growing out of good and good out of evil.
3. *The Poetical Works of Edmund Spenser*, eds. J. C. Smith and E. de Selincourt (Oxford, 1912). All line references are to this edition and are cited in the text.
4. *Alexander Pope: Selected Poetry and Prose*, ed. W. K. Wimsatt, Jr. (New York, 1951).
5. A. O. Lovejoy, *The Great Chain of Being* (New York, 1961), pp. 161-5.

6. Several times in the poem, the word *seat* seems to carry the secondary meaning of *condition*: Heaven is "the seat of bliss" (VI, 273) and Hell is the "The seat of desolation" (I, 181). Compare also the passage at II, 393-4: "Will once more lift us up, in spite of Fate,/Nearer our ancient Scat". It is interesting to note the possibility of rhyme in this latter passage if one uses the older, conservative pronunciation of *seat* as *sate*. Both Spenser and Milton have instances of *seat* as a rhyme for *great*. See Helge Kokeritz, *Shakespeare's Pronunciation* (New Haven, 1953), p. 198. There are also interesting possibilities for rhyme in the poem's closing lines (XII, 642-3) among *late*, *seat*, and *gate*. For the occasional use of rhyme in *Paradise Lost*, see Frank Kermode's essay, "Adam Unparadised", in *The Living Milton: Essays by Diverse Hands*, ed. Frank Kermode (London, 1960), pp. 94-9.
7. The phrases "unhappy Mansion" (I, 268) and "ill Mansion" (II, 462) as well as the line "Such place Eternal Justice had prepar'd" (I, 70) seem to echo John 14:2.
8. Although both Heaven and Hell are bounded and although both seem to have an optimum population, certainly they are not finite as are places within the primum mobile. Heaven and Hell can be bounded, yet extend infinitely high or infinitely low. Wylie Sypher points out the baroque technique of closure and then of expansion into space, *Four Stages of Renaissance Style* (Garden City, N.Y., 1955), p. 212. Roy Daniells makes the point that lateral space is relatively unimportant in Milton's Heaven and Hell and that "To the upward dimension of heaven we can feel no limit because the central mount, which is the throne of God, totally absorbs all speculation, all imagination, all aspiration", *Milton, Mannerism and Baroque* (Toronto, 1963), pp. 88-9.
9. Walter Clyde Curry in Milton's *Ontology, Cosmogony, and Physics* (Lexington, 1957) argues that Heaven is circular. As an adjunct to his working out of symbolic direction in *Paradise Lost*, H. F. Robins in "Satan's Journey: Direction in *Paradise Lost*", *Milton Studies in Honor of Harris Francis Fletcher* (Urbana, 1961), 91-103, argues that Heaven is square.
10. *Milton and the Christian Tradition* (Oxford, 1966), p. 38.
11. In *A Defense of the English People*, Milton uses this oxymoron: "... your desks chock-full of emptiness", Columbia University edition of *The Works of John Milton*, VII, 403. (Hereinafter cited as *Columbia Works*.)
12. The literal Greek meaning of Chaos is a yawning or a gaping; thus "wide gaping" is almost a direct translation. That which gapes is empty or hollow, and therefore connotes something ill. Chaos is "Devoid of sense and motion" (II, 151) and is also described as the "hollow dark" (II, 953). The same pejorative connotation plays over the military tactics employed by the Satanic host in Heaven; they attack "in hollow Cube" (VI, 552), and their artillery "With hideous orifice gap't on us wide,/Portending hollow truce" (VI, 576-7). The words of Belial are "false and hollow" (II, 112).
13. Eric Partridge in *Origins: The Encyclopedia of Words* (New York, 1968) traces the etymology of vastness: "ravaged or desolated, hence uncultivated, hence desert, hence very extensive, immense". Milton seems to use both the meanings of size and emptiness; that which is vast is immense and empty.
14. See Prolusion IV: "In the Destruction of Any Substance There can Be No Resolution into First Matter", *Columbia Works*, XII, 187.
15. *The Metaphoric Structure of Paradise Lost* (Baltimore, 1962), p. 58.

16. *English Drama, 1580-1642*, eds. C. F. T. Brooke and N. B. Paradise (New York, 1933).
17. I recognize that I am not using *spaciousness* exactly in the same sense as Professor Cope. For him, order is indicated by circumscription and "spaciousness is the natural milieu of disorder and evil" (p. 59). But I still have difficulties with the distinction since that which is circumscribed (Hell and Heaven) can be spacious and Hell is evil although highly ordered.
18. *Return of Eden* (Toronto: 1965), p. 110. Merritt Y. Hughes has investigated the tradition that metaphorically equates location and state of mind in "Myself am Hell", *MP*, 54 (1956), 80-95.
19. A. B. Chambers, "The Mind is its Own Place: *Paradise Lost*, I. 253-255", *Renaissance News*, 16 (1963), 101.
20. Milton is logically consistent in his concept of Death. Death can never be fulfilled because it is an uncreated thing with neither form nor substance. It is a "vast un-hide bound corpse" with a "shape" that is not really a shape and a "substance" that is really a shadow (II, 667-9). Death is a devouring force that is all appetite, a metaphor old as the Bible.
21. Book I, Chap. 7, *Columbia Works*, XV, 27.