

MAIDS, MEDIA, AND MIGRATION:  
FILIPINO NEWS MEDIA IN MONTRÉAL AND THE TRANSNATIONAL LIVES OF  
LIVE-IN CAREGIVERS

by

Shannon Kiely

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements  
for the degree of Master of Arts

at

Dalhousie University  
Halifax, Nova Scotia  
April 2011

© Copyright by Shannon Kiely, 2011

DALHOUSIE UNIVERSITY

DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

The undersigned hereby certify that they have read and recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies for acceptance a thesis entitled “MAIDS, MEDIA, AND MIGRATION: FILIPINO NEWS MEDIA IN MONTRÉAL AND THE TRANSNATIONAL LIVES OF LIVE-IN CAREGIVERS” by Shannon Kiely in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Dated: April 29, 2011

Supervisor: \_\_\_\_\_

Readers: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

DALHOUSIE UNIVERSITY

DATE: April 29, 2011

AUTHOR: Shannon Kiely

TITLE: MAIDS, MEDIA, AND MIGRATION: FILIPINO NEWS MEDIA IN  
MONTREAL AND THE TRANSNATIONAL LIVES OF LIVE-IN  
CAREGIVERS

DEPARTMENT OR SCHOOL: Department of International Development Studies

DEGREE: MA CONVOCATION: October YEAR: 2011

Permission is herewith granted to Dalhousie University to circulate and to have copied for non-commercial purposes, at its discretion, the above title upon the request of individuals or institutions. I understand that my thesis will be electronically available to the public.

The author reserves other publication rights, and neither the thesis nor extensive extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's written permission.

The author attests that permission has been obtained for the use of any copyrighted material appearing in the thesis (other than the brief excerpts requiring only proper acknowledgement in scholarly writing), and that all such use is clearly acknowledged.

---

Signature of Author

## **DEDICATION PAGE**

I would like to dedicate this thesis to PINAY president, Evelyn Calugay, whose unrelenting courage in fighting for caregiver rights in Canada and the compassionate support she extends to PINAY members were a constant source of inspiration while I produced my thesis.

I also dedicate this thesis to the nine live-in caregivers I interviewed in the hopes that my writing can contribute to their efforts to live their lives in security and dignity.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ABSTRACT.....</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED .....</b>	<b>x</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1 A NOTE ON TERMINOLOGY .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1.2 TRANSNATIONALISM AND MEDIA.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>1.3 THE LCP: BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>1.4 MEDIA AND MINORITIES IN MONTRÉAL .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>1.5 METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>1.6 MY SOCIAL LOCATION AS A RESEARCHER .....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>1.7 CHAPTER OUTLINE.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2 A MAP TO GLOBAL AND NATIONAL LCP GEOGRAPHIES.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>2.1 THE FEMINIZATION OF MIGRATION.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>2.2 THE LIVE-IN CAREGIVER PROGRAM IN CANADA.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>2.3 LIVING UNDER THE “NEW” LIVE-IN CAREGIVER PROGRAM .....</b>	<b>32</b>
2.3.1. The 24/36 Formula Becomes the 24/48 Formula .....	33
2.3.2. Travel and recruitment fees .....	37
2.3.3. Medical and Workers’ Compensation .....	38
2.3.4. Second Medical Exam Victory.....	39
<b>2.4 PINAY: THE FILIPINO WOMEN’S ORGANIZATION IN QUEBEC .....</b>	<b>41</b>
2.4.1 Dissident citizenship.....	42
2.4.2. Political activism .....	44

2.4.3. Social Activities .....	45
2.4.4 Support Services.....	47
2.4.5 Education.....	48
2.4.6 Recruitment.....	49
<b>2.5. PINOYVILLE: THE CÔTE-DES-NEIGES NEIGHBOURHOOD OF MONTRÉAL .....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>2.6 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>CHAPTER 3 READING AND WRITING FILIPINO NEWSPAPERS IN MONTRÉAL: TRANSNATIONALISM AND ELABORATED IDENTITIES.....</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>3.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>3.2 ACTIVE, CREATIVE AUDIENCES .....</b>	<b>58</b>
<b>3.3 THE NORTH AMERICAN FILIPINO STAR AND THE MONTREAL PINOY POST.....</b>	<b>60</b>
<b>3.4 MAINSTREAM MEDIA .....</b>	<b>62</b>
<b>3.5 FILIPINO NEWSPAPERS IN MONTRÉAL.....</b>	<b>66</b>
3.5.1 Transnational News.....	67
3.5.2 Elaborated Identities.....	69
3.5.3 Measuring the Power of Ethnic Media.....	71
3.5.4 Resistance and Empowerment through Filipino Media.....	73
3.5.5 (Mis)representation in Minority News.....	78
<b>3.6 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>84</b>
<b>CHAPTER 4 LIVE-IN CARE WORK: CONTOURS, RESISTANCE, AND ACQUIESCENCE.....</b>	<b>85</b>
<b>4.1 LIVING IN.....</b>	<b>85</b>
4.1.1 Walking the Private/Public Line .....	87
4.1.2 Overworked and Underpaid.....	89
4.1.4 Invisible LCP workers .....	91
4.1.5 Lack of Protection from the State.....	92
4.1.6 One-Way Adaptation .....	93

4.1.7 Food .....	95
<b>4.2 LCP WORKERS' RESISTANCE TO THE LIVE-IN REQUIREMENT .....</b>	<b>97</b>
4.2.1 Living Out .....	97
4.2.2 Varieties of Resistance .....	100
<b>4.3 MORE THAN A MAID: DESKILLING AND RECERTIFICATION .....</b>	<b>102</b>
4.3.1 Deskilling .....	102
4.3.2 Recertification .....	107
<b>4.4 REMITTANCES .....</b>	<b>108</b>
4.4.1 The Human Cost of Remittances .....	110
4.4.2 Remittances as Nation-Building .....	114
<b>4.5 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>114</b>
<b>CHAPTER 5 FEMINIST READINGS OF THE LIVE-IN CAREGIVER PROGRAM. 116</b>	
<b>5.1 FEMINISM/PEMINISM .....</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>5.2 INTERNATIONAL MARRIAGE.....</b>	<b>120</b>
<b>5.3 REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS .....</b>	<b>124</b>
<b>5.4 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>130</b>
<b>CHAPTER 6 NEWSPAPERS AND NANNIES: LCP WORKERS IN THE</b>	
<b>MAINSTREAM AND FILIPINO NEWS .....</b>	<b>132</b>
<b>6.1 "ALL FILIPINAS ARE NANNIES" .....</b>	<b>132</b>
6.1.2 News about Nannies .....	134
<b>6.2 NANNIES IN THE NEWS.....</b>	<b>138</b>
<b>6.3 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>140</b>
<b>CHAPTER 7 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>141</b>
<b>7.1 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY .....</b>	<b>148</b>
<b>7.2 AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>149</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>	<b>153</b>
<b>Appendix A Table of LCP Interviewees.....</b>	<b>163</b>

**APPENDIX B The first four pages of the August 2010 issue of the *North American Filipino Star* ..... 165**

***Appendix C* four cover pages of the *Montreal Pinoy Post*..... 169**

**APPENDIX D ‘Very Important Pinoy’ ad ..... 173**

**APPENDIX E A Holiday Dream Denied ..... 174**

**APPENDIX F Our Readers Rally for Nanny..... 176**



## **ABSTRACT**

This thesis explores the role of media in the lives of live-in caregivers in Montréal by looking at two Filipino newspapers and mainstream news coverage on Filipinas and the Philippines. While Filipino newspapers elaborate Filipino identity and speak back to stereotypes in mainstream news, their impact is curtailed by limited distribution and content range. Live-in caregivers in Montréal were selected as a special audience group through which to examine media representations of Filipinos because they are ‘othered’ through interlocking processes of gender and race. The live-in caregiver program (LCP), through which they migrate to Canada, lays bare the price that third world women immigrants are asked to pay for citizenship rights in Canada. LCP work is often underpaid, demeaning, and exploitative. Examining the lives and media habits of LCP workers ethnographically breaks new ground in studies of both domestic work and minorities and media in Canada.

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED

ACNA The Association of Caregiver & Nanny Agencies Canada

CDN Côte-des-Neiges

CEGEP *Collège d'enseignement général et professionnel* (General and Vocational College)

CIC Citizenship and Immigration Canada

CSST *La Commission de la santé et de la sécurité du travail du Québec* (The Quebec Commission of Workplace Health and Safety, also known as workers' compensation)

FAMAS The Filipino Association of Montréal and Suburbs

HRSDC Human Resource and Skills Development Canada

LCP Live-in Caregiver Program

LMO Labour Market Opinion

MICC *Ministère de l'Immigration et des Communautés culturelles* (the Ministry of immigration and Cultural Communities)

OHIP Ontario Health Insurance Plan

PAF *Le Programme d'aides familiales résidentes en provenance de l'étranger* (LCP in Quebec)

POEA The Philippines Overseas Employment Administration

*Post* *The Montreal Pinoy Post*

TFW Temporary foreign worker

*Star* *The North American Filipino Star*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis came to be largely through the warm welcome I received from PINAY Quebec, a Filipina women's organization in Montréal whose membership is mainly composed of live-in caregivers. PINAY president Evelyn Calugay opened the door for me to glimpse the lives of Filipina caregivers in Montréal by referring me to women interested in being interviewed. It was through PINAY's numerous social gatherings, political protests, accompaniment services, and lobby meetings that I came to better understand the hopes and dreams, challenges and victories of live-in caregivers in Montréal. I am grateful to Evelyn and all PINAY members for their open hearts and their eagerness to see the fruits of collaborating with me.

I learned an immense amount from the live-in caregivers I interviewed, and my thesis aims to represent the stories I collected of triumph, heartache, and the search for dignity as a live-in caregiver in Montréal. I thank also Zenaida Kharroubi, Ate Len, Veraida Bermejo, and Cate Obias for sharing with me their insights about Filipino print and mainstream media in Montréal.

My supervisor, Dr. Pauline Gardiner Barber, has seen this project develop from its very beginnings to its very end. Her enthusiasm about the topic I chose to research and support of the conclusions I began to draw motivated and comforted me throughout the thesis-writing process. In our meetings, she helped me to refine my thinking about the topic, to find the right questions to ask, and to produce the best thesis I could. I thank Dr. Gardiner Barber for instilling in me the type of curiosity necessary for field research and the type of insight essential to ethnographic writing.

I was fortunate to receive funding for my project from the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada in the form of a one-year masters SSHRC grant. I thank the Government of Canada for its support of my research.

My thanks to Ian Martin for his love and support. Discussions of LCP work often took place over our dinner table and I am grateful for the productive thoughts these generated.

Thank you also to Marie Yvonne and Martin Kiely for extending their loving and generous parental support throughout this process.

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

Women from the Philippines have long left their families at home to make the journey to Canada as migrant domestic workers. The migrations of Filipina domestic workers, which instigate a chain of subsequent migration journeys for husbands and children through eventual family reunification, are part of the reason that the Philippines has recently eclipsed China and India as the number one source country for immigrants to Canada (Friesen 2011).

Migrant domestic workers are recruited for entry into Canada through a federal immigration stream called the Live-in Caregiver Program (LCP). This thesis examines the types of representations of Filipina LCP workers in mainstream news and Filipino newspapers against the backdrop of ethnographic data about their daily-lived realities. The process of bringing two bodies of academic research – minorities in the media and feminists readings of live-in care work – into dialogue with one another breaks new ground in both areas.

This project has entailed a constant process of combining two elements of inquiry, the LCP and newspapers, which have not yet been researched in tandem at length in academic writing. What does a federal immigration program that offers Filipina migrant workers a chance at permanent residency in Canada in exchange for the completion of 24 months of live-in care work elucidate about immigrant media? By the same token, what can Filipino newspapers and mainstream news in Montréal teach us about citizenship debates surrounding the LCP?

Eight months of fieldwork on live-in caregivers in Montréal and media is analyzed here to address a gap in the literature to date on LCP workers' media use. The body of literature on the LCP and its design as a racist and anti-woman program is put in dialogue with my fieldwork on the daily realities of live-in care work in order to add nuance and to explore the ambiguities that inevitably flow from individual experience. I advance citizenship debates around the LCP by examining the portrayal of LCP workers in both Canadian mainstream and Filipino ethnic media and the reading of this portrayal by the nine women I interviewed.

My project looks at how a special audience group – LCP workers – reads news, writes news, and is written about in the mainstream and Filipino newspapers. The selection of a smaller contingent of people – itself heterogeneous – mirrors the heterogeneity in the “Filipino community” in Montréal. Structuring my research around a special audience group, LCP workers, fills a gap in Canadian research about media and minorities in Canada, which has too often tended to homogenize minority groups (Mahtani 2001). My methodology was inspired by Yu Shi's (2009) study of the role of Chinese-language newspapers in the lives of working class Chinese women in the San Francisco Bay area. Shi was interested in this special audience group because they were a racialized and gendered ‘other’ both within San Francisco at large and within the Chinese diaspora. LCP workers are an important media audience group to study for similar reasons. Domestic workers' seclusion in private homes and the stigma attached to their work marginalizes them in Montréal and within the Montréal Filipino community.

My guiding research question is, *what is the role of media in the lives of Filipina live-in caregivers in Montréal?* Montréal was an ideal setting to look at Filipino media because

three English-language Filipino newspapers are produced monthly or bi-weekly in the city. Migration of women through the LCP to Montréal has initiated the growth of a vibrant Filipino “community” in the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood of Montréal (a small portion of which is known as “PinoyVille,<sup>1</sup>) through family sponsorship. I have both an “insider” and “outsider” perspective on my field site. My upbringing in Montréal made me familiar with the social, cultural, and political geography of the city. This perspective was balanced by my position as an “outsider” in the urban routes LCP workers circulated within and the sites of their settlement as I have never lived in Côte-des-Neiges and was relatively unfamiliar with the neighbourhood before I started my fieldwork.

Immigration debates in Quebec take on a shape distinct from the rest of the country because of the province’s colonial history and its unique mixture of Francophones, Anglophones, and Allophones. Quebec nationalism, xenophobia, and issues of French Canadian identity also shape immigration debates in the province (Maynard and Ho 2009: 22). The 2007 reasonable accommodation controversies provide a window into the politics over national identity and immigration that have come to the fore in recent years. *La Commission de consultation sur les pratiques d’accomodement relié aux différences culturelles* (Consultation Commission on Accommodation Practices Related to Cultural Differences, also known as the Bouchard Taylor Commission) attempted to ascertain how accommodation of immigrants was taking place in Quebec by providing open forums for discussion that were later broadcast all over the province. A group of activists in Montréal

---

<sup>1</sup> “Pinoy” is used by Filipinos as a self-descriptive term for Filipino people living in the Philippines or people of Filipino birth or descent living abroad. It has a positive connotation and stretches membership to the Philippine nation beyond borders in accordance with the transnational lives many Filipinos lead.

denounced the commission for constructing an ‘us-them’ dichotomy between white, French-speaking Quebeckers and immigrants (22).

I apply a transnational framework to my analysis, which emphasizes the ways in which migrants resist exclusion from full citizenship rights in a receiving state through the maintenance of citizenship expressions in their home country. Transnational scholars argue that the social, financial, kinship, and political worlds of sending states are intertwined and connected to those of receiving states. Migrants are understood to creatively and actively circulate between multiple social worlds – both in person and through long-distance technology or imagination (Basch, Glick Schiller, and Szanton Blanc 1994).

I wanted to find out if two Filipino newspapers in Montréal – the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* – could be construed as transnational by their writers, their LCP worker readers, and through content analysis. Several sub-questions follow from this line of inquiry.

- What is the relation between consumption and production – or reading and writing – of the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post*?
- What is the relationship between media and identity?
- Does that relationship have a transnational component in the context of the Filipino diaspora living in Montréal?
- Can Filipino media in Montréal be construed in terms of resistance?



- How do the structures of Filipina caregivers' lives in Montréal affect their media consumption patterns?

I spent eight months in Montréal doing fieldwork on LCP workers and Filipino media in order to answer these questions. I sought out women who had come to Canada through the LCP program for interviews on their migration history, employment experiences in Canada, and opinions on media. I also sought out journalists who produce the news I was collecting opinions from LCP workers about. I designed my methodology to address key gaps in the Canadian literature on LCP workers and media and minorities.

While much has been written about immigrant media in the United States and on Filipino media abroad, no study has thus far addressed Filipino media in Canada specifically. My project moves beyond content analysis by looking at how news media is read and produced. Doing so captures the animated nature of media, which is contributed to, and constituted and changed by the people who read and write the news.

I approach the media diet of LCP workers with tools from the anthropological kit. By grounding textual analysis of news about and written by Filipinos in Montréal with ethnographic, open-ended, semi-structured interviews, I am contributing research to a nascent trend in anthropology: the anthropology of news and journalism. Scholars in this area of research have called attention to the lack of studies on local or alternative news enterprises (Bird 2010: 15). Wahl-Jorgensen points out that anthropologists of news and journalism have tended to focus on large corporate newsrooms (Wahl-Jorgensen 2010). By emphasizing community newspapers with a small circulation – the *North American*

*Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* – my study contributes to the diversification of anthropological media studies.

My project also contributes new perspectives on immigrant media in Canada by examining the role of Filipino newspapers in the media diet of LCP workers. Various authors have written about the employment and social constraints Filipina migrants face as live-in caregivers in Canada (Arat-Koç and Giles 1994, Bakan and Stasiulis 1997, McKay 2003, Pratt 2004, Stasiulis and Bakan 2005), but little has been written on the meaning of media to this group. The way that LCP workers are represented in the Filipino newspapers in Montréal grows out of the power dynamics that structure the Filipino community along class, migration status, gender, and age lines. I seek to position the Filipino newspapers in Montréal within the greater rubric of mainstream offerings in order to ascertain the power of alternative images in influencing hegemonic ones. In addition, I wanted to measure the extent to which the images produced by the Filipino media can be considered “alternative”. If they speak back to hegemonic (mis)representations of LCP workers, what are they saying and why?

My research advances three conclusions. First, I argue that the *Montreal Pinoy Post* and the *North American Filipino Star* are transnational objects. Second, I posit that Filipino newspapers elaborate Filipino identity in a process of speaking up against the ways in which mainstream media tends to misrepresent, homogenize, render invisible, distort, or stereotype Filipinos in Canada and in the Philippines. The impact of the *Post* and the *Star* in speaking back against mainstream misrepresentation through the elaboration of identities is limited by their small circulation of around 5,000 copies of one issue per month within the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood. Thirdly, I conclude that the *Post* and

the *Star* operate along axes of power drawn out of the cleavages in the Filipino community along migration history, gender, language, and class lines to initiate processes of inclusion and exclusion within the “community.”

Taken together, these three conclusions reveal the contradictions involved in resisting representations of minorities created by the mainstream media. In comparison to mainstream news, the *Post* and the *Star* are safe places for the varied expressions of Filipino-ness in Montréal. But in the context of the socially stratified Filipino community in Montréal, the variety in these expressions is stifled in specific ways. And while the newspapers are certainly transnational, they do not factor into the ways in which the LCP workers I spoke to actively resisted the work and immigration conditions they face.

I make no efforts to conceal that my analysis of the LCP aligns with that of PINAY, the Filipina Women’s Organization in Montréal I volunteered with as the centerpiece of my fieldwork. My thesis writes the stories of the women I met in an effort to expose the exploitative nature of the LCP and to elaborate on the creative, spirited, and unrelenting forms of resistance the exploitation inspires.

### **1.1 A NOTE ON TERMINOLOGY**

I sometimes refer to the group of women I interviewed as “LCP workers” to emphasize that they are workers. The introduction of such terminology is a sign of solidarity with PINAY, which has been fighting for more than five years to have domestic work recognized as work by the Quebec Normes du Travail. The omission of domestic workers from the official provincial definition of work justifies their exclusion from CSST (La

Commission de la santé et de la sécurité du travail du Québec, also known as worker's compensation) that offers protection and insurance in the case of work-related accidents.

I employ the term "LCP workers" also in a feminist stance against the tendency to undervalue reproductive and emotional labour within the home, long relegated to an invisible feminine realm. I prefer the term LCP worker to "caregiver" or "domestic helper" because it makes an unmistakable connection between female migrants from the Philippines and the LCP program.

In my writing on how LCP workers use media in Montréal, I use the word 'diaspora.' This decision was made to imply that Filipino migrant workers might feel connected across geographical distances through a shared sense of exile and non-belonging in their places of settlement (Cohen 2008: 4).

I use the terms "third world" and "first world" to illustrate the gulf between nations that extract and exploit to gain wealth (such as Canada) and the nations they extract from and exploit (such as the Philippines). The decision was made in objection to the myth of progress spun by the terms "developing" and "developed" worlds. "Developing world" conceals the international apparatuses that systematically entrench the third world in greater and greater poverty in order to create conditions that increase the wealth of first world nations.

I also sometimes refer to LCP workers as "third world women of colour" to draw attention to the processes of exclusion and exploitation that can continue to define their lives in Canada through racism and association with the third world.

## 1.2 TRANSNATIONALISM AND MEDIA

I use a transnational theoretical perspective to frame the issues in this thesis.

Transnationalism was defined by Basch, Glick Schiller, and Szanton Blanc in an important, much referenced early contribution to debates on immigration as “the process by which immigrants forge and sustain multi-stranded social relations that link together their societies of origin and resettlement...[and] transmigrants take actions, make decisions, and develop subjectivities that connect them simultaneously to two or more nation-states” (1994: 7). My research positions the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* as vessels for the construction of transnational identities based on their compilation of news and information from Montréal, the Montréal Filipino community, and the Philippines. As cultural objects, the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* span multiple spaces and blur the distinction between international and local.

The introduction of transnationalism into migration studies marked a paradigm shift away from earlier theories of assimilation and the primacy of the nation in identity construction. Before ideas of transnationalism came to the fore, the field of migration studies was dominated by ideas of assimilation and adaptation generated in the Chicago School of Sociology. Integration and assimilation were studied to ascertain variables that would foster the adoption of the country of settlement’s cultural codes. Assimilation was understood as a set of social processes that initiated and sustained migrants’ incorporation into mainstream life of the receiving state (Park and Burgess 1921: 735).

Li's work demonstrates the damaging effects of the discourse on "integration" in Canadian immigration debates, academic writing, and policy statements, which paves the way for racism through intolerance of cultural difference. "Integration" discourse in Canada encourages immigrants to become enfolded within Canadian society in specific ways that exclude "cultural specificities outside the mainstream" (Li 2003a: 315). Canada's immigration discourse measures the extent to which newcomers become similar to average Canadians in terms of language, income levels, settlement outside of "ethnic enclave" areas, and participation in mainstream social and political activities (Li 2003a: 316).

Wimmer and Glick Schiller argue that migration studies throughout the 20th century employed 'methodological nationalism,' which positions the nation-state as the appropriate unit for analysis and portrays immigrants as a threat to tightly bound nations (2003: 590). Immigrants were in essence 'unnatural', as they corrupted the normalcy of sedentariness and its primacy in constructing nationals. Malkki's concept of "the metaphysics of sedentarism" also examines how the association between nation and identity grew to prominence in our understanding of migration. She explores how rootedness has come to be discursively naturalized through a worldview of nations as discrete and separate territories (Malkki 1997: 65).

The pervasiveness of methodological nationalism is evidenced in a body of work on diasporic media that is concerned with the role ethnic print media plays in the assimilation of migrants into countries of settlement. Viswanath and Arora (2000) argue that ethnic media in the US plays a role in the assimilation of immigrants into the host society by encouraging readers to become involved in local politics, by demonstrating the

groups' patriotism, and by fostering positive feelings between homelands and countries of settlement. Similarly, Zhou and Cai (2002) argue "Chinese language media connects migrants to their host society and also serves as a roadmap for the first generation to incorporate into American society by promoting the mobility goals of homeownership, entrepreneurship, and educational achievement" (421). Ojo's work highlights the role of Afro-Caribbean newspaper *The Montréal Community Contact* in assimilating readers alongside its role in cultural preservation (2006: 353). These examples demonstrate that the boundary between sending and receiving nations remains important to migrant media studies.

The early moves toward problematizing the nation and the association between identity and place made by Appadurai (2002), Clifford (1997), and Gupta and Ferguson (1997) set the stage for the emergence of transnational lines of thinking. Appadurai argues that in order to arrive at a "postmodern social theory" that is sufficiently global, we must examine the dynamics of overlapping flows of media, people, finance, technology, and ideologies (61-62). In the face of globally disseminated media that corrupts the boundedness of place and identity, he called for theories of "rootlessness, alienation, and psychological distance" (47). We can trace early moves toward theoretical transnationalism in Appadurai's concept of "deterritorialization" (54), used in reference to the flow of lower class workers toward rich societies.

Gupta and Ferguson (1997) also challenged the link between place and identity in their effort to grapple with the concept of 'culture' in a postmodern world. They linked the deterritorialization of culture to the "mass migrations and transnational culture flows" that categorize our current moment of capitalism (3). Clifford's conception of culture as travel

echoed the moves in postmodern anthropology to delink identity and place. “If we rethink culture and its science, anthropology, in terms of travel, then the organic, naturalizing bias of the term ‘culture’ – seen as a rooted body that grows, lives, dies, and so on, is questioned” (25).

Basch, Glick Schiller, and Szanton Blanc’s work shifted ground by envisioning migrants’ social worlds as one continuous field, rather than a fragmented plane. In their critique, they portray migrants as agents who “develop networks, activities, patterns of living, and ideologies that span their home and host society” (1994: 4). Transmigrants’ lives juggle identities and social worlds (7) in a context where both the countr(ies) of settlement and origin were incorporated into “a single field of social relations” (5). Media seen through a transnational lens are revealed as a mechanism through which immigrants go about the self-conscious project of developing and sustaining relations to multiple homes.

Transnationalism is above all a process through which migrants exercise agency by “forging and sustaining multi-stranded social relations” (Basch, Glick Schiller, and Szanton Blanc 1994: 7) in an unequal world that limits the mobilities of some and mandates the (circumscribed) mobilities of others. Transnational agency takes shape through imagination and quotidian actions. “The imagination is now central to all forms of agency, is itself a social fact, and is the key component of the new global order” (Appadurai 2002: 49). Transnationalism acknowledges that imagining is a political act and also highlights the conspicuous and lived actions that transnationals undertake in order to sustain bonds to multiple places. Glick Schiller and Fouron (2001) position long distance nationalism as a potential route for resistance. By aligning themselves with their homelands, migrants may come to creatively challenge global structures of power (31).



The influence of transnationalism in diasporic media studies is evidenced in their attention to the destabilization of the neat association between place and identity and by rendering the question of assimilation complex. In Cheng's (2005) study of Cantonese-language newspapers in Vancouver, emphasis is placed on the construction of multiple homelands and attachments. Cheng argues that the newspaper produces two locals: one that is place-oriented, and one that is people-oriented. Wanning (2005) sketched the mediascape for Chinese consumers in Australia and concluded that consumers choose between a plethora of Chinese media options in order to construct a particular type of Chinese identity (2005: 67). Her observations echo Ong's assertion that "Chinese-ness" is not always derived from relation to the mainland, marking again the denaturalization of place with identity (1999). Similarly, Naficy questions "how exiles process, through the popular culture and TV programs they produce and consume, their own experiences of separation, liminality, and incorporation, as well as their resistance to incorporation and their efforts at differentiation and dissimulation" (1993: xvi) in his study of Iranian television in Los Angeles.

Looking for agency through media consumption follows from a post-modern paradigm shift in cultural studies theory that drew attention to the ways in which the raw material of media is shaped, contested, and transformed when it is consumed. In the 1970s, researchers in the US and the UK began to question the way audiences had been portrayed as indiscriminate sponges upon whom media messages were imposed (Mahtani 2001: 113). Ethnic print media tells the stories of immigrants who are neither completely rooted nor entirely rootless, but somewhere in between. This project pushes forward from

the work done on Canadian media studies from a transnational lens by looking at a special audience group – Filipina LCP workers in Montréal.

### **1.3 THE LCP: BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT**

The LCP is a federal immigration program that recruits women from the third world to work as live-in domestic helpers for Canadian families. LCP workers must complete 24 months of live-in care work within a 48-month period in Canada to become eligible for permanent residency status, which in turn allows them to sponsor family members and work in domains outside of private home care. Although it has been through many reforms, the program, which began in 1992, is widely criticized for being anti-woman and racist. Around 90 per cent of LCP principal applicants come from the Philippines (Kelly et al. 2011: 10) and only 5% of principal applicants are men (5).

The LCP is the only program in the world that offers temporary migrants working in the home doing emotional and reproductive labour an avenue to eventually apply for permanent residency. In most of the world, foreign nannies are contracted out to complete one or two-year contracts that hold no promise of permanent settlement in the country of employment. In fact, the labour-importing techniques of destinations like Hong Kong, Jordan, UAE, and Europe are designed to impede long-term settlement and instead encourage short stints of temporary contracts interspaced by visits back to the Philippines. These domestic worker schemes institutionalize flexible labour by offering little to no job security or long-term benefits. The long waiting period associated with making applications for overseas contracts demonstrates the expendability of workers – another suitable, educated Filipina is waiting in the immigration queue to replace the one who cannot handle back-breaking and often demoralizing housework.

The Canadian live-in caregiver program offsets the unpleasantness of live-in housework – a type of labour associated with deskilling, feelings of isolation, exploitation, abuse, and lack of privacy – with the promise of permanent residency and eventually, immigrant status, family sponsorship, and all the trimmings of a bonafide Canadian dream come true. The eventual promise of permanent residency can compel participants to endure abusive or exploitative working conditions in the interest of finishing their 24 months as quickly as possible.

#### **1.4 MEDIA AND MINORITIES IN MONTRÉAL**

The Montréal metro network shuttles people to all corners of the city and is a circulatory system that lives and breathes and moves according to the work schedules and leisure pursuits of all who ride it. It was on the Montréal metro that I first noticed immigrant newspapers.

Chinese men flipped through pictures of floods, earthquake victims, and advertisements for ballet schools in Chinese-language dailies like *The Epoch Times*, found abundantly in the businesses below boulevard René-Lévesque in Chinatown and on Sainte. Catherine Street near Concordia University. Women chatting in Mexican-accented Spanish on the metro held on to *Chasqui*, a Spanish-language newspaper whose first five pages are covered in full-colour ads publicizing Ecuadorian restaurants, Colombian caterers, and ladies' nights at Montréal disco clubs. More popular than any other Spanish newspaper among the Latino community in Montréal, *Chasqui* is named for folkloric Inca messengers and is run by a Peruvian army veteran.

Looking past the metro for clues, I started to see ethnic newspapers all over the city. The *Montréal Community Contact* I picked up in June at Mango Bay, a Caribbean restaurant near Concordia University, headlined with a thoughtful piece on racial profiling among Montréal police. The entranceway to the Côte-des-Neiges community centre is home to three stands for free newspapers, and the publications found there can make classification according to ethnicity challenging. The *Awaj, Voice of the People*, for example, is published in Montréal by an association for abused women, prints half its content in French, half its content in English, self-declares its mission to be to serve the multinational community, and runs stories on the hijab debate, Filipina mail-order brides in Japan, and Montréal's response to the homelessness problem in the city.

The first time I picked up a Filipino newspaper was in Bahay Kubo, a Filipino bakery in the heart of the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood, a few streets of which are referred to as "Pinoyville" by Filipino and non-Filipino Montréalers alike because of the high concentration of Filipino residents and businesses there. It wasn't easy to get my hands on a copy of the *North American Filipino Star* or the *Montreal Pinoy Post*. They are popular publications, and tend to fly off the stands where they are distributed. It is uncommon to see stacked stands even a few days after the distributors deliver them. Printed in English, the Filipino newspapers provided a platform for me to begin to form the questions about migration histories and media reading habits among Filipina women living in Montréal.

Filipino media can help caregivers connect to home and mainstream media can be a source of frustration about the lack of recognition of LCP workers' experience.

Sometimes, mainstream media takes the caregiver experience as its subject focus by printing articles about nannies, nannyng, family separation, and immigration. When

caregivers give mainstream journalists interviews, they have the chance to influence a news story and to be heard by a wider public audience. This exchange – explored in depth in chapter 6 – is full of contradictions and ambiguities that play out along the public/private divide.

## 1.5 METHODOLOGY

I set out to discover what role the media play in the lives of Filipina LCP workers in Montréal through a three-pronged methodological approach. First, I interviewed journalists to gain insight into the context from which the Filipino and mainstream news spring. Second, I interviewed nine women who entered Canada through the live-in caregiver program about their migration, work, and media experiences. Some of these women were already permanent residents, some were waiting on permanent residency applications, and others were still temporary foreign workers under the live-in caregiver program. I also volunteered with PINAY, a Filipino women’s organization in Montréal that seeks to empower caregivers working in Quebec, doing participant observation for eight months. This component of the research explored ethnographically the daily-lived realities of a special audience group within the Filipino diaspora – LCP workers – to get a sense of how they consume, interpret, reject, and/or celebrate the messages in Filipino and mainstream news. Third, I analyzed the content of six issues of the *Montreal Pinoy Post*, six issues of the *North American Filipino Star*,<sup>2</sup> and three articles in the *Montreal Gazette* – an Anglophone newspaper in Montréal owned by the Postmedia Network.

---

<sup>2</sup> Analysis of the third Filipino newspaper in Montréal, *The Filipino Forum*, was outside the scope of this study. I was unable to contact the *Forum* editor-in-chief and the *Filipino Forum* is not available online, which made it difficult to ensure I had access to six issues.

My methodology combines media analysis with participant observation and anthropological ethnography techniques. It responds to calls from Mahtani (2001) to push Canadian research on media and minorities beyond content analysis by examining the contexts from which writing springs and within which audiences read news. The ethnographic components of my methodology were designed to privilege first-person accounts of migration journeys and employment experiences in Canada. These form the heart of my thesis, and I take time to quote from interviews throughout.

The first layer of my research – looking at how Filipino media is produced – involved interviewing four people from the Filipino media world: the editor-in-chief of the *North American Filipino Star*, the editor-in-chief and a writer of the *Montreal Pinoy Post*, and a Filipina-American journalist who works in Montréal. I sought these individuals out through contact information publically available in the newspapers they write for or online. Some of the names of these journalists have been changed. I used the interviews with the *Post* and *Star* editors to learn about the history, vision, and organization of Filipino papers in Montréal. Talking with the editors helped me to understand how they saw their role as media producers and their newspapers within the mediascape of Montréal. I especially wanted to sense out their feelings about LCP workers and to see if they are considered separately or specially in the process of producing news for the Filipino community.

The second layer of my research – an examination of how Filipino media is consumed – involved nine open-ended interviews with women who had entered Canada through the LCP. The interviews usually lasted at least two hours, with the exception of two interviews that were much shorter in length (around half an hour). I quote less from these

shorter interviews. I met five of these women – Twinny, Elsa, Lith, Tess, and Escada – through PINAY and referrals from Evelyn were helpful in establishing trust early in interviews. The other four women I met through my own creative networking methods. I met Dora hanging around Westmount Park, where many live-in caregivers bring the children they care for during summer days. Piedad is the live-in caregiver of a friend's grandmother. I crossed paths with Pilar, who works in Toronto, at an International Women's Conference in Montréal where she was a visiting delegate. Emmy is Tess's sister and roommate and agreed to be interviewed by me while I was at her apartment for an interview with Tess. A summary table of interviewee demographics, employment record, and migration histories is included in appendix A. I had the opportunity to follow up with three of the women I interviewed in the months after our initial meeting through various PINAY events. These additional conversations allowed me to see how some of the issues discussed during interviews developed over time. For example, when I interviewed Lith, she was separated from her family. Over the months I volunteered for PINAY, I would frequently meet Lith and we would discuss the progress of her permanent residency application and family sponsorship procedures. I was joyous to see Lith reunited with her husband and two children at the tail end of my fieldwork.

The first half of the interviews were dedicated to documenting migration and employment history by encouraging respondents to narrate their stories in their own words through lengthy, uninterrupted monologue. The second part of interviews was dedicated to media analysis. I asked how they gained access to news, whether reading news about the Philippines was important to them, and what they thought about the three Filipino newspapers in Montréal. In studying how Filipina caregivers in Montréal consume media,

I balanced attention to the power of media as an external discourse with the agency consumers exercise in selecting and using materials, which they then interpret and decode (Morley 2003: 1095). The names of the women I interviewed have been changed to a pseudonym of their choosing.

The interviews were supplemented by an eight-month fieldwork component, during which time I volunteered with PINAY. As a PINAY volunteer, I updated and managed their blog space, did translation, attended social gatherings and demonstrations, drafted official letters, taught weekly yoga sessions at their community center, accompanied members to meetings with parliamentarians for ongoing campaigns, facilitated news writing workshops, and gathered testimonies for a human rights case against a Montréal nanny agency. These activities allowed me to reciprocate the help PINAY gave me towards my research and are a form of ethnographic engagement.

My occasional job as a waitress for a catering company patronized by wealthy clients allowed me to observe interactions between LCP workers and employers and to become more familiar with the living conditions of LCP workers within private homes. Two of the clients I catered for employed live-in domestic workers and two others employed Filipina women as domestic workers, although they did not live in. I catered during my fieldwork to earn extra spending money. The rich ethnographic opportunities my position afforded me were a welcome additional benefit. While on site inside the homes of families who employed live-in caregivers, I was able to quietly observe interactions, converse casually with LCP workers, and to see with my own eyes the rooms that domestic workers stay in.



The third layer of the research involved textual and visual analysis of the August 2009, October 2009, June 2010, July 2010, August 2010, and September 2010 issues of *The North American Filipino Star*. The issues were chosen within the period of time that the most recent issues of the *Montreal Pinoy Post* had been released, which comes out much less frequently and more sporadically than the *Star*. The *North American Filipino Star* issues were selected from within this time period at random. The six issues of the *Montreal Pinoy Post* I analyzed were: July-August 2009, September-October 2009, December 2009, January-February 2010, April-May 2010, and August-September 2010. I read the newspapers when I conceived of my project and took detailed notes on the ideas I had about each article and photo found within. I re-read them as I prepared for my interviews and added to my notes with new theoretical perspectives from the academic reading I'd done in the meantime. I read them again periodically during the interview phase of my fieldwork. These readings were the most fruitful in terms of analysis because I was able to see the newspapers through the eyes of the people I had interviewed. The conversations I had with caregivers drew my attention to dimensions of their lives – such as family separation and remittance sending – that were taken up in the pages of the *Post* and the *Star*. The conversations I had with *Post* and *Star* journalists allowed me to contextualize messages and their meanings within the framework of production. When I had finished all my interviews, I looked back through the papers again and carefully considered how the ethnographic material I collected related to their content. My content analysis approach was designed to examine the tension between isolated caregivers and the larger world that their lives take place within. The textual and visual analysis of *the North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* revealed that the newspapers embody transnational connections to both the Philippines and Montréal and is explored

more deeply in Chapter 3. The first four pages of the August 2010 issue of the *North American Filipino Star* and four cover pages of the *Montreal Pinoy Post* are included in the Appendices (Appendix B and Appendix C).

## **1.6 MY SOCIAL LOCATION AS A RESEARCHER**

My project entailed a research collaboration with PINAY, who brokered my access to the Filipina caregiver community in Montréal. Based on her work with the Philippine Women's Centre in Vancouver, Pratt warns against the unequivocal valorization of research collaborations between academics and disadvantaged groups because the politics of white middle class heterosexual women representing marginalized women can be problematic (2000: 639). The research encounter between the university student and "othered" women can be fraught with "ethnographic anxieties," leading to the reproduction of colonial domination in academic writing, and often benefits the researcher in the pursuit of her career more than the informants she collaborates with (Ong 1995: 353). It is debatable whether my efforts to help PINAY members – through volunteering my translation, writing, editing, and yoga skills – matched the help PINAY extended to me in facilitating my research. I can say that PINAY members were satisfied and happy with the research collaboration we forged. My relationship with members was marked by mutual gratitude and respect. Ong offers that the negotiation of trust and the avoidance of betrayal are key components to ensuring that research exchanges mutually benefit researchers and informants. The people we interview possess and wield a power of their own in the research encounter, which sways and shapes ethnographic knowledge (Ong 1995: 353).

As a university educated woman, a gulf in opportunities and wealth inevitably characterized my relationships with the women I met through my study. This gulf did not change the fact that I went into every one of my interviews ready to listen and learn. I knew that the women I spoke with had greater insight on the topic I was researching than I did and I trusted their authority during interviews. I made fast friends and allies with many PINAY members, who were as curious about what life was like for me as I was curious about what life was like for them.

I am a yoga teacher and throughout my fieldwork, I gave weekly free yoga classes to PINAY members at the Immigrant Workers' Center. My social location as someone with enough time and money to pursue yoga was laid bare by one member's comments after class. Jolene told me that she feels inferior when her boss talks about yoga and the time she gets to take for herself to be healthy and calm. Jolene was happy that she also had a chance to concentrate on herself through our yoga sessions.

As PINAY's yoga teacher, I was offered insight into the secret worlds of Filipina caregivers that are kept private from employers. During one session, I gave a guided massage workshop that we did in pairs. Members took turns learning yoga massage techniques and receiving massages. Alice was delighted by what she had learned about the body and told me she would never tell her employer she had spent her Saturday night learning massage because she knew her employer would then capitalize on her new knowledge and ask for nightly massages. Other women at the workshop laughed along with Alice and agreed to take her advice on keeping mum about their new knowledge. The intimacy and trust I was able to build with members through our weekly yoga

sessions was an unexpected side effect of an endeavor I intended as a gesture of reciprocity with PINAY.

While the politics of a research encounter between parties with unequal access to power is certainly worth evaluating, the human relationships that develop in ethnographic research often reduce the pertinence of such evaluations. The women I interviewed wanted to share their stories and to be listened to. I stood witness to the unraveling of their personal narratives during interviews, the telling of which often had a therapeutic effect because it reduced stress within a setting of friendship and understanding. My hopes for the impact of the quoted passages from my interviews included in this thesis are in line with Pratt's: "Our desire was to enable domestic workers to tell their stories in their own terms, with an intimacy, complexity, and force that would have an impact on those who read them, by dispelling stereotypes and offering views into domestic workers' experience" (2000: 640).

## **1.7 CHAPTER OUTLINE**

Chapter two lays the groundwork for my analysis by mapping global and national geographies of LCP workers in Montréal. I present the literature on the feminization of migration, the LCP, changes to the LCP, and the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood of Montréal where my research took place. In chapter three, I introduce the two Filipino newspapers I studied and argue that they are transnational elaborations of Filipino identity that speak back to processes in the mainstream news that "other", misrepresent, or under-represent minorities. The fourth chapter examines the live-in requirement of LCP work to expose the exploitation inherent to the program and looks at how processes of remittance sending and deskilling play out in the lives of the women I interviewed. Chapter 5 looks

at feminist readings of the live-in caregiver program and uses two cases – international marriage (meaning marriage between a Filipina woman and a Canadian man) and the denial of reproductive rights – to illustrate the gender dynamics LCP workers negotiate across borders. Chapter 6 demonstrates that mainstream news tends to pander to the stereotype that all Filipinas are nannies and offers examples from the Filipino newspapers of elaborated versions of Filipina femininity. Caregivers’ experiences with being interviewed to produce mainstream news stories about nannies are also considered, revealing that these stories sometimes benefit the women they are written about. My final chapter (7) grounds my discussion within a citizenship framework and advances several policy suggestions to ensure that ethnic media in Canada remains vibrant and to facilitate LCP workers leading lives of dignity.

## **CHAPTER 2            A MAP TO GLOBAL AND NATIONAL LCP GEOGRAPHIES**

The lives of live-in caregivers in Montréal are circumscribed by the architecture of the LCP – the Canadian immigration program that recruits them to come to Canada and work in private homes. To set the stage for the analysis of the role of media in the lives of Filipina caregivers in Montréal, this chapter introduces the concept of the feminization of migration, the LCP, the 2010 changes to the program, PINAY, and the neighbourhood of Montréal where most of the women I interviewed live: Côte-des-Neiges. Global processes that produce the feminization of migration are examined alongside national processes that place LCP workers in precarious citizenship positions when they arrive in Canada. The interests of the Canadian government in changing the LCP in April 2010 are contrasted with the goals of PINAY, revealing a fundamental disconnect.

### **2.1 THE FEMINIZATION OF MIGRATION**

LCP workers in Canada are a symbol of a global trend: the feminization of migration. The feminization of migration describes the increased presence of women in most migration streams and is linked to rising unemployment for men in origin countries, high demand for female labour in destination countries, and advances in statistical data collection on women migrants (Piper 2008: 2-3). Women on the move have created a worldwide gender revolution that has shifted femininities and masculinities in both sending and receiving countries (Ehrenreich and Hoschschild 2002: 3). The ability of female migrants to accumulate human capital is circumscribed by the gender stratification of both the

countries they originate from and those they choose to migrate to where access to educational opportunities and prospects for skill training is gendered (Piper 2008: 6).

Filipina women have eclipsed men as the group more often going abroad. The Philippine Labor Department reported that in 2005, 65% of the 3,000 Filipinos who leave the country daily to work abroad are women (Opiniano 2005 & UNFPA 2006). The international demand for service workers – especially domestic helpers, but also in restaurants, the sex industry, and retail – tends to favour Filipina women over Filipino men. In Canada specifically, the live-in caregiver program (LCP) creates a feminized stream of migrants from the Philippines into Canada. The number of men coming through the LCP as principal applicants rose from 2% in 1993 to 5% in 2009 (Kelly et al. 2011: 5). The number of principal applicants from the Philippines far outnumbers applicants from any other country: in 2009, 5,607 people from the Philippines came to Canada through the LCP, compared with 183 from India and 10 from the Slovak Republic (Kelly et al. 2011: 10). The pioneer migrations of Filipina women through the LCP often eventually initiate the migrations of spouses, children, and other family members through sponsorship, which dismantles the view in much current literature of women as the dependent wives of migrating men (Barber and Lem 2010: 9).

As the western world deindustrialized, two parallel phenomena took root globally that facilitated the migration of women into flexible service sector jobs like caregiving. First, a portion of the western world's manufacturing sector was outsourced to the third world where the costs of production and labour were lower. Outsourcing occurs when capitalist firms exhaust opportunities for profitable domestic investment. Western capitalists invest in "less developed" nations because capitalism always requires something outside of itself

in order to accumulate more (Harvey 2003). In new markets, western capitalists see a high return on their investments since land, raw material, and labour are cheaper in third world nations than at home (Harvey 2003). Barber and Lem contend that geographic mobility arises in coincidence with capitalism and the conditions of “social and economic differentiation, class polarization, dispossession, and the extrication of people from livelihoods” it creates (2010: 3). The way for the feminization of migration was paved by social acceptance in the third world of women entering employment situations in manufacturing, tourism, and agriculture created through capitalist forces in a globally connected world (Piper 2008: 6).

Unemployment in the third world is linked to the deindustrialization of the first world. Manufacturing centers in the third world and agricultural restructuring initiated massive rural to urban migration. The inability of third world cities to absorb these excess workers produced an easily exploitable labour force composed of third world migrants (Basch, Glick Schiller, and Szanton Blanc 1994: 26). Export-processing zones and factories create a culture of domestic migration by demanding more labour than the local population can supply. Frequently women from the provinces who are drawn to manufacturing sectors in the Philippines turn to international migration following loss of their jobs or factory closure (Choy 2005: 89). Complex decision-making processes are involved in immigration trajectories and the nimbleness of migrants in negotiating various international options for securing livelihoods and complicated immigration bureaucracy has been pointed to by Barber (2008).



The second set of conditions that facilitate the migration of women from poor countries to rich countries arises out of the ascendance of the global city and the demand for low paid service workers it generates. Global cities emerge as the headquarters of finance and trade, where professionals and managers congregate and the global economy's key functions and resources are concentrated (Sassen 2002: 255). Rich people in global cities create a demand for low-wage workers to provide janitorial, repair, childcare and restaurant services (255). Wages for service workers have not risen in coincidence with the rise in demand for their labour. Hiring women and immigrant workers at low wages ensures that capitalist profits of global cities continue to swell (258).

When female migrants arrive in Canada their options for employment are often limited to the precarious, undervalued, and low paid service sector, which grew as the west deindustrialized. The LCP only grants entrance to applicants conditionally. LCP workers must prove themselves to be good candidates for Canadian permanent residency by surviving two years of live-in domestic work. Receiving nations limit the political, civil, and social incorporation of migrants in order to secure a source of low wage labour that can be repatriated if domestic unemployment ever rises (Parreñas 2001: 1134). Canada did not always treat migrant domestic workers as expendable: European settler women were welcomed as "mothers of the nation" with respect and love during colonial times (Bakan and Stasuilis 1997: 21). The racist underpinnings of Canada's immigration discourse expressed in the LCP are stark.

The Philippines pursues labour export as a national development strategy to assuage the country's high rates of unemployment and debt (Enloe 1989). "The governments of sending states, which encourage the trade in female domestic labour as a means of alleviating chronic unemployment and balance of payment crises are complicit in the

exploitation and abuse of their nationals” (Bakan and Stasuilis 1997: 21). While the role of the state remains important, the migration journeys of Filipinos are born from agency and complex decision-making processes involving networks that span multiple borders.

## **2.2 THE LIVE-IN CAREGIVER PROGRAM IN CANADA**

The Live-in Caregiver Program (LCP) was born in 1992 when the Canadian government changed the name and conditions of its predecessor, the Foreign Domestic Worker Movement. LCP participants can apply for permanent residence, and eventually can even be eligible to sponsor family members to join them in Canada upon completing two years of live-in domestic service. Coined the “graduate school” (McKay 2003: 26) of caregiver programs, the LCP often entails a one-way journey.

The fundamental architecture of the LCP – the temporary status of the workers it recruits and the live-in requirement – has remained unchanged since its initial incarnation in the mid-1950s, despite various reforms (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 49). The LCP continues to come under fierce criticism by activists and scholars alike: “the LCP has been structured by various federal governments over decades with the full knowledge of a highly vulnerable pool of foreign worker applicants upon whom restrictive conditions are imposed” (47). The LCP constricts Filipina domestic workers’ reproductive rights, denies them secure residency status, and restricts their access to protection from exploitative working conditions. Filipina caregivers in Montréal specifically face employment constraints including limited access to sick days, health care, employment insurance, and labour standards (PINAY 2008: 24).

Many LCP applicants coming to Canada have completed six-month courses on caregiving that comply with Canadian immigration requirements (Embassy of Canada 2009: 2).

Applications can be refused if training was undertaken at a non-accredited institution, if the course was done by correspondence or completed in less than 6 months (2). An unpublished report on the LCP prepared in Manila records “phenomenal growth in the number of caregiver training programmes, numbering 10 in 1999, to more than 800 in 2005. Almost 80% of these schools commenced operations during the period 2002–03” (Barber 2008: 1274). The boom in the number of institutions offering the caregiver course signifies its establishment as a requirement for applicants as well as the high number of women from the Philippines who use the LCP as an avenue into Canada.

The LCP and the stream of Filipina migrant workers it induces must be placed in the context of neoliberal reform across the world. As structural adjustment policies direct the Filipino government to cut back on social spending and to concentrate on exports, jobs in the Philippines become scarce. The shift from public to private health care and education taxes families with extra financial burdens to educate their children and keep their loved ones healthy. These two forces coincide to produce a workforce ready to be exported to areas of more lucrative employment so that remittances can be sent back to the Philippines to raise families. The demand for migrant Filipinas to work in private overseas homes originates from similar processes taking place in Canada – neoliberal reforms have privatized Canadian child and elderly care, leaving some citizens with little choice but to hire live-in help from the third world.

## **2.3 LIVING UNDER THE “NEW” LIVE-IN CAREGIVER PROGRAM**

Conservative Immigration Minister Jason Kenney ushered in numerous changes to the LCP in 2009-2010. The most important changes are:

1. As of April 2010, the length of time LCP workers have from the date of their arrival in Canada to complete the employment requirement to be eligible for permanent residence under the live-in caregiver class is increased from three years (36 months) to four years (48 months) (CIC 2009)
2. As of April 2010, employers must reimburse any recruiting fees LCP workers paid to agencies and travel costs for LCP workers to come to Canada (HRSDC 2011)
3. As of April 2010, employers must enroll LCP workers in medical insurance until they become eligible for provincial health coverage and cover the costs of this health coverage. Employers must enroll and pay for workplace safety insurance (HRSDC: 2011)
4. As of December 12, 2009, Caregivers are no longer subject to a second medical exam (also known as “Juana Tejada Law”).

In this section, I consider each of these changes in turn. I conclude that the first three changes further entrench LCP workers in conditions of exploitation. However, the Juana Tejada law is a significant victory in the fight for caregiver rights. Kenney’s changes reveal a fundamental disconnect between LCP workers’ needs and Canadian immigration ideology. LCP workers want to be treated humanely and expand their citizenship rights in

Canada. Canada wants to bring in flexible, disposable migrant workers to fill vacant positions in the job market that no other Canadian is willing to fill.

### **2.3.1. The 24/36 Formula Becomes the 24/48 Formula**

The move to extend the duration of the live-in caregiver program responds to the frequency with which participants ran out of time before being completing 24 months because they had to switch employers, fell ill, or were fired. Kenney's change identifies the length of time LCP workers are afforded to complete the 24 months as the root of the problem with not finishing on time. This is out of touch with how LCP workers and their advocates view the problem. In meetings with Kenney, press releases, and lobbying efforts, PINAY links running out of time to the high incidence of abuse within employers' homes, long processing delays for the issue of a new work permit when an LCP worker changes employers, ghost employers, and employer-specific work permits. Abusive employers make live-in placements unbearable for the LCP workers they hire. Employers sometimes terminate placements on unjust grounds, such as for becoming pregnant, getting sick, taking time off to grieve for family members, etc. The lack of regulation and protection and the bureaucratic difficulty in redressing these situations often leaves them little choice but to quit. For example, during my fieldwork, I met two LCP migrants, Pilar and Twinny, both of whom had long-standing complaints to the labour board about outstanding unpaid wages. Both women were encouraged to complain through a migrant activist organization and were frustrated that their employers had not responded to the complaint. The measures of enforcement for the complaints at the labour board must not be very strong, as neither employer had as of yet paid the owed wages.

The long waiting time for the processing of new work permits when LCP workers decide to quit one placement to look for another was a major source of frustration and insecurity among the women I interviewed. If an LCP worker quits working for the employer whose name appears on her work permit, she is not legally allowed to work until a new work permit is approved with a new employer, since LCP work permits are employer-specific and LCP participants are not allowed to work in any domain outside of live-in care work. In fact, when LCP workers stop working for the employer on their work permit, they are technically without immigration status in Canada, meaning the benefits they contributed to while working such as employment insurance, maternity leave, and health care are no longer available to them (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley, and Cheung 2004: 27). Given the program time limit, the prospect of waiting months,<sup>3</sup> to have a valid LMO,<sup>4</sup> (Labour Market Opinion) for a new employer processed can seem less attractive than sticking with an abusive employment situation, especially when the ultimate goal of family sponsorship is at stake.

PINAY and various other Filipina activist organizations in Canada lobby to change the structure of the LCP so that LMOs are occupation-specific rather than employer specific. That way, LCP participants will be less likely to be caught in the insecure position of

---

<sup>3</sup> As of November 14, 2008, requests for new employers from temporary foreign workers were given priority by Citizenship and Immigration Canada over requests for work permit extensions (Tilson 2009). Before 2008, it was typical to wait four to six months to have the work with a new employer count towards the 24 months of live-in care work required to gain permanent residency status in Canada. Under the new administrative prioritization, wait times for new labour market opinions LMO (work permits) are reported to be typically less than one month (Tilson 2009).

<sup>4</sup>Prospective LCP employers fill out Labour Market Opinion form so the Canadian Government can assess the impact of the foreign worker on Canada's labour market and what effect granting entrance to the foreign worker would have on Canadian jobs.

being unemployed and unable to work until a new LMO has been signed.<sup>5</sup> The Canadian government adheres to its decision to issue work permits that are employer specific:

Removing employer-specific work permits would [] prevent Canadians from ensuring that employers are not seeking to replace Canadians with Temporary Foreign Workers (TFWs) and that new TFWs are not entering the country when others are available. Furthermore, TFWs must understand the temporary context of their authorization to remain and work in Canada: when unemployed and unable to find employment, they are expected to return home at the end of their authorized stay” (Government of Canada 2009).

The subtext of this statement is clear: temporary foreign workers are only granted access to Canada to fill vacant job opportunities when it is advantageous to the Canadian economy.

It is common for caregivers to discover upon their arrival in Canada that the employer they were promised on their LMO and work permit has either disappeared or hired another more recent arrival through the same agency. Agencies are able to justify such practices to their citizen clients looking to hire a caregiver based on the long processing delays for caregiver applications. Agencies ask Canadian families wishing to hire a caregiver for immediate or pressing child or elder care needs to sponsor a caregiver waiting in the queue in the Philippines, whom they will never hire. The agency then sets the family up with a recent immigrant already in Canada – sponsored by another family who went through an identical process. Elsa, who was sponsored by a family contact who had no intention of hiring her, explained the phenomenon of ghost employers:

---

<sup>5</sup> Even if LMOs were occupation-specific instead of employer-specific, the LCP would still be discriminatory for restricting access to the Canadian labour market (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 79).

*Elsa:* If you're eligible to sponsor someone, you will sponsor someone. But when the person comes here, they cannot wait a year or so for the caregiver to come, so they can just say, 'oh I already found someone, I'm not gonna wait a year'. You could ask someone to sponsor you, but it doesn't mean you're gonna work for that person. It's just a means to enter Canada.

LCP participants sponsored by a ghost employer have no choice but to wait until the agency places them with another family. Sometimes, LCP workers must go through numerous interviews and unpaid trial days before they get hired.

Lith commented on her feelings of insecurity and unease when she first arrived and discovered that her employer was a "ghost" and had to work with another employer without papers until the processing of her new LMO and work permit was complete.

*Lith:* The woman at the agency gave me a new employer to work without papers. But of course for me because I always think, 'legal'. Because in coming to Canada, I am legal. So how come that I am here and I become illegal? That is the situation for us that is very difficult for us to understand. No choice. We cannot go back right away to our place!

Lith's comments capture the limited choices caregivers face when they use agencies to broker their entrance and acquisition of work in Canada. Her reflections point to the deception and misinformation that can characterize the first few months of stay in Canada, when caregivers typically lack networks and access to resources to help them out of dubious situations. Lith's attainment of permanent residency was delayed by waiting for an employer upon arrival and by working for a number of months without an LMO.

Kenney's extension of the time period within which LCP workers can attempt to complete 24 months of live-in work does little to assuage the real obstacles that impede LCP workers from finishing on time. These include: lack of regulation of abuse and



inadequate protection, long processing delays for LMOs, ghost employers, and employer-specific work permits. PINAY – in line with other LCP worker activist organizations across the country – suggest the following changes to make it easier for LCP workers to finish on time: increase regulation of abuse and better channels for retribution, shortening the processing delays for new LMOs, regulating and disciplining agencies into fairer practices, and issuing LCP workers occupation-specific work permits. PINAY president Evelyn’s comments on the changes bring to life how the switch from 36 months to 48 months does little to improve the lives of PINAY members who live-in as domestic workers.

*Evelyn:* All during the week, they are living in and then they feel like they are tied – they are in jail, that's what they say. What did we do that the minister has to extend our jail term from three years to four years? What did we do?

### **2.3.2. Travel and recruitment fees**

The April 2010 changes transfer the costs of migration from the LCP worker to their employers but it is unlikely that employers will actually shoulder the travel and recruitment costs incurred in LCP workers’ migration. In Canada, a well-established infrastructure of nanny agencies exists that charge applicants up to \$5,000 to arrange migration. Since these agencies are largely unregulated by the Canadian government, Kenney’s changes have not changed the way they operate. New arrivals to Montréal I met after April 2010 still paid agencies to arrange their migration and had not seen any form of reimbursement from their employers for their expenses.

### **2.3.3. Medical and Workers' Compensation**

Similar to the travel and recruitment costs, it is doubtful that the new requirement for employers to pay LCP workers' medical and workers' compensation insurance will be adopted to benefit even a minority of caregivers.<sup>6</sup> No regulatory measures have been rolled out to accompany the new requirement. The need for adequate, secure, and complete medical coverage for LCP workers can be seen in the statistics collected by PINAY in their survey of 148 women. Only 8% of those surveyed received any additional health benefits beyond provincial health care (like medical, dental, and optical) (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley, and Cheung 2004: 26). About half of the respondents were interested in getting coverage for additional services and were willing to pay to achieve them (26).<sup>7</sup>

Regardless of whether or not the changes have taken effect in the lives of caregivers, the logic behind their design sheds light on the maternalist (paternalist) configuration of the relationship between caregivers and employers to which the Canadian government subscribes. The practice of giving caregivers gifts, hand-me downs, days off, or vacations instead of overtime pay is sometimes referred to as "maternalism." The feminine attributes of employers (caring, nurturing, and empathy) are used to place the citizen employer in a position superior to the non-citizen employee. Since the employee has no way of reciprocating gifts from her employer – who uses material objects in a consumer

---

<sup>6</sup> PINAY is lobbying to have LCP workers immediately covered by Medicare upon arrival (in Quebec, a three-month waiting period still applies) and to secure coverage for immigrants on open work permits or who are applying for permanent residency (PINAY 2008: 24).

<sup>7</sup> PINAY gathered information on this because they were interested in providing members with the option of contributing to a shared health insurance policy, to reduce the cost of private insurance for individual members. While no such plan has been undertaken by the organization, small efforts are made to protect caregivers. For example, at PINAY's general assembly, an ophthalmologist offered to bring her equipment to the Immigrant Worker's Center once a month to perform free eye exams on PINAY members.

class out of the reach of what an LCP workers' salary could afford – caregivers sometimes feel obligated to perform extra hours of work around the house to show their appreciation (Bakan and Stasuilis 1997: 13). Maternalism is written into the language of the LCP; in official CIC and HRSDC documents addressed to employers, it is common to see the phrase: “your caregiver” (HRSDC 2011). The possessive pronoun placed in front of the word “caregiver” supports a relationship of dependency and ownership over the migrant worker’s person. Maternalism “permits employers to exercise a degree of control over the lives, personhood, and autonomy of household workers considered unthinkable in most public employment situations” (Bakan and Stasuilis 1997: 13). Kenney’s 2010 changes to the LCP give the employer control over the medical and insurance needs of the employee, furthering the relationship of patronage and dependence characteristic of maternalism.

#### **2.3.4. Second Medical Exam Victory**

The elimination of the second medical exam comes after persistent organizing and protesting of Filipina women’s groups across Canada in defense of Juana Tejada. Juana developed cancer while working in Toronto as a caregiver and was denied permanent residency upon failing her second medical exam. Before the December 2009 changes, permanent residency was contingent upon a clear bill of health pronounced during a second medical examination after finishing 24 months of live-in work. The second medical exam – like the pre-screening Canada undertakes for all migrant applicants – was institutionalized to protect Canada’s healthcare system from becoming overtaxed by the health issues of non-citizens.

Juana's advocates argued that the Canadian health care system should not deny responsibility for the healthcare needs of women who had worked in the country for more than two years. The structural and systemic violence wrought through demoralizing housework and family separation damages LCP workers' health and causes mental stress, depression, and alienation (Spitzer and Torres 2008: 17). Juana's health deteriorated every day the Canadian government delayed rectifying her case. The elimination of the second medical exam is a huge victory in the fight for caregiver rights that PINAY members pointed to with feelings of pride and accomplishment.

The second medical exam placed caregivers' access to the welfare state under proviso and reveals the conditionality with which they are incorporated into Canadian society.

Welcomed into the country to work as caregivers, they are excluded as soon as they themselves need care. The second medical exam grew out of Canadian immigration discourse, which "has been framed from the vantage point of self interest, as defined by old-timers' predisposition of the type of newcomers to Canada that would advance or harm its national interests" (Li 2003b).

The LCP changes disguise this ideology by burying it deeper into the architecture of the program, but the evidence of immigration policies that prioritize the extraction of labour for the benefit of the Canadian economy over humanitarian objectives remains visible. As CIC reiterates whenever the live-in requirement of the LCP comes under fire, the LCP is a demand-driven program designed to meet a labour shortage of Canadian workers willing to provide 24-hour on-call live-in work. By placing workers in a precarious and isolated position away from their families, the LCP demonstrates that "the interests of

immigrant sending countries and of global inequality and redistribution are seldom considered” in Canadian immigration policy (Li 2003b).

Kenney’s changes fail to address the fundamental critique brought against the LCP by PINAY: that the live-in requirement should be abolished because it violates human rights and that the program should be occupation-specific rather than employer-specific. Such changes would reduce the dependency of LCP participants on their employer and eliminate abuse because caregivers would have more security to quit abusive jobs and look for a new placement.

#### **2.4 PINAY: THE FILIPINO WOMEN’S ORGANIZATION IN QUEBEC**

PINAY, in their own words, “is a Filipino Women's Organization founded in 1991 that works to empower and organize Filipino women in Quebec, particularly Filipino domestic workers.” Most of its 200 members (of which about 25 are active in organizing and regularly attending events) are migrant workers under the Live-In Caregiver Program (LCP). During the eight months I volunteered with PINAY, I observed how the organization provided loving support to members and advanced campaigns that defend the rights of caregivers. I also saw the executive’s endless dedication to creating a vibrant, politically aware, and welcoming community.

At almost every PINAY event, participants bring food for a potluck meal and breaks are given to encourage chatting and sharing between members. These events form the backbone of members’ social support networks, especially for those enduring family separation. The bonds of friendship and mentorship that form between members are so strong that they usually extend beyond PINAY events alone. Lith threw a party to

celebrate the arrival of her family to Canada in the Immigrant Workers' Center (PINAY's headquarters) and invited numerous PINAY members. Before and after PINAY events, smaller groups of members went together to church, birthday parties, or baptisms. Cars coming from the West Island or Châteauguay to the Immigrant Workers' Center in Côte-des-Neiges were always full of extra passengers in need of a lift.

#### **2.4.1 Dissident citizenship**

PINAY's activities and mission are well captured by Sparks' notion of dissident citizenship, "the practices of marginalized citizens who publically contest prevailing arrangements of power by means of oppositional democratic practices that augment or replace institutionalized channels of democratic opposition when those channels are inadequate or unavailable" (1997: 75). Filipina caregivers are marginalized both by their temporary status as non-citizens in Canada and by the stigma, stereotypes, and racism they encounter as an outgrowth of their position in society and occupation.

The word "public" is key to the definition of dissident citizenship and its specific application to live-in caregivers in Montréal. Isolation is written into the structure of the LCP, which requires caregivers to live in their employers home and work long hours in the absence of coworkers. The channels of democratic opposition are not available to Filipina caregivers in Montréal because of their non-citizen status. LCP workers often assume they are excluded from unemployment insurance, legal aid, the labour board, overtime pay, and police protection. The PINAY executive constantly reminds caregivers that they can and should use these channels to demonstrate their presence in Canada and as a way of standing up for their rights.

*Twinnny:* Evelyn told me yes I should complain because it's legal. She said 'why would there be an opportunity to complain if it's not for you?'

Dissident citizenship replaces the traditional mechanisms of democratic action such as voting, lobbying, or petitioning with efforts to create alternative public spaces through actions like marches, protests, picket lines, sit-ins, speeches, strikes, and street theatre (Sparks 1997: 75). PINAY combines elements of both traditional and alternative mechanisms of democratic action because some members are full Canadian citizens. Older members encourage newcomers to join them in traditional democratic action, as was the case during a conversation between PINAY president Evelyn and Escada.

*Escada:* Evelyn told me, 'why don't you quit right away, Escada? You have the right.' But I say 'I am newly arrived here, I don't know everything I don't know nothing, I am always scared, that's it.' That's why. So hard.

Sparks' emphasis on courage here is especially relevant, as it takes getting over one's fears of being fired or deported to contest the unjust conditions under which caregivers are expected to work. New arrivals were sometimes not yet ready to consider the advice from older members to be unafraid to speak up, quit, or to switch employers. In the context of the LCP, quitting takes courage because of the insecurity of long waiting times and extra agency fees for processing a new labour market opinion and finding a new employer.

PINAY activities can be classified into four groups: political activism, social activities, support services, and education.

### 2.4.2. Political activism

PINAY's political activism focuses on changing discriminatory policies in both the Philippines and Canada through petitions, vigils, letter-writing, research, human rights cases, and campaigns to change working standards for caregivers. While I volunteered with PINAY, they were challenging the exclusion of domestic work from the legal definition of work in Quebec labour standards and the corresponding lack of CSST coverage for caregivers. Several actions were also planned to protest against the illegal detainment of 43 health care workers,<sup>8</sup> in the Philippines who were arrested while providing free health care in the shantytowns of Manila. These included a candle-lit vigil, an online petition, and movie screenings. Fournon and Glick Schiller might call these activities expressions of "long-distance nationalism," since they are political projects towards nation-building across borders (2001: 23). Long-distance nationalism tends to be expressed enthusiastically by individuals who feel their legal citizenship in the host country does not give them full protection of the law or by new migrants encountering difficulty in securing citizenship (23).

In the context of exclusion from Canadian citizenship, interest and activism directed at the Philippines demonstrates the political rights of Filipina caregivers in the Philippines and reflects their nationalist identity (Parreñas 2001: 1142) The vigil I attended for the 43 health care workers with about twenty PINAY members at a park in Côte-des-Neiges in front of a statue of José Rizal,<sup>9</sup> appropriated public space in the park and displayed "Filipino-ness." Petitioning against the unjust actions of the Filipino government may further entrench exclusion from Canadian society (Parreñas 2001: 1142) and taking up

---

<sup>8</sup> Also known as the Morong 43.

<sup>9</sup> A Philippine national hero.



public park space may not be an overt form of resistance (Constable 1997: 166), but the performance of public lives informed about the goings on in the Philippines allows caregivers to negotiate an identity beyond that of “nanny” and the stereotypes associated with it.

For three years, PINAY has been pursuing a human rights case against an agency in Montréal that recruited women from the Philippines to work as caregivers for employers who had no intention of hiring them. The agency charged the caregivers exorbitant fees for the processing of their immigration papers and coerced them into signing a year-long lease for overcrowded and low-quality housing that the agency itself owned. Women slept many to a room in these accommodations and were expected to provide unpaid domestic help to the agency owners in their house and office. The Quebec Human Rights Commission threw out the case because the man who ran the agency passed away. PINAY is currently in the process of contesting the decision with the help of pro bono lawyers and law students. PINAY and its legal help collected testimonies from close to thirty women to build the case.

### **2.4.3. Social Activities**

Constable observed Filipina domestic helpers in Hong Kong doing social activities to help them forget their employment and class status as maids but downplayed the substantive impact these social activities can have on “the public meanings or conditions associated with their work” (Constable 1997: 206). This is in line with her focus on the ways in which Filipina domestic workers in Hong Kong are placed in a field of discursive power that intermittently and unevenly disciplines them into acquiescence with exploitative expectations (203). I argue that the social activities PINAY organizes do

much more than distract LCP workers in Canada from the harsh realities of their working lives; they contest negative stereotypes about Filipinas in Montréal and provide a space for LCP workers to organize and imagine collective agency (Barber 2010: 142). Since live-in caregivers are isolated within the home, they lack access to socialized workplaces where class-consciousness can emerge, pointed to by Marx and Engels as crucial to triggering revolution (1848: 7). PINAY events go beyond the consequences Constable outlines because they constitute a collective space with the potential for militancy against flawed immigration policies and prejudices against caregivers.

Many PINAY activities take place in public such as apple picking, rock climbing, trips to the waterslides or Ottawa for migrant advocacy conferences. Seeing a group of Filipina women together outside of work hours and their employers' neighbourhoods works against the convention of keeping domestic workers hidden. Further, access to family is restored during these events because PINAY members who have succeeded in sponsoring their children and spouses to come to Canada attend as a family. The sight of a Filipina woman caring for her own child, or for her friend's child challenges the trope of the brown woman pushing a white baby in a stroller. These public social events allow Filipina caregivers to experience the city and for the city to experience them very differently from their day-to-day experience while at work.

Constable writes that birthday parties, pageants, and cultural performances are a type of everyday resistance that lacks the potency necessary to affect substantive changes in the lives of domestic helpers in Hong Kong. "Their everyday forms of resistance are geared toward surviving the situation with their sense of humanity intact" (206). Barber configures the interplay between complicity and the type of political resistance that holds

the potential to bring about real change differently; she observes that they do not cancel one another out and can in fact play out in tandem in the lives of isolated service workers (2010: 146).

#### **2.4.4 Support Services**

PINAY provides members with support services that include referrals, legal support, and accompaniment at court hearings, in negotiations with employers, and in dealings with the rental board. These services are usually the gateway to membership. Through the network of Filipina caregivers, word spreads about the help that Evelyn and PINAY can extend to those in trouble.

Escada used PINAY's accompaniment services for the five court dates she has had since her employer accused her of stealing jewelry.

*Shannon: How did your life change after you became a member of PINAY?*

*Escada: Oh I changed a lot since I know PINAY because you know Evelyn, every time I go to the court, I go to the lawyer, she is always with me.*

*Shannon: Evelyn always encourages people to stand up for their rights. Has that helped you?*

*Escada: Since I know her, I feel I am safe, I am secured, I feel I am strong because she gives some advices. And she tells me 'oh Escada, don't think that you will be in jail soon'. Because I say, 'Oh Tita (auntie), I felt when I slept in the jail, that was my last night.'*

Escada spent a night in jail following the unwarranted intrusion of her employer into her home looking for supposedly stolen jewelry.<sup>10</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup> Escada told me she never stole anything from her employer and that the jewelry her employer claims to have found at Escada's apartment is actually Escada's.

## 2.4.5 Education

PINAY organizes orientation sessions for new members on Philippine history, women's rights, and the LCP. The newsletter they produce is also part of their efforts to educate members so they will understand their situation in a wider context of global politics and economy. Evelyn thinks this type of education is key to caregiver rights and empowerment of members because it will spark curiosity to seek more knowledge.

*Evelyn:* Going back to school, developing their knowledge. Because to us, if you stay stagnant with your knowledge, you don't learn, you don't develop, you become easy to victimize. So if you go out and forget about the fear, you'll be strong enough to assert your rights... We at least want them to know what is PINAY so at least they will know how to explain it and then we have a women's orientation about the Filipino women, how is the history of Filipino women's oppression based on our society so they can understand. They could have an insight on why do we have these kinds of feelings.

Elsa looks back on her early years as a caregiver in Montréal and realizes how much she has learned about her rights from her involvement with PINAY. Elsa's reflections, read in a Marxian social theory context, speak to the emergence of class consciousness among migrant workers and the potential for class action this entails (Barber 2010: 146).

*Elsa:* I joined PINAY and I started to learn my rights, my hours, what's supposed to happen, what's not supposed to happen.... There was one incident I almost fell off the windows because I was cleaning the windows. I realized why do the neighbours have someone to come to clean their windows and I am busting my ass to clean the windows and I almost fell? And then I heard from Evelyn that caregivers are not covered by CSST because they are working in a home, CSST says it's fine, it's not that dangerous. So when I would start talking back to my employer – not talking back, but answering back – like trying to tell her what I feel, she didn't like it. The first time we had an interview to renew my contract after a year, she felt upset that I had learned so much in a

year from Evelyn. She didn't like it at all. I told her that if I'm going to work, I should be paid every hour. She didn't like it.

Elsa became more familiar with the shape of her exploitation through her involvement with PINAY, which strained her relationship with her employer. The knowledge she gained about her situation furnished her with the courage to speak up to her employer to negotiate a fairer hourly wage.

#### **2.4.6 Recruitment**

PINAY members frequently reach out to those they think may be in need of Evelyn's expertise and a support network through a Filipina women's association. Twinny first heard about Evelyn on the train to work from another caregiver.

*Twinny:* I heard of Evelyn on the train (to Blainville). Another girl who was involved with PINAY told me about it on the train.

Tess' permanent residency application has been placed under review because her daughter is handicapped. Dismayed by the thought of not being able to reunite with her family after so many years apart from them in Canada, Tess reached out to a woman at her church. This woman told Tess about PINAY.

*Tess:* I talked to a woman from my church and she told me about PINAY. Evelyn is helping me now to get approved on humanitarian and compassionate grounds.

### **2.5. PINOYVILLE: THE CÔTE-DES-NEIGES NEIGHBOURHOOD OF MONTRÉAL**

The Côte-des-Neiges (CDN) neighbourhood provided the setting for my research.

Located to the northwest of the city center, well connected by bus and metro to downtown and the wealthy areas that tend to hire caregivers, it is a densely populated area of

Montréal organized in low-rise apartment buildings and duplexes. CDN is one of the most ethnically diverse areas of Montréal, but a few blocks of Van Horne Avenue and Victoria Avenue are nicknamed “PinoyVille” by Montréalers. This is where the heart of the Filipino community in Montréal resides. The density of the Filipino community in the area was conveyed to me by many of the people I interviewed, who informed me that CDN is home to 12,000 Filipinos. In 2006, Statistics Canada reported that there were 17,100 Filipinos living in Montréal, 6,390 men and 10,715 women. These numbers are probably conservative estimates because they do not count undocumented Filipinos who lack official immigration status. Dozens of Filipino bakeries, stores, video rental shops, fruit vendors, and hair salons flank the streets of PinoyVille. The headquarters of FAMAS, the Filipino Association of Montréal and Suburbs is located at Van Horne and Victoria, right across the street from the PINAY headquarters at the Immigrant Workers’ Center.

I was curious to know how my interviewees felt about Côte-des-Neiges as the newspapers I was studying focused on the neighbourhood. Advertisements in the *Post* and the *Star* for restaurants and other businesses were almost invariably located within the bounds of PinoyVille, write-ups about community events in the neighbourhood comprised the stock of much of the newspapers’ content, and the Mayor of the Borough Michael Applebaum was frequently interviewed about projects to beautify the streets or roll out new afterschool programs for youth. If the *Montreal Pinoy Post*, the *North American Filipino Star*, and the *Filipino Forum* were ethnic newspapers, they could just as easily be classified as neighbourhood papers. They spoke to the experience of living, shopping, and

spending leisure time in Côte-des-Neiges. Papers were distributed almost exclusively in the Filipino businesses in Côte-des-Neiges.

All of the women I interviewed occupied a secondary residence other than their employers' home. Five of the women chose to rent apartments in Côte-des-Neiges. For Lith, Côte-des-Neiges provided a landing strip for her in Canada where it was easier to adjust to how her life had changed since she migrated.

*Shannon: Do you like the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood?*

*Lith:* Yes, I like the neighbourhood because all are Filipino, so it's not hard to adjust because a lot of Filipinos, you know, the same culture. But now I adjust, a little bit adapt Canadian culture.

Evelyn doesn't live in Côte-des-Neiges but felt at home there and always brought out of town visitors to the area so they could have a taste of PinoyVille.

*Evelyn:* I like being in Côte-des-Neiges. I like the atmosphere, you feel at home. There's a street that mostly who lives there in apartment buildings are Filipinos. And you can hear another one talking to the other one on the other side of the road and it's loud: "HIYA". Even Filipinos who just come here and visit from other provinces and we take them to the CDN area, they say, 'oh my god it's like I'm in Kyapo!' It's an area of Manila where there's a lot of people in that center. Anytime you turn your head, it's a Filipino who is behind you.

Escada thought the neighbourhood was friendly and liked being able to pick up Filipino products easily. It reminded her of home and helped with homesickness.

*Shannon: Some people say CDN is like Little Manila – do you think that's true?*

*Escada:* Yes. Because you can see all your products, all the foods you want. Because sometimes you miss all that Filipino products.

Some women I spoke to did not have the same positive opinion towards Côte-des-Neiges. Tess was too tired when she got home from work to find energy to go out and interact with her neighbourhood. She preferred to stay home and watch bootlegged copies of the previous day's programming on a Filipino channel or to talk with her family. Piedad had a similarly restricted interaction with Côte-des-Neiges, and admitted that she really only ever explored when she was shopping for Filipino products or going out to eat Asian food.

Elsa, who lives in the West Island of Montréal, regarded Côte-des-Neiges with some trepidation because of her negative experience with gossip there.

*Elsa:* When I used to live in Laval and I had friends in CDN. I used to hear stories about me from people I even don't know. People make up stories about you, and people will take it – oh I heard you're a bad girl, I heard you're like this, you're like that.

Elsa is an outsider in Côte-des-Neiges. Unlike many other PINAY members and caregivers who live with other caregivers in small apartments while they wait to be reunited with their families, Elsa created a family of her own prior to finishing the 24 months of the LCP with her Québécois husband in the West Island. Her hostility towards Côte-des-Neiges and the gossip that circulates within no doubt flows from her position as an outsider.

For Cate, the Filipina-American journalist I interviewed, the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood helped her to take ownership of her Filipina identity while she was an undergraduate student at McGill University. Cate shared with me that the Filipino aspects of her identity were stifled by an upbringing in a small, mostly white town in the States and a mother who downplayed their Filipino-ness. When Cate moved to Montréal to go to



university and stumbled upon the Côte-des-Neiges, it was the first domino in a process of reclaiming her Filipina identity and exploring the root causes of her mother's trauma as an immigrant Filipina in the US.

*Shannon: Was Côte-des-Neiges the first Filipino neighbourhood that you'd wandered into?*

*Cate: Yeah. I kind of grew up feeling like the Philippines was a dirty secret, no one talks about it. So it was sort of like a lightning bolt when I walked into this neighbourhood and I saw a big sign that said "Balikbayan boxes."<sup>11</sup> I was like, 'woah I know what that is.' I would just go to buy Filipino pastries, because it's where you can get Filipino food in Montréal.*

Some women who came through the LCP find comfort and familiarity in the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood, for others, it is a place that inspires ambiguous feelings.

## **2.6 CONCLUSION**

In this chapter, I have introduced the field site I learned from for eight months. My thesis looks at PinoyVille, PINAY, LCP workers, the *Post* and the *Star* to answer the question: what is the role of media in the lives of LCP workers in Montréal? It is to this topic that I now turn in chapter three.

---

<sup>11</sup> For more on Balikbayan boxes, see chapter 4.

## CHAPTER 3            READING AND WRITING FILIPINO NEWSPAPERS IN MONTRÉAL: TRANSNATIONALISM AND ELABORATED IDENTITIES

### 3.1 INTRODUCTION

The media is crucial to understanding how immigrants are perceived in host societies and in tracing the tracks of racism made by invisibilization, misrepresentation, underrepresentation, trivialization, or vilification of minorities in the press. As such, studying how live-in caregivers are portrayed in the mainstream and Filipino news media contributes to citizenship debates on the place of LCP workers within the feminist politics of domestic work and within a skewed immigration policy context.

The section presents two Filipino papers – the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* – in Montréal as transnational objects that elaborate Filipino identity in opposition to the stereotypes that surface from the mainstream press. The impact of their role in creating more rounded and unbounded versions of Filipino identity is curbed by their small circulation within the Filipino neighbourhood of Montréal. The quality of the alternative images they produce – especially in the context of the fight against stereotypes about Filipina women and towards exposing the LCP as racist, sexist, and exploitative – is reduced by the power dynamics that govern the production of discourses within the *Star* and the *Post*. This chapter brings to the fore the ambiguities and tensions between minority and mainstream media. It does so with sustained commitment to analyzing the experience of LCP workers with media, an as yet unexplored area of Canadian research.

While writing on the subject of diasporic Filipino media around the world has been sparse, it tends to emphasize the potential such outlets hold for the exercise of agency within the constraints of live-in work. The few scholars that have taken up the project point to the links between alternative media consumption and production and resistance. Parreñas (2001) demonstrated how the reading and writing of the Filipino diasporic magazine *Tinig Filipino* creates an imagined community of Filipina migrant caregivers, which holds potential for both resistance and constraint.

Similarly, Kama's study of *Manila-Tel Aviv*, an activist magazine run by Israelis with the intention of mobilizing Filipina caregivers points to the potential for empowerment through media use. Kama explores the role of the magazine in assuaging the processes of invisibilization in the lives of domestic workers through public exposure and recognition as writers in *Manila-Tel Aviv*. Taking stock of the harsh realities domestic workers face in Israel through family separation, financial stress, and demeaning work, Kama suggests that participation in the production and consumption of *Manila-Tel Aviv* replenishes emotional reservoirs that help recuperate a fuller sense of self for caregivers (2008: 235).

Ignacio studied an internet news group called soc.culture.filipino where Filipinos in the Philippines and first, second, and 1.5 generation Filipinos in the US, Canada, Australia, Singapore, Austria, Greece, Sweden, and Italy posted their opinions on Filipino identity to a readership of 20,000 "netizens" in 1996 (2005a: 20). Filipinos who posted on soc.culture.filipino created an alternative vision of Filipino identity, which was heterogeneous and fluid (Ignacio 2005a: xxiii). Alternative spaces of opinion making online are portrayed as viable avenues to challenge racialized and gendered images through imagination and shared experience (Ignacio 2005b: 240). Ignacio proposes that

soc.culture.filipino was conceived as a postcolonial and nation-building project to eradicate the damaging traces of American and Spanish colonialism on the Philippines. Gender roles continued to define participation in the newsgroup, as the dominance of male posters and the gender myths their posts endorsed silenced Filipina women and rendered them passive (Ignacio 2005b: 242).

Daly's work on the website she created called pinay.com also attests to the power of alternative media in projects of decolonization that create identities in opposition to mainstream images. The website was designed to represent Filipina identity as fluid, composite, multidimensional, and changing in reaction against the dominance of dating, mail order bride, pornographic, and pen pal sites that a google search for "Filipina" yields (Daly 2005: 226). While alternative media can hold potential for creating inclusive, positive, empowering, heterogeneous, and fluid images of minorities, they can also create stifling discourses mandating 'normal' and problematizing non-mainstream behaviour.

The role of diasporic Filipino media as a discourse dictating how readers act, dress, think, make value judgments, and consume has been pointed to in the literature. In the case of media targeted toward Filipina domestics, Ebron (2000) found that three magazines, *Kabayan*, *Diwaliwan* (published in the Philippines) and *Tining Filipino* (published in Hong Kong) discipline readers to mimic the image of the "demure, ladylike, and hardworking" Filipina.

Ebron quotes from a letter to the editor of these publications by a domestic worker in Rome that reveals how diasporic media discourses can shape readers into trustworthy and responsible workers (2000: 20). The domestic worker wrote that the magazine

“encourages us to always practice devotion to duty coupled with honesty, because I am not only representing my name, but also my country” (21). The role of diasporic magazines in producing quiet, inconspicuous subjects hidden behind the closed doors of their employers’ homes draws our attention to the sinister potential of alternative media. This stems from the recognition that power politics are at play in all media, regardless of their status as peripheral to the mainstream.

Ethnic media create discourses that sanction certain behaviours and discourage others.

The media are an apparatus of dominant groups in creating discourses that offer a toolkit for thinking about the world while obstructing alternative viewpoints. Discourses create spaces where only certain things can be said or even imagined (Escobar 1995: 12).

Discourse is the material from which the expressive part of hegemony is fashioned (Kalb 2005) and as such media discourses contribute to hegemonic ways of acting, interpreting, and being for immigrant readers of ethnic news media. Shi maintains that, “media discourses draw individuals to interpret their daily actualities with the alienated constructs of power and to subordinate their experienced world to the categories of ruling” (2009: 599). For example, a Chinese daily newspaper ran an article urging readers to pay attention to how they dress in the US that included advice on matching the colours of one’s shoes and socks (Shi 2009: 607). Articles like this elevate dominant cultural norms, denigrate divergent ways of dressing, and introduce working class women readers to the ways in which they are expected to perceive and represent themselves (607).

Media studies have left the ways in which immigrant media create discourses largely unexamined. The *de facto* portrayal of the immigrant press as alternative to the mainstream press has arisen in the literature from the lack of recognition of the

differences between publications under the immigrant press category (Shi 2009: 599). My decision to analyze two Filipino newspapers in Montréal came about in response to the imperative to look for evidence of variety and divergence between ethnic media publications.

The work of Parreñas (2001), Kama (2008), Ignacio (2005) and Daly (2005) points to the ways in which alternative media has been used by Filipinos around the world in projects of transnational resistance, empowerment, and postcolonialism. Ignacio's and Daly's work examines how participatory online media can be used in projects of decolonization and toward the formation of self-generated identities. Shi and Ebron's work calls attention to how working class women within the ethnic 'communities' are addressed in the immigrant press through discourse that endorses specific ways of being an immigrant in a new place.

The questions I formed about the *Star* and the *Post* follow from the conclusions drawn from these studies. Do caregivers use the *Post* and the *Star* in performances of transnational resistance? Does being in the news, writing the news, or reading the news contribute to LCP workers' attempts at empowerment? Are stereotypes of Filipinos in the mainstream Montréal news reversed or perpetuated in the *Post* and the *Star*? What kinds of behaviours do the *Post* and the *Star* sanction through the discourses they create and what kinds of behaviours are marginalized?

### **3.2 ACTIVE, CREATIVE AUDIENCES**

My project subscribes to the portrayal of audiences as active, discerning, and creative bodies that change media meanings through the act of consumption. This theoretical

position is reflected in my methodology, which balanced content analysis with reception studies through the interviews I did with LCP workers about their opinions on Filipino and mainstream media.

Cunningham and Sinclair point to the paradigm shift that took place in media studies from assuming meanings are imposed towards recognizing the agency of the audience in shaping these meanings (2000: 4) This paradigm shift challenged the idea that mainstream media discourses were hegemonic in ‘othering’ minority cultures, a phenomenon numerous studies have attempted to demonstrate (Ojo 2006, Jiwani 1998, Fleras and Kunz 2001, Tufte 2001). Mahtani points to the way that people without political power develop their own readings of and uses for mainstream cultural products – in fun, in resistance, or to articulate their own identity (2001: 113). Consumers of mass media actively interpret, perceive, and determine the meanings of media representations.

For the women I spoke with, news served various functions. Some consumed news to search for a reflection of themselves: they scanned papers for a tidbit about the lives of the Filipina labour diaspora working as domestic helpers.

*Tess:* I would like to see more articles about caregivers. I would like to know what the changes were to the LCP.

Some used the news to gain information about the Philippines and to stay connected to the places they left behind.

*Pilar:* I like to read news about the Philippines. The root cause of why we’re leaving and migrating is because of the politics over there. I feel the need to know what’s going on there.

Pilar, who lives in Toronto and is involved with activist migrant groups InCite and Gabriella, places her media consumption in the context of her politics.

Some of the women I interviewed demonstrated no interest in reading news – regardless of whether the source was a mainstream newspaper or a Filipino newspaper.

*Shannon: Do you read any other kinds of newspapers?*

Escada: No

*Shannon: Watch the news?*

Escada: No

*Shannon: Listen to the radio?*

Escada: No

*Shannon: Internet?*

Escada: No.

*Shannon: So you don't like to know about news from the Philippines?*

Escada: No because it's always the same thing, you know. That there is a big problem in the Philippines, that the president is not okay, Philippines owe money to USA.

Escada chooses not to keep up with news about the Philippines because she is fatigued by the negative portrayals of her home country that “contaminate” her memory (Mahtani 2009: 261). Mahtani introduced the concept of “contaminated memories” to describe the colonization of memories through mainstream media that distort and misrepresent third world countries from which immigrants come to Canada (262).

### **3.3 THE NORTH AMERICAN FILIPINO STAR AND THE MONTREAL PINOY POST**

The *North American Filipino Star* has a long history of media making in the Filipino community in Montréal. The paper has been in existence since 1982. The current editor-



in-chief Zenaida Kharroubi took over the paper's operations from its previous editor in 1997. Kharroubi consistently prints 5,000 copies of a 24-page issue every month, distributed for free in Filipino businesses in Côte-des-Neiges and the West Island where they are very popular. Each issue combines original content from volunteer columnists on world and local issues, accounts of local community events in the Filipino community, articles from newswires in the Philippines covering news in the Philippines, and articles from Canadian newswires covering news in Canada.

The *Montreal Pinoy Post* is a newcomer on the Filipino newspaper scene in Montréal. The first issue was published in April 2009, making the paper two years old at the time of writing. The editor-in-chief, Jayjay T. Villanueva, was for a short period of time on the *Star* board after Kharroubi took over the paper from its previous editor. The *Montreal Pinoy Post* has a circulation of between 3,000 and 7,000 and copies are distributed free of charge in Asian grocery stores and businesses in Côte-des-Neiges, the South Shore, St-Laurent, Toronto, California, on the west coast, and in Winnipeg. The *Post* is run entirely by volunteer writers and editors, features a higher proportion of original content than the *Star*, and makes ends meet through advertising revenue.

The differences between the papers can be grouped into three sections. First, while the *Star* prints articles that entangle it in personal disputes between Fred Magallenes – editor of the *Filipino Forum* – and members of the community, an integral part of the *Post*'s mandate is to avoid taking sides or giving any attention to these disputes. Second, a higher proportion of the articles printed in the *Star* deal specifically with the Philippines or Filipinos in Montréal than the *Post*, which frequently prints articles that deal with other international news or are written for an audience unspecified by Filipino ethnicity. Third,

the *Star* runs more hard news content from newswires than the *Post*, which prints a higher proportion of lifestyle news generated by volunteer columnists.

Three themes emerge from an analysis of the *Star* and the *Post*. First, the papers are transnational objects. Second, the many pages of the papers present an elaborated, well-rounded, fleshed-out, and three-dimensional portrait of Filipino identity and the Filipino experience that works against stereotypes and generalizations. Third, the papers give evidence to the stratification within the Filipino community in Montréal and demonstrate mechanisms of inclusion and exclusion that operate along gender, occupation, immigration status, religious, and class lines.

### **3.4 MAINSTREAM MEDIA**

The images of Filipinos, Filipino-ness, and LCP workers that emerge from the *Post* and the *Star* must be placed in the context of mainstream media in order to interrogate their role in speaking back to mainstream messages. The mainstream media both reflect the reality of LCP work and construct it through representation. Hall argues that representations are formative, not just expressive in the making of everyday realities and opinions. “How things are represented and the ‘machineries’ and regimes of representation in a culture do play a *constitutive*, and not merely a reflective, after the event, role” (Hall 1996: 443).

The media offer their audience a lens through which to see their world, and are responsible for the way that people “interpret, consider and evaluate” Canadian society (Mahtani 2001: 100). Media reports about immigrant-sending countries and immigrants are especially potent in constituting perceptions of immigrant identities in rural and

homogenous areas of the country where residents frequently do not have face-to-face contact with immigrants (Mahtani 2008: 232). The media in Canada saturate public consciousness in all corners of the country and articulate what is important, normal, and acceptable in society (Fleras and Kunz 2001: 47). News media hold a special significance in the making of reality because they are perceived as a source of objective, impartial, and balanced reporting on events in the world (Jiwani 2006: 36).

The mainstream news media in Canada are controlled by the dominant sector of society and tend to advance their interests and normalize their experience by silencing alternative trains of thought and misrepresenting minorities (Fleras and Kunz 2001: 48). Negative portrayals of immigrants in the mainstream media as deviant, disease-carrying, and burdensome to the Canadian economy and health care system, and as irrelevant to the Canadian project of nation-building damage immigrants' self-esteem by making them feel inferior to "real" Canadians (Mahtani 2001: 101). Daly examines Nancy Drew to demonstrate how normalizing whiteness and pathologizing non-whiteness denigrates and negates whole communities of colour. While the Nancy Drew series is not a form of news media, Daly's reflections on the impact of the novels on her own self-esteem illustrate the effects of negative representations. "With whom should I have identified – the smart, fearless girl detective, whom I aspired to be, or the inscrutable Asian, the dark complexioned villainess, or comical "darkie" who looked like me? Given the realities of cultural imperialism and colonial mentality, legacies of my family and culture, these "choices" were never really choices at all" (Daly 2005: 55).

Li points to the ways in which news media in Canada construct national boundaries around territorial space and symbolic/social/cultural space by representing Asian

minorities as potential bearers of infectious diseases, escalating Canadian crime rates, and using Canada as a gateway to illegal migration to the US (Li 2003b). These portrayals divide people who have been in Canada for a long time and newcomers. Exclusion from full citizenship rights is expressed on the basis that immigrants are separate and different from Canadians with full citizenship – “real” Canadians. The under-representation or omission of immigrants from the mainstream media circumscribes their citizenship in Canada through a denial of their contributions to Canadian society and makes believe that they do not exist.

Jiwani construes news media in Canada as a type of symbolic violence based on its tendency to objectify, dehumanize, and inferiorize minorities (2006: 37). She draws a connection between under-representation or misrepresentation of minorities and the official justification of measures that restrict minority or immigrant rights in Canada (37). News media are well positioned to exert symbolic violence because they occupy a position of power, are controlled by people with power, and are used to maintain the dominance of these people and their views (37).

The *Post* arts and culture writer, Veraida shared her dissatisfaction with the negative portrayals of Filipinos in the mainstream news.

*Veraida:* I think, especially from the most recent mainstream news that’s been coming out, it just seems very critical and very negative. It’s hard to really think about anything that we could be possibly proud of. Especially most recently, the thing about the hostage-taking in the Philippines, the police officer that was fired and then took over a bunch of tourists from Hong Kong. The SWAT team really didn’t handle that – at least – it’s portrayed that half of the tourists died. A lot of news about the Philippines is a lot of tragedies. Tragedies, very negative, and it doesn’t make

me feel proud about some of the things that are being portrayed. You don't hear about the good things that may be happening over there, you just hear about the bad things.

Portrayals of the management of a bus of Hong Kong tourists in the Philippines that was held hostage in the summer damaged Veraida's self esteem as a Filipina woman. Her analysis is trenchant in its reiteration that negative news is a portrayal that may not necessarily reflect reality. The mainstream media has a penetrating influence on how immigrants are seen and how they feel about themselves through international news coverage of their home countries.

Evelyn suspects mainstream Canadian newspapers may not be the most suitable or trustworthy ally for a women's activist group struggling to have the LCP amended.

Evelyn: I know that Canadian newspapers are owned by multi-millionaires. I'm sure lots of the people who run the newspapers have caregivers they exploit because they can afford to pay, so who cares about those caregivers?

Neoliberalism has transformed the mainstream news industry in Canada, and now more than ever before news outlets across the country are owned and controlled by powerful and wealthy companies. The content of Canadian newspapers has become increasingly homogeneous in coincidence with the neoliberal deregulation of media markets (Mahtani 2008: 243). In an effort to make even greater profits, media conglomerates have used buy-outs, mergers, take-overs, and closures to reduce operating costs and expand market share (243).

In my final chapter, I examine three articles in the *Montreal Gazette* that ran during the time I did my fieldwork that deal specifically with LCP workers. They contribute to the stereotype that all Filipinas are domestic workers. These articles also portray LCP

workers as third world victims upon whom charity is appropriately extended. By failing to explain the criteria and restrictions of the live-in caregiver program, these reports fail to advocate for LCP workers or make substantial moves towards the improvement of their working conditions.

### **3.5 FILIPINO NEWSPAPERS IN MONTRÉAL**

Canadian research on ethnic newspapers has been fairly limited in volume and poses questions about assimilation less frequently than American research on the subject. Nonetheless, questions about assimilation do arise – often couched with other questions about transnationalism. Focusing on assimilation and integration denies the way transnational connections between the Philippines and Canada continue to define daily lived experiences for Filipino migrants in Montréal through remittance-sending, keeping in touch with overseas relatives, investment in the Philippines, and participation in politics in the Philippines by voting or news consumption. Questions about assimilation arise from conceptualizing immigrants as separate and different from “real” (full-citizen) Canadians and imply that immigrants must change something about themselves in order to be enfolded into the multicultural fabric of the Canadian nation.

Ojo lists the integration of immigrants and minorities into dominant mainstream culture as one of the roles of the *Montréal Community Contact* – an Afro-Caribbean newspaper in Montréal (2006: 353). Sidestepping questions of assimilation and integration, Ojo concludes that ethnic media in Canada serve as cultural interpreters and community resources and grow out of dissatisfaction with the way minorities are represented in the media (358). Fleras’ (2009) research on ethnic and Aboriginal media in Canada poses questions about assimilation and integration, but follows Li’s vision for a more inclusive

approach to integration that values cultural differences as assets “in the building of a global and diverse society” (Li 2003a: 316). Fleras posits that Aboriginal and ethnic media integrate readers into a more inclusive Canada – the diversity of which is contributed to by the newspapers that promote intercultural awareness and exchange (144). Yu and Murray also subscribe to the formulation that immigrant media can both contribute to the expansion of inclusiveness within Canada and provide avenues to integrate into a multicultural society (2007: 101). Yu and Murray portray transnationalism within Korean newspapers in Vancouver as part of projects to encourage “healthy multicultural citizenship and social cohesion” in Canada (101).

My research abandons questions about assimilation and instead focuses on how the *Star* and the *Post* produce translocality in line with the transnational lives of their readers and writers. I present the *Star* and the *Post* as transnational objects that facilitate living across borders.

### **3.5.1 Transnational News**

The *Post* and the *Star* are transnational objects. They blur the boundaries between Montréal (Quebec/Canada) and the Philippines and attest to the webs of social, political, family, and economic ties that connect the daily lives of Montréal Filipinos to the Philippines. The newspapers combine content about Côte-des-Neiges, Montréal, the Philippines, and the Philippine diaspora throughout the world in about equal proportions. Even the names of the newspapers speak to the composite identities that arise when lives are lived transnationally. *The North American Filipino Star* is both Filipino and North American, the *Montreal Pinoy Post* is both a voice for Pinoys and a reflection of life in Montréal.

It is impossible to discern what is local and what is international news within the pages of the *Star* and the *Post*, as the newspapers are not organized as such. Stories about politics, corruption, disasters, and organizing in the Philippines bleed into stories about improvements to Côte-des-Neiges, elections of Filipino community leaders, and reports on community events in Montréal such as picnics, festivals, and parades.

The newspapers report on the transnational pathways through which members of the Filipino community in Montréal circulate. In the *Star* article “First World Filipinos dreaming of a First World Philippines,” Amir Billones points to acts of transnationalism that contribute to the agitating for change in the Philippines including scholarships for students in the Philippines, alumnae fundraising events, disaster relief/aid, and immigration sponsorship (2009: 17). He introduces a new movement of nation-building called Gawad Kalinga that seeks to raise the Philippines from its status as a third world country by putting social conscience before profits. Billones uses his platform within the *Star* to seek support for Gawad Kalinga. Both the *Star* and the *Post* frequently report on natural disasters in the Philippines and use the space of their newspapers to rally readers to make donations to relief funds.

The imagined or real mobility that accompanies lives lived transnationally is represented in the *Post* and *Star*'s sections on tourism and immigration policy news. Every issue of the *Star* features a multiple page article of a tourist destination in the Philippines. The *Post* regularly features a column written by a Filipino travel agent that offers advice when booking a flight “home” – a term which comes to stand in for the Philippines throughout the text of the newspaper. Tourism reporting simultaneously attests to the experience of



migrants in Montréal returning home and feeds the imaginations of those who are unable to leave Canada due to financial or immigration status restrictions.

The *Star* and the *Post* can be construed as transnational in three ways. First, the newspapers are themselves symbols of transnationalism in their structure and content that blur boundaries between the Philippines and Montréal. Second, they offer a window into the transnational activities of readers and writers. Third, they are used as a platform to cement, promote, and facilitate transnational activities.

Lith's comments on her reasons for reading the *Star* and the *Post* indicate that the newspapers satisfy her need for transnational news and encapsulate her worldview.

*Shannon: Do you usually like to read the North American Filipino Star and the Montreal Pinoy Post?*

*Lith: We like to read them because some are news from the Philippines and some news from Filipinos here in Canada. So we would like to know also what's happening with the Filipinos. Even though we are here, we don't know what's happening to Filipinos in Canada.*

Lith expresses interest in exploring what life is like for other Filipinos in Canada alongside her desire to consume Filipino news. The *Star* and the *Post* satisfy this interest of hers.

### **3.5.2 Elaborated Identities**

Often underrepresented, the articles about Filipinos or the Philippines that do occasionally run in the mainstream press are often solitary and couched amid other articles that speak to the experience of “real” full citizen Canadians. The mainstream media fail to speak to the heterogeneity in the Filipino community in Montréal and the variety in their daily

experiences. The *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post*, in contrast offer an elaborated depiction of Filipinos, Filipino-ness, and the Philippines in Montréal in the many pages of their issues. No easy answers emerge from the papers about what it means to be Filipino in Montréal, the immigrant experience, or the Philippines. Instead, the papers are full of contradictions, ambiguities, and variety. Most importantly, articles about Montréal municipal politics, federal elections, and countries in the world other than Canada and the Philippines attest to the various places and issues that form the constellations of power, life, and experience for Filipinos in Montréal. The newspapers capture the layers of the Filipino community, cleaved by the year of arrival in Montréal, birthplace, class, gender, area of origin or heritage in the Philippines, and immigration status. Members of the Filipino diaspora actively engaged in the production of the *Star* and the *Post* resist the imposition of categories of identity upon Filipinos in Montréal through their elaboration in print.

The elaboration of this identity is often positive, which serves to counterbalance negative portrayals of Filipinos in Montréal mainstream news. The pages of the *Post* are explicitly dedicated to showcasing the achievements of Filipino Montréalers, as *Post* editor in chief, Ate Len explained.

*Ate Len:* We wanted to publish a newspaper that would rally more positive news rather than the bad news that we always talk about in our community. The *Pinoy Post* looks more on the achievements of people, the little achievements of people. Highlighting them. Paying tribute to leaders for what they have done.

The pages of the *Post* are often taken up by profiles of admirable Filipino Montréalers, including an award-winning playwright, a beauty pageant organizer, entrepreneurs, and a

doctor who survived Japanese concentration camps during the occupation of the Philippines.

Pilar appreciated the proliferation of stories about Filipino immigrants to Canada and elsewhere in the Filipino newspapers she reads.

*Pilar:* It makes us proud. It's not just another story that Filipinas are just nannies or just domestics. Pilar hints at an idea I explore more deeply in chapter six; the tendency to stereotype Filipina women as nannies or caregivers. For Pilar, reading about a Filipino engineer who made his way back to his career level in the Philippines after starting out at a MacDonald's in Toronto, famous Filipina singers, and Clinton's Filipina nurses were important in forming her own identity as more than "just a maid" (Ebron 2002).

### **3.5.3 Measuring the Power of Ethnic Media**

Filipino newspapers in Montréal are part of a project to make a space for Filipinos in the urban mediascape. Whole issues of Filipino newspapers declare that Filipinos do exist in Montréal. They offer a map of the geographies in the city that are important to them and enumerate their contributions to Canadian society. They also offer a window into the types of goods and services that sustain the migrant economy in Montréal.

Moreover, Filipino media offerings in Montréal recognize the heterogeneity within the category "Filipino." Hall (1996) pointed to the importance of recognizing the "extraordinary diversity of subjective positions, social experiences, and cultural identities that compose the category 'black'" in order to develop a new politics of representation that moves beyond generalizations, simplifications, and racial prejudice (443). A variety of immigrant experiences are represented in the papers and some articles do a good job of

advocating for LCP workers' rights and addressing the precarious economic and immigration status of this sector of the Filipino community.

While the power of ethnic media to change how minorities are represented in the mainstream press is pointed to by Canadian researchers, it is also portrayed as limited because its alternative portrayals tend to circulate within migrant networks and may not reach mainstream audiences. Jiwani stresses that the success of alternative media is crucial to curbing the power of racist portrayals of minority in the mainstream media (2006: 60). Ojo notes that ethnic media can have only a limited impact on Canada's political agenda because they are written by and for only a small segment of the Canadian population (2006: 358). The obstruction of racial stereotypes in the mainstream media initiated by the *Star* and the *Post* is reigned in by their small circulation within the Montréal's Filipino neighbourhood. Fleras also recognized how ethnic media are defined by these dual processes by pointing out that they are both insular and integrative, inward and outward looking (2009: 145).

*Star* editor-in-chief Zenaida's comments about printing a Tagalog section in her newspaper attest to the small segment of Montréalers the *Star* targets.

*Shannon: Did you think it was important to have articles in Tagalog? Because if it's in English, then more Montréalers can read it.*

*Zenaida: Yes but you see we also have to show that we are Filipino by having something in Tagalog, even though people here will not understand it. But we have to recognize that we have this language.*

The majority of both the *Post* and the *Star* are printed in English, making them more accessible to the larger Montréal population than most ethnic newspapers that are

generally printed in languages other than English or French. Zenaida assumes an audience of non-Filipino people when she says that printing some articles in Tagalog will “show that we are Filipino.” She values the showcasing and ownership of the language of the homeland as much as making her paper accessible to non-Filipino Montréalers. The *Star* addresses a segment of the Montréal community and occupies a narrow segment of the city’s media spectrum.

The narrow focus of the *Post* and the *Star* is evidenced in their tendency to cover news and events that take place or concern Côte-des-Neiges. Life in the borough is featured prominently in the newspapers’ content, as articles about FAMAS elections (Filipino Association of Montréal and Suburbs), CDN mayor Applebaum’s investments in the neighbourhood, local dance troupes, transit improvements, and community events are frequently featured. Zenaida explained the *Post*’s geographical focus on Côte-des-Neiges.

*Shannon: Does the Montreal Pinoy Post focus on the Côte-des-Neiges neighbourhood?*

*Zenaida:* I mean there are quite a few sections that do focus on the CDN neighbourhood because that is where most Filipinos live. All Filipinos know where CDN is and that’s where they can even feel more at home because they’re surrounded by their own people and there are a lot of Filipino businesses that are starting to develop there as well.

The potential for the *Post* and the *Star* to have an impact on dominant images of Filipinos in Montréal is curbed by the containment of their content and circulation within the Filipino community in Côte-des-Neiges.

### **3.5.4 Resistance and Empowerment through Filipino Media**

Ethnographic data collected through interviews with nine Filipina caregivers in Montréal reveals that they do not use the *Post* and the *Star* in expressions of transnational

resistance. I framed my inquiry into the role of media in the lives of Filipina caregivers around the potential for transnational resistance through media use based on Parreñas' work on *Tinig Filipino*, a monthly magazine produced in Hong Kong and circulated in more than a dozen countries.

Parreñas makes the connection between transnational media and resistance explicit. *Tinig Filipino* caters to the Filipina diaspora and frequently features articles and letters written about domestic care work or by caregivers (Parreñas 2001: 1131). Writers tend to focus on the realities of transnational family life, difficulties encountered in the workplace and as a result of government regulatory agencies, migration laws, and women's love lives (1132).

The magazine grounds Filipina caregivers' perception of shared experiences of partial citizenship with other caregivers across the globe and constructs the Philippines as 'home' in the imagination of the caregiver diaspora. Imagining the Philippines as 'home' constitutes a kind of resistance against exclusion in receiving countries because it is perceived as the place that caregivers truly belong, where they will enjoy a higher-class status and where they will be relieved from performing domestic work (1138). Filipina migrants turn to home to negotiate their racially segmented integration and also to negotiate their experience of partial citizenship in receiving states (1139).

The substantive impact of the transnational imagination as a political act, however, must not be overstated. The LCP requires that Filipina workers in Canada spend two years living-in with their employers' family, rendering the possibility of ever actually returning to an imagined 'home' remote. The use of the Philippine nationalist identity to expand

their constrained citizenship is thus limited (Parreñas 1142). The politics of imagining may in fact further entrench the partial citizenship of Filipina migrants. “The use of a nationalist identity, while empowering, redirects migrants from claiming their rightful membership in receiving nations” (1142).

The women I spoke to did not use the *Post* and the *Star* in their imaginings of home and in the creation of a Filipina domestic worker diaspora. These modes of resistance were accomplished in other ways: through talking to family members, planning trips home, and participating in PINAY events. Some caregivers I spoke with were not avid readers of the *Post* and the *Star* and were not always interested in the newspapers’ content.

*Shannon: So you don’t read the Montreal Pinoy Post or the North American Filipino Star very often?*

*Elsa: No, not very often. Because when I read it, it’s all like beauty pageants or something like that and I don’t have any interest in them. Some articles I read, it’s not a real story. They’re not going to say anything bad about the community or the government that’s feeding them. When I would read stuff it’s always charity works, activities of the community.*

Elsa critically assesses the quality and content of the Filipino papers on offer in Côte-des-Neiges and decides that she does not wish to keep up with them regularly. Escada told me why she doesn’t read the *Star* or the *Post*.

*Shannon: You don’t read them? How come? Because you don’t like them?*

*Escada: I’m not saying I don’t like it, but if you read this, you see a lot of problems in the Philippines, and then popularity.*

The pain of remembering the economic and political problems of the Philippines was too much for Escada and she removed herself as a spectator in the community feuds featured

in the *Star*. The issue of political disruption and chaos at home and its impact on Filipino people in Montréal is picked up again later in chapter seven. Escada's comment about "popularity" refers to the feuds between *Star* writers and editors and the editor-in-chief of the *Filipino Forum*, and to the high status members of the Filipino community who are sometimes photographed at prestigious events.

When Lith and I were discussing the Filipino papers' frequent coverage of beauty pageants, she demonstrated how media messages are changed by the moment of audience interpretation. Lith agreed that beauty pageants were detrimental to women's empowerment within the community, but refused to let the standards of beauty they set affect her own self-esteem.

*Lith:* I am not to care about the beauty pageants, because I believe that I am beautiful. Even if I am not a beauty, I am beautiful.

Tess and Emmy selected content from within the *Post* and the *Star* that suited their media needs and gathered news from sources other than the Filipino newspapers in Côte-des-Neiges.

*Emmy:* I think if you want to keep updated about your country, you will take this: (points to the *North American Filipino Star*), but if you want to be updated about what's going on in Montréal, you will read the *Gazette*.

*Tess:* I read the *North American Filipino Star*. My sister-in-law passes it to me, and I read it. I like to read the news about the Philippines. But I don't like the pages of celebrity gossip. I only pay attention to the stars that I know. There are many of them that I don't know!

These processes of selection and evaluation of the media available to LCP workers in Montréal attest to the agency of caregivers as a special audience group. The messages of



the *Star* and the *Post* that upset or bore caregivers are resisted when LCP workers refuse to play the role of an audience member.

While caregiver readers do not use the *Post* and the *Star* as modes of transnational resistance, reading and writing for a Filipino newspaper can be empowering in other ways. Veraida, the *Montreal Pinoy Post* arts and culture writer, thinks that writing news for the Filipino community is a way to produce more varied versions of Filipino identity and to counteract stereotypes about Filipina femininity.

*Veraida:* When you write for the *Post*, you set an example to everyone: that you're capable of doing these kinds of things because especially with the stereotypical idea that Filipinas are caregivers, they go into nursing. *The Pinoy Post* is definitely an outlet for people to write. Especially with the young generation that they have that they're part of something that they can belong to.

A sense of belonging to the Filipino community is especially important according to Veraida and membership can be cemented through participation in minority media. Her statement has currency in citizenship debates – explored by Parreñas – on the substantive value of immigrants relying on fuller senses of belonging to the Philippines to curb feelings of exclusion in receiving states. It is debatable whether fostering feelings of belonging to the Filipino community deters efforts to secure fuller citizenship in Canada and Quebec.

Kama's article on *Manila-Tel Aviv*, a magazine run by activists for Filipina caregivers in Israel, points to how pleasure through media production and consumption can be key to empowerment, even in the absence of explicitly political dimensions (2008: 235). Kama concludes that caregivers become empowered through the pleasure they derive from

writing on love and completing puzzles in the magazine (2008). Indeed, other scholars of immigrant and ethnic media have explored the importance of imagination to working class women's consumption of media. Shi writes that the working class Chinese women in her study read newspapers to "look[...] for a view of life that is larger than their daily experiences, so they can be protected spiritually from being consumed by back-breaking routines and suffocating pressure of survival" (603).

One of the reasons Pilar appreciates *The Philippine Reporter* – a Filipino newspaper produced in Winnipeg and circulated throughout the country – is because it offers her avenues to leisure activities that she can afford and fit into her busy life.

*Pilar:* The Philippine Reporter tells you where and how to get cheaper entertainment things if you want to have fun. I would say to myself, I will save money to go to have a chance, to have a break.

### **3.5.5 (Mis)representation in Minority News**

The power dynamics within the *Post* and the *Star* that produce discourses of inclusion and exclusion in the newspapers must be examined. The *Montreal Pinoy Post* and the *North American Filipino Star* produce a profile of the category "Filipino" that includes some and excludes others. The newspapers construct a normative experience of immigrant life in Montréal that silences variety across gender, class, and age lines.

Hall cautioned against celebrating media produced by or about minorities as automatically progressive in anti-racism projects. Any and all media can be used to mask the heterogeneity of interests and identities within bounded categories (Hall 1996: 444). Cunningham and Sinclair (2001) use the framework of media "sphericules," or "subaltern counter publics" (178) to demonstrate the power dynamics at work within the production

of ethnic print media. Ethno-specific sphericules are portrayed as microcosms of the public sphere (180) because of their encapsulation of mainstream power politics. The authors examine how and by whom meaning-making is controlled within ethnic print media. The editors and writers of the *Post* and the *Star* occupy a higher position in Canadian society than LCP workers and tend to address their writing to an imagined audience of full citizen Filipinos in reunited families with some degree of disposable income.

This is seen through the frequent featuring of articles that speak to aspects of the Canadian-Filipino experience that are unattainable to caregivers by virtue of their participation in the LCP. For example, Al Abdon's article on video projects for children lists fun activities for families to engage in while learning about movie making and technology (Abdon 2009: 10). His article portrays cohesive family units, access to which is denied for LCP workers who must separate from their family in order to participate in the program. Similarly, an article in the same issue about enrolling children in sports to encourage healthy development and parenting techniques (Barba 2009: 10) sections readers off into categories of 'have' and 'have not.' That is to say that articles referencing cohesive and reunited families make the lack of family in the lives of LCP workers particularly acute. These articles play another role: they serve to nurture the dreams and aspirations of LCP workers by offering visions of the reunited family that is supposed to follow 24 months of isolating live in care work.

The second way that the *Post* and the *Star* serve to exclude LCP workers is by failing to present the political dimensions of the LCP and using their pages to express compliance with the federal government. Few articles run in the *Post* and the *Star* about LCP

workers, changes to the LCP program, and the ongoing struggles of activist organizations that advocate on their behalf. Instead, the newspapers open their pages to messages from government representatives who are behind the restrictive immigration policies that place LCP workers in precarious citizenship positions. These messages subscribe to immigration myths that undermine transnationalism and the resistance that can stem from it. The *Post* printed a message from the mayor of Montréal, Gerard Tremblay in its September-October 2009 issue. The message fits into a discourse on immigrants that they must be productive and active in Canadian job markets by “quickly and harmoniously intergat[ing] into the social fabric of Montréal” (Tremblay 2009: 2). Tremblay’s message encourages assimilation and fails to recognize the costs and hardship that accompany immigration to Canada. The *Post* aligns itself with this standpoint by printing Tremblay’s message.

Elsa did not feel that the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* represented her experience in Canada as live-in caregiver or did enough to advocate for the rights of LCP workers.

*Shannon: Is there enough about the LCP in these papers? Are they political enough?*

*Elsa: No, not at all. They will not say anything bad about the government or the community.*

More than half of the advertising revenue for the *North American Filipino Star* comes from Scotia Bank and Western Union. One Western Union advertisement features a photo (appendix D) of a smiling Filipina woman pushing a stroller under the heading: “Very Important Pinoy.” The text underneath reads, “I am a caregiver in Vancouver. Through my hard work, I am able to provide for my family’s daily needs in Nueva Ecija. I am also

able to put two of my nephews through school and build a house for my family. I am proud to be a Pinoy in Canada.” (*North American Filipino Star* June 2010: 13).

The advertisement taps into a discourse that normalizes remittance-sending and hard work. This can be reflective of the efforts of Filipinas to assuage the unpleasant aspects of their work and lives in Canada by focusing on long term goals like putting their children through school (Nakano Glenn 1992: 33), as Escada’s comments attest.

*Shannon: What do you think of this ad? (Shannon shows Escada the Very Important Pinoy ad)*

*Escada: (Reads): “I am a caregiver in Vancouver, through my hard work I am able to provide for my family”.... Oh that’s nice! Yeah! That’s all Filipinas’ dream. Yeah the caregiver dream to help the family, to bring the family members to school, even if it’s your niece or nephews – share your daily income to the family. Yeah that’s Filipino.*

The advertisement speaks to Escada’s feelings about being Filipino in Canada and she enthusiastically approves of the ad. But the discourse on remittances and hard work that the ad subscribes to is part of the global processes that create feminized streams of domestic workers in precarious citizenship positions. I will demonstrate in the next chapter that experiences with sending remittances can involve pain, stress, and sadness – which are not reflected in this advertisement.

The advertisement serves the capitalist interests of Western Union, which is making money from the remittance cheques sent from Montréal to the Philippines. Western Union is eager to capture the consumer market made up of Filipino remittance-senders by contracting culturally-specific advertising agencies that will help package their services in a way that is pleasing to immigrant customers (Li & Li 1999).

The appearance of the “Very Important Pionny” ad within the pages of *the North American Filipino Star* aligns the newspaper with an institution that seeks to make profits from LCP workers and their duties to families overseas. As such, the power dynamics at play within the paper are revealed and we can see that the goals of the *Star* do not align with those of PINAY in fighting for LCP rights.

The *Star*'s coverage of the changes to the LCP demonstrate this point. The *Star* ran a press release from the Association of Caregiver & Nanny Agencies Canada (ACNA) criticizing Immigration Minister Jason Kenney's changes to the LCP in its September 2010 issue. The article pointed out that the changes shifted the financial burden of migration from the caregiver entirely to the employer. The opinion stated in ACNA's press release reveals the assumption that caregivers should automatically be grateful to employers for the opportunity to come to Canada. ACNA implies that caregivers should stay with employers for a long time, so employers can see a return on their investment.

Canadian families are vulnerable to applicants who abuse the LCP by coming to Canada at no personal expense, staying long-term and seeking other employment.... Should the caregiver leave, many families struggle to find replacement workers. This can be emotionally and financially taxing, heightened by the fact that families typically assist the caregiver to adapt to Canadian culture, often making a substantial investment of time and dollars to train and teach the employee. (ACNA 2010: 11).

Spoken in financial terms, ACNA makes it clear that caregivers owe their employers something extra in terms of their commitment to staying on with the same family. PINAY

president Evelyn found this article in its original online format (July 5 2010) and wrote an opinion piece rebutting ACNA's stance on the PINAY blog. Here is an excerpt of Evelyn talking back to ACNA.

We find it amazing that these articles cry foul when there is minute change in government policy that gives a little breathing room to already oppressed people from an oppressed nation who are being peddled by their country of origin cheaper than bananas.... Caregivers are being exploited, being used like a milking cow by agencies, sending countries and host countries. Milk that has been loaned from sharks just to help their families and themselves survive...Eighty six percent of newly-arrived caregivers spend six months to a year without work while they look for an employer or wait on work permits that are processed at a snail's pace. Once they do find work, caregivers find themselves working till they drop to keep those milkers living life comfortably (Calugay 2010).

Using inflammatory language and evocative metaphors, Evelyn's rebuttal calls attention to the costs of migration that still apply to caregivers even after Kenney's changes. She also exposes the exploitation that characterizes the working and personal lives of caregivers she met. In doing so, she challenges the colonial mentality that casts Canada and Canadian employers in the benevolent role of giving opportunities to caregivers to leave the Philippines.

Evelyn's reaction to the article printed in the *Star* encapsulates the divergence between PINAY and the newspaper's approach to LCP issues. The *Star* aligns itself with nanny agencies, the government of Canada, and employers by printing ACNA's press release.

Sometimes the *Star* prints useful information about the caregiver program. For example, the *Star* reprinted a press release from the Montréal municipal government on the extension of the LCP program from 36 to 48 months in August 2010. The article was accompanied by a mention of PINAY's services if readers had additional questions about the change and included Evelyn's contact information.

### **3.6 CONCLUSION**

This chapter advances several conclusions about the role of the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* in the lives of Filipina caregivers in Montréal. The Filipino newspapers elaborate transnational Filipino and Filipina identities against the backdrop of misrepresentation in the mainstream news. The potential of the newspapers to affect change in the lives of LCP workers is undercut by the politics of exclusion operating along class lines within the Filipino community in Montréal and the limited distribution range of the papers. Some of the women I interviewed appreciated that the newspapers reflected their transnational lives and elaborate identities. Many critiqued the newspapers for failing to cover LCP workers and their interests and for instead aligning with the government bodies responsible for their precarious status. The variety in responses to the *Star* and the *Post* reflects the diversity within every pocket of the Filipino "community" in Montréal, which is made up of individuals with unique dreams, migration trajectories, and employment histories.



## **CHAPTER 4            LIVE-IN CARE WORK: CONTOURS, RESISTANCE, AND ACQUIESCENCE**

This section is about what it is like to live as an LCP worker in Montréal. It is principally concerned with the identity of Filipina migrants in Montréal as workers. I highlight key themes that shape the exploitation of the LCP and how these play out in the lives of the women I interviewed. First, I look at the live-in requirement of the LCP and the types of abuse that arise from such an employment situation. I ask: why are LCP workers required to live in? What about living in makes workers susceptible to abuse? How does this abuse play out in the lives of caregivers? I go on to look at what happens to LCP workers when they finish the program by analyzing the processes of deskilling and recertification. I finish by considering what it is like to be a woman remitting back to a family that is far away and how the process of remittance sending has been construed by the development apparatus. There is a fundamental disconnect between the varied and ambiguous remitting experiences of the women I spoke to and the celebration of remittances as the new development panacea. This chapter is intended to paint a portrait of live-in caregivers as workers in Canada: the challenges they face, their creative responses to these challenges, how race, class, and gender influence their relationships to their employers, and their place in the global world order.

### **4.1 LIVING IN**

Much of PINAY's political lobbying revolves around convincing government officials to take a stand against the live-in requirement of the LCP. Members argue that the human rights abuses LCP participants experience while in Canada stem directly from the live-in

requirement of the LCP. The ambiguous status of the employer's home between the public and private realms and the intense relationship between employers and employees that develops as a result opens LCP workers up to abuse. Live-in caregivers are often overworked, underpaid, denied privacy, expected to adapt to their employer (not vice-versa), isolated, and rendered invisible.

The Canadian Government is aware of the demands made by PINAY and other groups across Canada like it, and Immigration Minister Jason Kenney met with Evelyn and PINAY members twice leading up to the changes he initiated in April 2010. The Standing Committee on Citizenship and Immigration – composed of parliamentarians selected from the House of Commons and/or the Senate – recommended that the live-in requirement of the LCP be scrapped (Tilson 2009). In their meetings with witnesses, the Committee learned that requiring LCP participants to live in their employer's homes made caregivers vulnerable to abuse and prone to isolation. The committee heard concerns about the quality of rooms provided to caregivers and the disproportionate amount of their salary that was deducted to cover the cost of room and board.

The Government of Canada rejected the committee's recommendation. They rebutted that immigrants are brought in through the LCP specifically to provide live-in care, not live-out care. The facility with which emotional labourers find themselves in exploitative working conditions surely makes live-in care work unattractive to Canadian citizens, who can choose their professions from among a much wider range of options than women coming in through the LCP. The live-in requirement is a "vital" aspect of the program, the report states, and eliminating it would reduce the flow of caregivers into Canada through the LCP (Government of Canada 2009).

#### **4.1.1 Walking the Private/Public Line**

LCP workers are caught in a liminal space between the private and public spheres that erodes their ability to create full private spaces engineered and controlled beyond their employer's supervision. Their place of work – long constructed in capitalist society as a public space – is situated within the private home of their employer. Further, their place of residence – conventionally thought to be a private place of refuge out of the reach of their employer and workplace – is located within their place of employment (their employer's home). Writing in the early 1990s, Giles and Arat-Koç pointed out the danger in the private/public distinction between households and markets for the rights of live-in caregivers. “Privileging a definition of the household as private, and thus immune from both market behavior and state intervention, effectively effaces the domestic worker's identity as an employee in a workplace” (1994: 31).

Habermas based his definition of the public bourgeois sphere partially on the identification of the family as an intimate and private space that was separate from material reproduction and the economy or market (Calhoun 1996: 10). “Historically, the [family] was the source of privateness in the modern sense of a saturated and free interiority” (Habermas 1991: 28).

A gendered hierarchy shapes the distinction between the private family domain and the public political domain. The activities of the patriarchal head of the family in the public sphere of civil society, culture, property, and social power are valued more highly than the reproductive labour of the women in the confines of the household, which includes raising and nurturing children, giving birth to children, and maintaining the household (Eley 1992: 310). Embedded within this gendered hierarchy of private and public is a

relationship of interdependence. Indeed, it is the reproductive work performed by women in the private home that enables the patriarchal head to enter into the public realm.

20<sup>th</sup> century feminist politics and the changing of hearts and minds about the place of women in modern life altered the private/public gender hierarchy. Women entered the public sphere in droves, precipitating a care crisis in the home. The neoliberal turn in Canada's economic policy downsized public solutions to the care crisis. Families whose adult head(s) work full-time must turn to the market to ensure their dependent members are cared for. The LCP institutionalizes the recruitment of workers to provide private in-home care to such dependents. The LCP has transferred women's burden of confinement to the private sphere from first world citizen wives and mothers to imported third world non-citizen women of colour. The gendered hierarchy of private and public thus plays out along racial lines and reflects the global relations of power. In the private homes that employ LCP workers, exploitation is enacted through class relations, racial prejudice, and the citizenship / non-citizenship divide (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 88).

The blurring of the private and public domains through the live-in requirement muddles the employee-employer relationship upon which modern capitalist wage relations revolve. In the absence of a clearly defined employee-employer relationship, the working and living conditions of LCP workers come to resemble indentured servitude. *Twinnny* linked her status as a live-in to the facility with which her employer was able to extract extra hours of work from her.

*Twinnny*: When you live-in, when the employer needs you, they can say 'oh you have to stay until this hour.' And after that, when my employer go to other friends and they said 'oh we have

dinner', but you know what I'm doing? I have to wash the dishes, so I said 'oh no'. But they did pay me, so it's okay. But one thing I said is that you feel really like a slave here.

The live-in requirement leaves LCP workers vulnerable to being overworked and underpaid, rendered invisible and denied their rights to privacy. Little protection from the state is offered to discover and rectify exploitative working conditions for LCP workers.

#### **4.1.2 Overworked and Underpaid**

The LCP makes participants “work hard and work scared” (Macklin 1994: 30). In every interview I did with women who worked as live in caregivers, stories arose of exploitative working conditions.

*Shannon: And the hours are usually about 40 hours per week?*

*Piedad: No. More. For a live-in caregiver, it's not just for the hours... you have to extend it.*

Twinnny told me about the long unpaid hours she worked at her first live-in placement with a family in a three-floor house who had a dog and two kids.

*Shannon: Long hours?*

*Twinnny: Yes, long hours. And the pay is very low. They didn't pay the extra hour. So the last time I took a babysit, it's almost 12 o'clock and she didn't pay nothing. And I had to wake up at 7 o'clock to bring out the dog in wintertime.*

Caregivers are often also asked to perform job duties that lie outside the parameters set by their work contracts. Officially, LCP tasks should only include those that directly relate to the care of the person or persons in question (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley, and Cheung 2004: 11). Tasks such as car washing, dog walking, tutoring, shoveling, or window-washing lie out of the bounds of the live-in caregiver job description.

After going through three placements, Pilar worked for a woman as both a dishwasher in her restaurant and as a live-in caregiver. Pilar woke up at 6 a.m. to work in the restaurant and then worked as a housekeeper and caregiver in her employer's house until 11 p.m. Pilar was also expected to tutor the children. The woman would often come home at 2 a.m., knock on Pilar's door and ask for a massage. Pilar knew this was exploitative, but time was running out. She stayed with that employer for 14 months.

Elsa thought the exploitation of caregivers came from employers using their power to take advantage of the emotionally delicate status of their employees.

*Elsa:* The employer felt like she has the power to do whatever to you because we're emotionally stressed about everything that they just think we will do whatever they ask us to do.

#### **4.1.3 Privacy**

Live-in caregivers are almost always under the surveillance of their employer and have little privacy (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 93). Evidence of the caregiver's presence in the home is made invisible through the expectation that they will use some rooms – like the kitchen – and not other rooms, that they will eat their meals separately from the family, and that they will stay silent (Bakan and Stasiulis 1997: 14). Such conventions have been recuperated from the etiquette of slavery in the American South (14).

In the fieldwork I did when working as a waitress catering private events for wealthy clients, I noticed that the Filipina women employed as caregivers within these homes usually stayed in the kitchen. I make this statement based on four events I worked over the eight months I did fieldwork in Montréal. Two of the events were in Westmount, the rich mostly-Anglophone borough in the city, one was up north in the Laurentian country

home of a client, and one was in Town of Mount Royal (TMR) – another neighbourhood where wealth accumulates in Montréal. At two of these events, an extra Filipina woman had been hired to help out for the special occasion. I am certain that two of the households employed caregivers who lived in, as I visited their rooms when the employer told me that was the appropriate place to store the wait staff's personal belongings (street clothes, bags, coats...). One live-in caregiver, Anna, had her room in the basement in a self-enclosed area off of the children's playroom that included her own bathroom, the laundry room, and her bedroom. Her room had a window, a bed, a TV, and a dresser, and was modest in size compared with the grandeur of the other living spaces in the house. Mellany's room in a different home was in the basement, right at the bottom of the stairs. The children's (ranging in age from six to sixteen) rooms were all also in the basement, and throughout the party, they came and went from their rooms slamming doors and making a racket. The room was medium sized, had several magazines in it, and a television. The fact that these two employers readily offered up their employee's rooms – which are supposed to be private – to wait staff they had never met before demonstrates their low level of respect for the privacy of these spaces.

#### **4.1.4 Invisible LCP workers**

A hierarchy of work was often quickly established between the hired wait staff and the Filipina domestic workers. Cater waiters were asked to greet guests at the door and take their coats, to pass hors d'oeuvres, to interact with guests when they took drink orders and served wine. As part of a team of young, educated waiters, I was flaunted as a symbol of status and the prestige of the event.

During events, Filipina caregivers were kept tucked away in the kitchen. I never witnessed a caregiver being invited to eat with the guests by the employer – they ate alone in the kitchen. Pam, the maid I met at the house of a powerful family in Montréal, ate at a small counter in the kitchen. She faced directly towards the wall while she ate and the space could not accommodate more than one diner. Filipina employees frequently stood in for their employers in managing the wait staff. I would often direct my questions about where I could find kitchen items or how I should proceed with the timing of the event to the caregivers who almost invariably knew the answer.

My experiences as a waitress in the private homes of people who employ live-in caregivers allowed me to see first-hand how the movements of LCP participants are conscripted in an effort to render them invisible. The invisibility of LCP workers and the labour they do was made most clear to me when it was them who had cooked and assembled the meal and the wait staff who served it to the guests.

#### **4.1.5 Lack of Protection from the State**

The live-in requirement also makes it difficult to regulate domestic work within the home, as there are legal and administrative conventions that hinder inspections of private homes (Tomei 2010: 1). In Quebec, workers eligible for CSST (worker's compensation) are also protected by government-regulated inspections of workplaces. Since caregivers are excluded from CSST coverage, no equivalent mechanisms to inspect the workplaces of domestic workers within their employer's homes exist.<sup>12</sup> Within the Quebec regulations

---

<sup>12</sup> Kenney's 2010 changes to the LCP do, however, require that employers seek equivalent insurance when worker's compensation is not available for domestic workers. The degree to which this directive is followed, however, remains unclear, as no data has been produced to examine whether employers are following the new regulations.



of the LCP (called “*Le Programme d'aides familiales résidentes en provenance de l'étranger*” in Quebec), it is stated that the *Ministère de l'Immigration et des Communautés culturelles* (MICC, the Ministry of immigration and Cultural Communities) may inspect the homes of prospective employers applying to sponsor a live-in caregiver from abroad. According to PINAY president Evelyn, the MICC also sometimes makes inspections of employers’ homes once the caregivers have moved in. Evelyn was highly critical of these measures’ efficacy.

*Evelyn:* Quebec immigration sometimes does a random check on the employer's homes.

*Shannon:* Do you know anything about that? What kind of things do they look for?

*Evelyn:* The room. That the caregivers are provided with proper rooms and checking out that the experiences of caregivers is not abusive. But by doing that, do you think you can get the correct answer or the true answer? Or the real answer from the caregiver, her being in the home? ‘No my employer is beating me up’ do you think you will say that if you are inside the house? (laughs) I don't think so! Once they leave, she'll still beat me up! For telling them!”

The anecdotal scenario that Evelyn provides reveals the expectation placed on LCP workers to maintain their employer’s privacy by staying silent. The home is positioned as the defining factor in the maintenance of this silence. Evelyn stresses that the truth about the caregiver’s situation could never be revealed while she was inside her employer’s house. The live-in situation impedes the effectiveness of outside regulation by virtue of the intense relationship that builds between caregivers and their employers.

#### **4.1.6 One-Way Adaptation**

A defining feature of domestic work for Constable is that the onus is placed solely on the caregiver to adjust and adapt to her employer, not vice-versa. “The burden of patience and

flexibility is placed entirely on the domestic worker” (Constable 1997: 86). Elsa had to move out of the room she stayed in at her first employer’s house when the family’s stepson was in town once a month because the room belonged to him. While the stepson stayed at his father’s house, Elsa slept on the pullout couch in the shared basement living room space. The arrangement compromised Elsa’s privacy every month, when she was expected to place the comfort of the family’s stepson above her own. The tendency for employers to expect that caregivers will adapt to their needs and habits – with no reciprocal willingness to adapt to the needs and habits of the caregiver is extended – is particularly acute in Elsa’s case. When she was hired and signed the work contract, her employers did not seek her consent or inform her that she would share her room with the stepson.

The double standard for privacy between citizen employers and non-citizen live-in caregivers was laid bare in Escada’s case. Escada’s employer burst into Escada’s home to look for jewelry she accused Escada of stealing. Escada recounted her employer’s rage, fury, and loss of control when she entered Escada’s apartment without a search warrant to look for the lost jewels. Escada could not contain herself when her employer cut open a locked case containing Escada’s heirloom jewelry from the Philippines and her engagement ring. Her employer was appalled that Escada had spoken up, and scolded her into silence as her own emotional outburst escalated. Escada’s employer took the case and the jewelry it contained. Here’s how Escada narrated the exchange.

*Escada:* When I saw her take all my jewelries I said, ‘hey, excuse me! That’s mine!’ And she told me, ‘shut up, Escada. You better shut up! You make me shit. You better stay up there and don’t

move or else I will call the police.’ And that time I don’t have idea that I could also call the police because I have a right to complain.

Besides demonstrating a deep disrespect for Escada’s privacy in her own home, her employer’s emotional outburst reveals the double standard enfolded into the intimacy of emotional labour that Constable outlines. While the caregiver is often expected to act as a sounding board or placid observer of her employer’s emotional outbursts, her own frustrations and emotions are to be kept secret and concealed (Constable 1997: 86). Escada’s employer openly sought to control Escada’s movements and speech in Escada’s home, a pattern that was no doubt replicated – if not intensified – when Escada was in her employer’s home.

#### **4.1.7 Food**

The placement of live-in caregivers within a family that is not their own requires negotiation of the most intimate and central human activity: eating. Elsa and Twinny complained about not having control over shared family meals because they felt uncomfortable eating with their employers and were dissatisfied with the type and quantity of food.

*Shannon: Did you eat with them? Like at the table with them?*

Elsa: This I’m very shy, I’m very shy to eat with them. Sometimes they eat first and I would eat after. Or before, or sometimes I wouldn’t eat at all.

Twinny was offered such small quantity of food at her second live-in placement that she went to great lengths to adequately nourish herself.

Twinny: I have to buy my food and put it in my room because they are rich but we just ate soup during the night. So that’s why I’m shaking. I know how to take care of my body. But if I am just

eating the soup, I can't. For them it is enough, but for me, it is not enough. So I had to buy some food and eat my fruits. And I have to bring it, and oh my god it's so heavy. But I need my food. I can't live without eating. Even though she said 'oh you can eat what you want', but... It's not sincere.

*Shannon: You don't feel comfortable?*

Twinnny: Yes and you feel that if you eat, she's thinking, oh. ... I'm not comfortable!

Twinnny's employers lived in Upper Westmount, an area not serviced by public buses.

When Twinnny says that it was heavy for her to carry her own groceries up the hill, she is referring to the minimum 20-minute hike uphill from the bus stop. During our interview, Twinnny frequently told me that she felt uncomfortable in this live-in placement, especially around meal times when she was tentatively invited to eat with the family. Her discomfort contributed to her hesitancy to complain about the small quantity of food.

Twinnny solved her nutritional problem by taxing her own body and stressing her finances when she decided to carry heavy groceries she bought out of her wages up to her employer's house. The flexibility of the LCP worker is called into action in the absence of employers' willingness to adapt to the caregiver. It is interesting that the PINAY Education Committee Chair took time at their General Assembly to address employers' refusals to provide caregivers with their preferred diet.

If you are not allowed to bring your own rice because your employer wants you to eat only bread, we will help you demand your rights and can give you accompaniment when you do it.

Their offer of accompaniment when members confront their employers about inadequate food implies that the isolation of caregivers lies at the root of their reluctance to stand up to their employers.

## **4.2 LCP WORKERS' RESISTANCE TO THE LIVE-IN REQUIREMENT**

Living out of the employer's home on a full or part time basis is often pointed to as an example of resistance against the live-in requirement. I explore this form of resistance and take account of varied individual experiences, feelings of precariousness, and the interests of employers. I conclude that while living out can sometimes be a kind of resistance, it can also place caregivers in precarious positions at the same time as increasing the comfort of employers. I point to other ways that LCP workers resist the live-in requirement including speaking up and quitting.

### **4.2.1 Living Out**

The live-in requirement of the LCP is by far the most blatantly restrictive and discriminatory facet of the program. But its existence elicits a creative response from the people it is imposed upon; caregivers rarely live in their employer's home full time. Instead, caregivers seek out ways to negotiate time apart from their employers by paying rent on a separate residence, usually shared with two or more other caregivers, or by spending their nights off at their relative's houses. LCP workers live out full time or part time to carve out an autonomous space apart from their professional lives as caregivers in their employer's home.

*Tess:* It is important to have your own apartment even if you're living in because it gives you some space from your employer.

Emmy's employers let her choose whether she would rather live with them or live out. She chose to pay rent for an apartment she shares with her sister, Tess, in Côte-des-Neiges. Every morning she takes the bus to her employer's house and every night she returns home. Both Emmy and her employers were aware that on paper, it should appear

as if Emmy lives in her employer's home. She has a room there where she keeps clothes and other belongings. Emmy was happy with her decision to move out because she found living with her sister to be comforting and stimulating.

*Emmy:* After the work, it's boring, you will be alone, you know, downstairs in your room. It's different if you have someone to talk to.

Elsa portrayed her transition towards more and more independent living situations as she completed the required 24 months of LCP work as a positive progression. She attributed her bouts of depression to the situation of living in. For Elsa, living out was crucial to maintaining the boundary between employer and employee and to finding hours in the day that were outside the reach of her employer's demands.

*Shannon:* It's better to live out?

*Elsa:* Yeah. I find no matter how hard your job or your day is, once you get home to your own space, to know you have a house you can be safe in and no one will ask you to do whatnot, it's a good feeling. I don't care if I live in Laval. I don't care if I wake up at 5:30 a.m. to get to work at 7:30. When you come home, you get to go your bedroom, you miss your family, you cry. It's your own.

The distance sought by LCP workers coincides with the desire of employers to have private time away from their employee (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 92). Evelyn was suspicious of the motives of employers who ask their caregivers to live-out full-time. She suggested that they applied to have a caregiver through the live-in caregiver program because they wanted to hire someone they could underpay and overwork. She highlights the downsides of living out for caregivers, who may be concerned they will get in trouble

with the immigration authorities for not following the rules of the program, which strictly specify that LCP workers must live in their employer's homes.

*Evelyn:* They feel like they are criminalized because not only do employers require them to stay home, to live-in, there are a few who are asking – they will hire live-in caregivers, but they don't let them live-in. They make them live outside, same pay like minimum wage. But the caregivers feel fearful that one day they might get caught and be out of the program and then they'll be sent home. But the caregivers say that if they don't accept that condition, then they will have a longer period of time looking for another employer that will fit in with the program. And employers also who don't want a live-in, doesn't want to get the one who have permanent residence, because someone with permanent residence will know enough to ask for minimum wage.

Even though the Canadian government is tolerant of live-in caregivers maintaining two addresses, Lith worried that she would get in trouble for having a second residence. Lith lived out while at her first placement in Westmount at her employer's request.

*Lith:* This employer in Westmount I am live-out. She didn't want me to live in the house.

*Shannon:* Was it okay with you?

*Lith:* It was no choice. I need to work to complete the requirement in 24 months. In the contract, we say live-in caregiver, you should live in with your employer, it's like illegal...Before I had my permanent residence, strictly not allowed to live-out because you are in the live-in caregiver program.

Lith explained that through her involvement with PINAY and upon learning more about her rights in Canada, she relaxed about having a secondary residence of her own. She signed a lease for a one-bedroom apartment in Côte-des-Neiges that she shared with two other women who work as live-in caregivers for three years. Now a permanent resident,

Lith asked the women to move out in anticipation of her family's arrival in Canada in mid-March.

#### **4.2.2 Varieties of Resistance**

The women I interviewed recounted many moments of resistance to exploitative working conditions. Pilar's fourth employer was abusive and once tried to hit Pilar. Pilar reminded her of her rights.

*Pilar: don't forget we are in Canada now and I have rights.*

This same employer also instructed Pilar to clean the house with a mixture of bleach and Mr. Clean. The fumes were intolerable and the mixture was difficult to work with. When Pilar became pregnant fourteen months into the placement, she asked for non-toxic cleaning supplies, with the health of her baby in mind. She also asked to have the day off so she could go to the doctor for an ultrasound. Pilar's assertion of her rights and her attempt to negotiate better working conditions cost her her job. Pilar's employer fired her after this conversation.

Twinny's display of resistance at her first placement also culminated in the termination of the placement when she quit. Twinny told both the agency and her employer that she was not happy that her pay cheques were often late, that she was not paid overtime, and that she was expected to move through a huge workload during seventeen-hour days.

*Twinny: I said 'no no no.' You have to pay me my extra hours. I am awake at 7 and I'm awake until 12 o'clock and the salary is not ready. I'm not crazy, eh?*

*Shannon: And they were paying you for only 40 hours.*



Twinny: Yes! I told her I don't want to work with you, because if I work with you, long hours and you just pay me like this.

Twinny also quit her second live-in placement because she could not bear the workload of cleaning a house under major renovations.

Twinny: The house is not yet finished. Every time it's dirty dirty. I'm dying, you know? So I cannot clean anymore and it's so hard. There's a lot of ironing and the house is big, so I said if I'm going to work here, I don't need that paper,<sup>13</sup> because I will die soon, because of that job that I'm doing.

*Shannon: You found it was really hard on your body?*

Twinny: Yes it was hard. And the painting that you smell. Because it's not yet finished and the dust. So I said no. I quit.<sup>14</sup>

In Twinny's case, the most satisfying display of resistance and objection to the working conditions she was placed under was to quit. Before Twinny was connected with PINAY, she was unaware of the bureaucratic channels she could use to voice a complaint against her employer. While quitting is certainly a way of resisting, it also places the LCP worker in the vulnerable position of unemployment. Expressing resistance in this way jeopardizes the livelihood of the LCP worker and their family. Evelyn always encourages members to quit exploitative working conditions. PINAY is able to support women who quit by arranging temporary shelter and by helping them find another placement through their large network of members.

---

<sup>13</sup> The working papers that would allow Twinny to count the months she worked with this family towards the 24 months required to complete the LCP program

<sup>14</sup> Twinny's story reveals the adverse health effects domestic work can have on the body, which speaks to the discrimination of excluding of domestic workers from CSST coverage.

This section shed light on what it is like to live-in and how LCP workers make sense of their situation through both resistance and acquiescence. Emphasis on the living conditions of LCP workers is crucial to understanding them as a special interest group in this media study.

### **4.3 MORE THAN A MAID: DESKILLING AND RECERTIFICATION**

It is important to consider the long-term impact of working under the LCP on the employment opportunities of participants. Many researchers consider the LCP an employment trap that limits job mobility through deskilling.

#### **4.3.1 Deskilling**

The constraining characteristics of the LCP are compounded by the fact that its participants often remain in domestic live-in work after they complete their requisite two years (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 92). The LCP initiates a stream of educated and skilled workers who are often unable to leave domestic service after the two-year required live-in period because of the discounting of their foreign credentials and the process of deskilling initiated by their isolation in their employers' homes. (Barber 2008: 1273; McKay 2003: 40; Bonifacio 2008: 26). Indeed, the program institutionalizes the process of deskilling by forbidding participants from pursuing educational training while they attempt to amass 24 months of live-in care work (Pratt 2004: 46). An important exception to this rule comes from Quebec, where LCP workers must attend free French language classes. These classes were pointed to in PINAY discussions as a valuable opportunity for assuaging the isolation of live-in caregivers, since they mandate a public life away from the employers' house. For Piedad, who was not involved with PINAY, the French classes she attends on

Sundays were her main avenue to creating networks and fostering friendships in Montréal.

The LCP recruits applicants with high levels of education and training to work in a job – as a live-in caregiver – that does not offer an opportunity to use these skills. Women whose training may have nothing to do with caregiving enter Canada through the LCP because they do not meet the educational and capital requirements for immigration through the skilled workers class.

When the LCP was created in 1992, the requirements for applicants were expanded without any equivalent upgrade in the wages, benefits, or security of the jobs LCP workers came to Canada to perform (Macklin 1994: 27). Written into the Canadian policy on the requirements of the LCP is the presumption that Philippine qualifications are inferior to those of Canadian workers. For example, a document explaining what is required of LCP applicants recommends two years of post-secondary education in order to ensure they have the equivalent of Canadian high school (Embassy of Canada 2009: 1). Recruiting over-qualified people from the Philippines for jobs below their aptitude and education levels is written into the LCP application process: the document plainly states that the requisite six months training or twelve months of paid employment can come from licensing as a registered nurse (Embassy of Canada 2009: 1).

The LCP recruits educated, trained, and skilled applicants by requiring the equivalent of a Canadian high school education, proficiency in French or English, and six months' training or one year of full-time paid work experience as a caregiver (CIC: The LCP: who can apply, 2011). Given the “tremendous” increase in the number of LCP applications

received by the Canadian embassy in Manila (Barber 2008: 1274), the education and professional background of candidates selected to come to Canada frequently surpasses the minimum CIC requirements. The process filters out applicants with low levels of education, insufficient proficiency in English, and lack of experience and instead selects a classed stream of educated, English-speaking, and experienced migrants – usually from the higher-classes to Canada. The selection process is detrimental to the Philippines through brain drain and to migrants through deskilling.

The LCP places participants in a double bind – it requires them to have high levels of experience and education from the Philippines, but the two years or more they spend working as live-in caregivers in Canada makes it difficult for them to find employment in their fields. The experience they gain as live-in caregivers in Canada is not conducive to jumping to better paying jobs (McKay 2003: 24) and is usually detrimental to their search for jobs in the public sphere since emotional labour is stigmatized on the job market.

Even when LCP participants gain permanent residency in Canada, and are thus legally allowed to work in jobs outside of domestic live-in work, they commonly continue to work in domestic service (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 91). The high cost – both real and opportunity in lost wages – of going back to school to recertify in their profession prior to live-in work in Canada is commonly deemed prohibitive for LCP participants. Elsa spent nine years in Canada without pursuing the goal she set out for herself when she moved here: to finish her bachelor's degree in psychology. Pressure to pay her bills, her husband's desire to go back to school, and the discounting of her previous school credits in Canada got in the way of her dreams.

Elsa: I wanted to go to school but my credits was not enough that I had to go to CEGEP to take classes and it kind of depressed me. And then I talked to Barry that maybe he should go to school instead of me because he has more chances of getting into school.

Elsa is frank about the advantage her Canadian citizen husband has over her within the Quebec school system. Elsa agreed to deprioritize her own education in order to help her husband scale up his employment profile in the job market with extra schooling.

According to PINAY president Evelyn sometimes staying in domestic work is the most economically advantageous move LCP workers who become permanent residents can make.

*Shannon: Do a lot of the caregivers who come through the LCP keep working in domestic work?*

*Evelyn: A lot of them. Because they find out that they earn more in terms of net pay that goes into their pockets. They find it's more profitable to them. And also the pressure in a company or industry. The pressure is higher.*

Evelyn's insights into the deskilling process call our attention to the agency that LCP workers exercise in their decision making process about their employment prospects when they finish the program. Escada was frank about her lack of desire to retrain as a midwife when she gained permanent residency.

*Shannon: When you finish, do you hope to work in a hospital or do you think you will keep working in a home?*

*Escada: Oh it's so hard because I need to study again. I don't want to. No time for me for schooling I guess.*

Escada derived a lot of satisfaction from singlehandedly financing her two children's private education through remittances (from 12 years in Hong Kong and 1.5 years in

Canada). Escada has “no time for schooling” because she is working below her aptitude and education level in order to pay for her children’s education.

Lith and Piedad’s stories demonstrate however that the deskilling of migrant mothers working as live-in caregivers is often accompanied by similar processes of deskilling among their children – educated through remittances – in employment both in the Philippines and abroad. Lith paid for her son to finish nursing school, but she reported he cannot find work in the Philippines in his field and he is working as a caregiver in people’s private homes.

*Lith:* My son, he finished license in nursing. So what now? He is working like me in the Philippines.

*Shannon:* He’s doing cleaning?

*Lith:* Like cleaning, like helping elderly care. That’s it. No choice. That’s why I want him to come here to realize his dream. Because they have a dream also that’s why they study because they want to use their education. The one choice is to come here to work – not in our country. No opportunity in our country.

Later in the interview, Lith acknowledged the hurdle of recertification her children will have to overcome when they arrive in Canada to have their credentials recognized so they can practice in their professions.

*Shannon:* So you hope that when they come here, they will be able to do nursing, your two daughters?

*Lith:* I think because in Canada it’s not recognized unless you get more units.

Piedad’s story is an example of the deskilling processes at work in circular migration. Piedad’s parents were both migrant workers and their remittances funded her nursing

degree. Disappointed with the lack of intellectual stimulation in her job as a live-in caregiver for an elderly woman in Montréal, in this excerpt Piedad touches on the precariousness of her job.

*Shannon: Do you miss being a nurse?*

*Piedad: Yeah – kinda. Here, it's because this is my first time like one is to one. And I have to stay in the house. It's not my forte, it's not my cup of tea. Staying like this job, but I don't have a choice because I'm under the live-in caregiver, so I mean two years sacrifice, it won't be long, you know... as long as the patient is still alive.*

The stories of both Piedad and Lith's children attest to the normalization of migration as a cultural phenomenon and the circular nature of migration. Remittances sent back fuel subsequent migrations abroad. Barber points to how indebtedness and aspirations of greater economic stability put pressure on daughters to make the self-sacrificing choice of seeking work abroad (Barber 2008: 1272). Often, this work abroad utilizes a skill set way below the training level of the employees, and entrenches workers in a cycle of deskilling that leaves them little choice but to keep working as a domestic.

#### **4.3.2 Recertification**

Dreams of undertaking work outside of the live-in care domain are tempered by recognition of the re-certification challenges one faces in the process. It costs money, time, and brainpower to leave domestic work for the profession caregivers were trained in before arriving in Canada. Piedad deemed the hassle and difficulty of recertifying in nursing and learning French insurmountable. Resigned to the fact that she will probably not be able find work in Quebec in a profession other than caregiving, she has set her sights on Ontario, where she has a number of friends from her days of working in Riyadh.

*Shannon: If you get permanent residency, do you want to stay in Montréal?*

*Piedad: I really don't know. Because I was planning to apply in a hospital and they just sent me a form but I have to study in French, and I hate French. It's not that I don't like it, it's just maybe too much in my head so that's why I can't go with this, studying French. But I tried in my book.*

Emmy tempered her dreams of recertifying as a midwife with the reality of the positions open to her in Quebec.

*Emmy: If I were to pass of course I want to practice my profession. I am a registered midwife, but even I want to work as a nursing assistant or aide in the hospital. If I were to ask. But for now, I still need to go to school.*

#### **4.4 REMITTANCES**

As the feminization of immigration accelerates, development actors (IMF and the World Bank) have declared remittances the new solution to the problem of poverty in the global south. Families with a parent abroad are the happy recipients, so the story goes, of bi-weekly or monthly money transfers that cover household expenses, finance children's education, and provide security for medical emergencies. Alternative sources for covering social services are especially crucial in the era of neoliberal structural adjustment policies, which have required third world governments to privatize social programs like education and health care in exchange for foreign loans from the IMF and the World Bank. For many families in the global south, remittances act as a lifeboat; a "private solution to a public problem" (Hochschild 2002: 18). It is exploitative to charge individual overseas workers with the responsibility of privately funding development and to finance the debts of their home nation by remittance transfers. Poverty is a burden that multiple actors – including sending governments, immigrant-receiving governments, and international development agencies – must share.



It is crucial to interrogate how and why powerful development actors like NGOs, governments, and international monetary institutions have constructed the “remittances are beautiful” myth (Kunz 2008). The global economic order plays out in the growing gap of income and standard of living inequalities between rich countries and poor countries and rich nationals and poor nationals. American imperialism and neoliberal reforms place a stranglehold on the self-sufficient growth of third world economies, and instead create links of dependency between powerful rich nations and less powerful poor nations (Harvey 2003). In such a political economic climate, the development game reveals itself as undeniably rigged. The myth that remittances hold the power to contribute to the development of entire nations is descriptive and also indicative of the smoke and mirrors through which much development rhetoric functions.

The myth is descriptive because remittances form a large portion of the foreign currency acquisition of sending countries. The Philippines saw 21.3 billion US dollars in remittances flow into the country in 2010 (World Bank 2011: 19). In 2006, remittances to the Philippines accounted for 13 % of the country’s GDP (Ratha 2008: 13). Globally, the Philippines is the fourth top remittance receiving country, after India, China, and Mexico (World Bank Remittance Fact Book 2011). Filipino migrants in Canada send back 1.5 billion dollars annually to the Philippines in remittances (Friesen 2011).

The “remittances are beautiful” myth plays into the smoke and mirrors of the development game because it obscures the forces that are accountable for global inequality including American imperialism, neoliberalism, and global capitalism. It is these forces that create the conditions of poverty that make migration to a more

prosperous country such as Canada attractive and that make remittances a desirable lifeboat for families struggling to keep above the poverty line in the Philippines.

#### **4.4.1 The Human Cost of Remittances**

The celebration of remittances as the new development panacea must be tempered with attention to the realities remittance-senders and their families face. In the specific case of Filipina live-in caregivers in Montréal, my research revealed that such realities are rife with contradictions. No remittance experience was alike, and each individual's reflection on the remittance process was inflected with pride and pain, empowerment and feelings of powerlessness. Five of the women I interviewed – Lith, Twinny, Escada, Tess, and Emmy – had children in the Philippines. For these five women, sending remittances home contributed to their sense of identity and was key to making sense of their situation as migrant domestic workers in Canada. Lith left her three children and her husband to work in Hong Kong as a live-in caregiver 17 years ago. She worked in Hong Kong for twelve years and then made the move to Canada, where she has spent six years without seeing her family. Lith felt good about sending remittances back home.

*Lith:* This is my joke – because even we are worked hard abroad if we send the money and we can help our loved ones in the Philippines, we are happy. We take – we call that Tylenol, when we send the money. Even we don't have money in our pocket, if we send money to our loved ones to help them, we are happy. Because that is the big purpose to work abroad. Because we want to earn money for them. For our loved ones to help them, to provide them, to get them out of poverty.

The Tylenol metaphor she uses to describe her feelings around remittance sending is revealing. By comparing the act of sending remittances to taking a painkiller, Lith implies the hardship of working as a live-in caregiver in Montréal. During Lith's interview, she

repeated three times that she “shoulders” all her family’s expenses – a statement she made with pride and a sense of accomplishment. Lith is her family’s breadwinner, and makes no efforts to disguise or downplay the importance of her caregiver wages to her family’s survival in the Philippines.

Lith’s use of the pronoun “we” in her Tylenol metaphor indicates that she feels her opinions about sending remittances are shared by other caregivers in a situation similar to hers. Indeed, during this part of the interview, Lith’s roommate, Delilah, was present and nodded in support as Lith spoke.

Tess similarly derived a sense of shared experiences with other Filipinos when I asked her about sending *balikbayan* boxes back to the Philippines. *Balikbayan* literally translates to homecomer, or someone who is going back home, and is commonly used to refer to Filipino nationals living abroad. Filipino overseas workers frequently send boxes filled with canned goods, electronics, clothing, CDs, toiletries, and other items back to their families almost tax-free, in accordance with legislation initiated by President Marcos and elaborated by President Aquino (Basch, Glick-Schiller, and Szanton Blanc 1994: 3). Symbolically, *balikbayan* boxes articulate the hierarchical relationship between the Philippines and receiving states for Filipino migrants by showing off fancy consumer goods available outside of the Philippines (Ignacio 2005a: 124). Remittances often take the form of *balikbayan* boxes and Tess, Twinny, and Lith all reported sending such care packages back home to their family, although less often than they would like given that shipping costs \$70-\$80.

*Tess:* I send my family a *balikbayan* box whenever I can. I fill it with soap, toothpaste, shampoo, used clothes. When things are on sale here, we buy them for our family. It’s cheaper than in the

Philippines, if it's on sale. That's why when the coffee is on sale at the Pharmaprix, you see all sorts of Filipinos buying lots of coffee.

Tess uses the pronoun “we” just like Lith, speaking to an experience – looking for sales to fill up *balikbayan* boxes – she feels Filipinos share.

It is interesting that Lith links her remittances to “getting her family out of poverty” – a formulation to which the IMF and World Bank subscribe: remittances equal poverty reduction. Lith's words again reveal that the “remittances are beautiful” (Kunz 2008) narrative is both descriptive and deceptive: remittances do indeed improve the living situations of families in the Philippines, but they come at the high cost of family separation and difficult working conditions for overseas migrant workers.

Twinnny recalls the stress of being out of work while she waited to find a new employer and remitting the expected amount left almost no money for her expenses in Canada.

*Shannon: So are your conversations with your family usually the best part of your day, or is it sometimes hard to talk to them?*

*Twinnny: Yes, yes, but sometimes it give me stress. Because always they ask for the money. I said my salary is not big. So I send every month, one thousand dollars. I'm not working in Paris, I am here in Canada. So why is it not enough? It's okay the bill, the therapies, the medicine of my husband, the check up. But I said okay, don't expect me too much. Because if I work, work, work, and not to having a rest, if I die, what you gonna do? If I die, you will die also.*

Twinnny is overwhelmed by the pressure her family puts on her for financial support.

Twinnny's husband works at the bank, but he and her three kids still rely on her to cover their tuition fees and medical bills. Twinnny frets that because she cannot physically be with her family, she is unable to control her diabetic husband's eating habits and to help

her son who has trouble walking. For Twinny, sending money back does not allow her to adequately fulfill her role as a wife and a mother. Her family's demands for money stress her out, as her salary cannot meet their expectations and desires. When Twinny links her vitality to the vitality of her family, she points to the level of dependence in transnational families and the physical effects of overworking on the female bodies of live-in domestics in private homes.

Two of the women I interviewed were single when they left the Philippines, and neither of them remit regularly to their families at home. Piedad remits irregularly to her mom and grandparents. Elsa used to remit to her siblings, but stopped because she was disturbed by the way her brothers and sister haphazardly and indulgently spent the money. Instead of using the money to get educated, her siblings were buying lots of non-essential items.

*Elsa:* I learned that my sister was hanging out at the mall all day and drinking Starbucks coffee and not going to school. I don't want to be a part of that. I told my mom you're not helping them at all for feeding them money they don't need. They're becoming materialistic. They need to work, they're not crippled or something like that. So I told my mom I'm going to stop sending money. She was upset at first and she couldn't accept it. The culture in the Philippines is kind of that once you are older, the parents kind of expect you to give money back. I did a lot of things against my culture.

Remittances can come in all sorts of different shapes and sizes. In Piedad's case, her money is transferred to the Philippines in the form of mortgage payments on a home she bought with her brother as a gesture of gratitude towards her mother who spent their entire childhood working as a mall cashier in Dubai. Piedad's mother's remittances paid for Piedad's nursing school in the Philippines.

#### **4.4.2 Remittances as Nation-Building**

It is helpful to examine remittances also from the theoretical framework of transnationalism and long-distance nation-building, as the Philippine state sanctions the monetary flow of wages from overseas workers. Through the use of symbols, language, and political rituals sending states create an ideology that “envisions migrants as loyal citizens of their ancestral state” (Basch, Glick Schiller and Szanton Blanc 1994: 3). Sassen (2002) also points to the active role sending states play in exporting workers to appease civil unrest in poor countries, to deal with unemployment, and to access desperately needed foreign currency through remittances. These effects of migration, which are highly advantageous to sending states, can sometimes be a natural byproduct of the movement of people, but can also be intentional outcomes of policy on labour export, as is the case for the Philippines (Sassen 271). The Philippines Overseas Employment Administration (POEA) was established by the Filipino government in 1982 and is evidence of the government’s formalized efforts to catalyze migration flows out of the country (271). POEA organizes and supervises the export of nurses and maids to high-demand areas (271).

#### **4.5 CONCLUSION**

This chapter has examined Filipina migrants in Montréal as workers. I have argued that the live-in requirement of the LCP lies at the root of the exploitation LCP workers experience and have demonstrated the ways in which that abuse is resisted. Deskilling and recertification were explored in turn to expose the systematic barriers to employment mobility for LCP workers. Finally, the work of LCP participants is put into the wider global context of development and neoliberalism through an examination of remittances.

The forces of development and global trade have cast Filipina migrant workers as heroines of the nation, making heartbreaking sacrifices to ensure their overseas families are fed, cared for, taught, and sheltered. This chapter has exposed such casting as both descriptive and mythical – some women I spoke to did not fit the part as outlined by the “remittances are beautiful” mantra. In the next chapter, I examine more closely LCP workers as women and problematize the feminist tools typically used to unpack and decipher the meanings of their lives.

## CHAPTER 5                      FEMINIST READINGS OF THE LIVE-IN CAREGIVER PROGRAM

The relationship that forms between citizen employers and non-citizen employees raises important questions about feminism and its commentary on gender relations in the context of immigration. Feminist thought began to take keen interest in the politics of housework in the 1970s (Anderson 2000: 9). Macklin problematizes the feminist analysis of the relationship between domestic workers and the women who employ them. She points to the interdependence between low-paid immigrant housework and professional freedom for working Canadian mothers: “one woman’s flexibility can be another woman’s straightjacket” (Macklin 1994: 31). Her commentary emerges from and responds to a crucial line of questioning in feminist theory: in the face of such difference among women according to race, class, age, sexual orientation, and religion (the list goes on), who is this ‘woman’ feminism advocates on behalf of?

In this section, I provide an overview of the debates surrounding feminist readings of domestic work. “Peminism,” an explicitly Filipino feminism, emerges as a valuable window through which to consider the gender dynamics at play in the lives of Filipina caregivers in Montréal. Two case studies help to illustrate this point. The experiences of Elsa, Piedad, and Pilar with marrying or being propositioned for marriage by a Canadian man are considered as well as how the LCP constrains Filipina women’s reproductive rights in Canada.



## 5.1 FEMINISM/PEMINISM

In exposing the power divide between citizen employers and non-citizen domestic workers, Macklin (1994) draws attention to the contradictory threads of feminism used to make sense of reproductive and emotional labour performed in the home. It is easy to say that feminism advocates for equal rights and opportunities for men and women. The case of Filipina women enrolling in the LCP in Canada to become the caregivers of children, the elderly, the disabled, and the home raises questions we cannot ignore about these equal rights feminism seeks for men and women. Which women? Are some women excluded from the struggle? Are some women invisible to feminist advocates in the west?

The focus on reproductive labour sharpened within feminist thought in the 1970s when Marxist feminists began to examine how social reproduction was constructed along gender lines, as Nakano Glenn (1992) explains. Social reproduction is the “array of activities and relationships involved in maintaining people both on a daily basis and intergenerationally” and includes shopping for the house, meal preparation, laundry, socializing and educating children, caring for adult family members, cleaning, and household budgeting (1). While reproductive labour is key to the overall functioning of capitalist economies and the long-term viability of a nation, it is rendered invisible and devalued because it takes place outside of the market (2).

Unremunerated reproductive labour signals that society does not recognize the value of reproducing the nation, creating community, and bringing a sense of humanity to family units (Anderson 2000: 14). Unpaid domestic work was relegated to the margins of the market economy and as such rendered invisible (Nakano Glenn 1992: 2). Without reproductive labour, the industrial economy could not have been sustained. In the typical

nuclear family unit from 1850 - 1950, the male breadwinner was freed to participate as a worker in the capitalist economy by virtue of his wife's work within the home, where he was clothed, fed, restored and sheltered. The child rearing aspects of reproductive labour sustained the industrial capitalist economy by reproducing the able labour force. The children women reared replaced aging workers when they entered into the wage economy.

Throughout human history, non-family members have been hired or indentured to replace adults of the house who are either too busy to perform reproductive labour or rich enough to avoid it. More often than not, outside sources of reproductive labour were women. Even though their labour is remunerated, women from the third world who travel to Canada to work in private homes are even less visible within the market and society than the unpaid housewives they replace. They are spatially isolated within private homes, and sometimes have trouble leading public lives when they first arrive because they lack strong networks of friends and families. Female employers of domestic helpers tend to shroud these women workers in an air of secrecy. Unlike the traditions of serving classes in the past – such as black women working in southern white American homes – third world migrant women domestics are not identified by uniforms or overtly displayed as status symbols (Ehrenreich and Hochschild 2002: 4). In modern times, middle and upper class mothers are under pressure to appear like they can “do it all” – have successful careers and tend lovingly to their children and spouses all by themselves. The nanny is the invisible force behind the maintenance of this façade: the house is cleaned, children fed, bathed, dog walked, car washed, all “magically out of sight,” (Ehrenreich and Hochschild 2002: 4).

Marxist feminists argued that reproductive labour should be recognized and valued by society upon the assumption of a universal female experience (Nakano Glenn 1992: 2). The international sisterhood of women supposedly stemmed from shared experiences of motherhood and domesticity. But the fact that women from the third world have been recruited to replace richer first world women in the home challenges the universal female experience that Marxist feminists critiqued. When one group of women eschews their domestic and mothering responsibilities at the expense of another group of socially disadvantaged women, clearly these two groups will have very different experiences with motherhood and domesticity. McKay writes, “Some women’s access to the high-paying, high-status professions is being facilitated through the revival of semi-indentured servitude” (2003: 34).

Privileging personal, lived experience, Macklin asserts that feminist analysis of employers’ oppression cannot be equated to the oppression of the third world LCP-participant she employs. The work of Peminist theorists supports exploring feminisms and rejects the search for a unifying female subject and voice. In her introduction to the collaborative volume of Filipina voices, *Pinay Power*, De Jesús sets the parameters of a feminism that speaks to and serves the Filipina / American experience, which is “very different from the implicit (and thus explicit) subject of white, liberal feminism” (2005: 5)

Peminism is an anti-racist, decolonizing, anti-sexist, and pro-LGBT project that reacts against homogenizing narratives spun in the name of ethnic solidarity (De Jesús 2005: 5).

Peminism is “the assertion of a specifically Filipina American subjectivity, one that radically repudiates white feminist hegemony as it incorporates the Filipino American oppositional politics inscribed by choosing the term Pilipino over Filipino” (5).

Postcolonial feminist thought emphasizes decolonization theory and the amplification of previously silenced voices by celebrating and recognizing difference (Marchand 2009: 931). Such decolonizing moves work against forces that represent certain women as “other” based on their social/ethnic/religious/class profiles within feminist writing. For example, in development discourse, western feminist writing tends to portray third world women as illiterate victims of patriarchy and poverty who are trapped in traditional and domestic roles (Mohanty 1991: 56). In contrast to the truncated lives of third world women, western feminists implicitly self-represent themselves as free, sexually liberated, and educated (56).

While Filipina domestic workers and the women who employ them certainly experience gender oppression in very distinct ways, the intertwining of their experiences through the LCP problematizes the theoretical move to keep them separate by applying two types of feminist analysis. The oppression of the domestic worker and her employer intersect through the relationship they forge when the later hires the former to take care of her children or parents. The two versions of lived oppression on the basis of gender – however distinct in scale and in the contours of the experience – are bound together through the live-in caregiver program.

## **5.2 INTERNATIONAL MARRIAGE**

Given the tendency for domestic work to ghettoize and deskill Filipina women, international marriage between a Filipina woman and a Canadian man is a route that some women choose to access a wider range of employment rights and social mobility in Canada (McKay 2003: 24). But international marriage also carries with it a sense of dependency upon Canadian husbands for providing access to a life in Canada as a full

citizen that LCP workers are excluded from unless they complete their 24 months – an outcome that many do not reach given the racist and sexist architecture of the program. Ambivalence surrounds the question of marrying a Canadian man among LCP workers because marriage to a man looking for a stay-at-home wife can lead to further entrenchment within domestic service (29). But international marriage can be problematic when Canadian men expect gratitude from their Filipina brides for the opportunities they conferred upon them.

Three vignettes from my fieldwork challenge McKay's contention that international marriage is an attractive option for migrant women through which they can break out of the isolation of domestic work, to gain social mobility and settle permanently in Canada (35). Piedad, Pilar, and Elsa were reluctant to enter into a union that was bound to be built on unequal terms and did not want to feel a sense of gratitude towards their husbands for years to come. Permanent residency was less a gift and more an unequal contract they simply would never be able to reciprocate.

Elsa entered her marriage to a Canadian man with a deep sense of regret that she was not able to finish her LCP requirements unaided. The feat of finishing all on her own would have given her great satisfaction and earned respect from her LCP worker peers. Barry is constructed as the saviour in the narrative of Elsa leaving the LCP, because he has enough power by virtue of his social position to rescue her from the unpleasantness of live-in work. But her reflections upon the event demonstrate a deep-seated discomfort with the way she was saved from the LCP. Elsa's family put pressure on her to choose the marriage route, out of fear that she would be unable to finish the requirements of the LCP in time if she decided to stay single.

*Shannon: And what did Barry think of you living in? Of the LCP?*

*Elsa:* He said it was stupid. Why am I doing that? He offered to marry me the first year we were together. But I didn't want people to think I was with him because I had no choice and I wanted to upgrade my life or something. I didn't do it. Because after living in with the Italian family, he realized I was really having a hard time. Because it was going back to zero again, so all the emotions and everything, it was in Rosemère<sup>15</sup>, it was even worse because it was not close to anything. And then my uncle told me, well if you don't like the job, just leave and get married, if you wanna get married, get married now. It was the time was running out. To switch my papers, it takes three months.

*Shannon: So did you end up finishing the end of your LCP?*

*Elsa:* No. I quit. Because I got married. My mom was all stressed out, she kept saying, 'Elsa! Get married! I will pay for everything.' I guess it's one of the reasons I didn't want to get married is because I didn't want it to be forced.

*Shannon: You wanted it to be romantic.*

*Elsa:* Not romantic, but for the right reasons. Me and Barry were already living together for two years before we got married. He said well if we're going to be in a relationship – because we were already talking about kids and everything, what are we waiting for? So I got married to Barry, and I quit, and I got out of LCP.

*Shannon: Did it feel good? Were you happy with the way the LCP ended?*

*Elsa:* No not at all.

*Shannon: You wish you had finished?*

*Elsa:* I felt like at that time I was quitting. I was trying to prove something: that I could finish this. Because I've met a lot of Filipinos who look down on me because I have different way of leaving.

While stressed out by rushing to finish her 24 months of live-in work, Pilar thought about trying to court a Canadian man so she could marry him and get her status more quickly. She knew that would be an easy way to get status. But she was determined to get her

---

<sup>15</sup> A city about 45 minutes outside of Montréal.

status her own way. She didn't want to be in a relationship where the man had all the power because he was the one who made it possible for her to get status.

Piedad opened up to me about her opinions on international marriage when she mentioned that her friend had married a Canadian man. She understood why her friend had done so, but admitted that their marriage was fuel for much gossip among her caregiver friends in Canada. People suspected the friend had married a Canadian man simply to get status, a move that is frowned upon by those who go through the process of achieving permanent residence all on their own. Piedad herself was approached by a Canadian man who propositioned marriage. Her reaction was similar to Pilar and Elsa's: she wanted to see her venture through and succeed on her own accord.

*Piedad:* Yeah, marrying a Canadian man can be easier than finishing the program. But it's hard also from your side that you are just using this guy for the sake of the papers, and everyone is thinking okay, practical reason. You've been through a lot from the start in coming here because you have to sacrifice everything for the papers for the money. You started so you just finish it. I have a friend, he just told me: "why don't you just get married because it will be more easier for you?" And I told him "if ever that's my plan, why I have to pay a lot of money and then just came here just to marry someone?" I came here just to have a good future and stuff like that. It's not just to get married and end up sitting in the house. It's not me, it's not my idea.

Piedad's comment about sitting in her hypothetical husband's house supports McKay's point about the further entrenchment of Filipinas in the private sphere through international marriage. Her outright rejection of such an outcome, however, represents an aspect of the international marriage issue that McKay missed. As much as marriage to a Canadian man is weighed against other options for achieving permanent residency, it is

also regarded as inferior to making whatever sacrifices necessary to finish the LCP and gain permanent residency status as an independent woman.

Filipina migrants who decide to come to Canada through the LCP exercise acts of resistance all the way through the process. Indeed, even the act of leaving the Philippines itself is a kind of resistance against the lack of well-paid jobs available there. When migrants seek work abroad, they demonstrate their dissatisfaction with the flexible and low paid positions available in the Philippines, many of which are tied to the export-economy that supports the ever-expanding capitalist economies of the west. Migration represents resistance through the withdrawal of labour from unsatisfactory positions in the Philippines and through the reconfiguration of migrants' access to capital (Spenner 2009: 21).

### **5.3 REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS**

The LCP denies reproductive rights to its participants. In order to participate in the reproduction of the receiving nation, live-in caregivers must forsake their reproductive roles, as they often leave their own children with relatives in the Philippines (Parreñas 2001: 1135). The history of Canadian recruitment of domestic workers reveals a preference for single women unencumbered by family responsibilities. The Caribbean Domestic Scheme, in effect from the mid-1950s to the 1960s accepted only single women with no dependent family members (Bakan and Stasuilis 1997: 16). The legacy of this policy continues to influence the immigration applications of women applying to Canada through the LCP. The reproduction and settlement of third world families is impeded by immigration authorities who spin a legal fiction that LCP workers are without family



attachments (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 144). The preference for immigrants with minimal family attachments runs counter to the expectation that nannies will be family minded and motherly. For example, Piedad was skeptical of her abilities as a caregiver for children precisely because she has no children of her own.

Families are frequently fractured in the family reunification process because Canada rejects certain kinds of family members based on their health, age, or level of dependency on their migrant mothers. Tess had finished her 24 months of live-in care work, applied for permanent residency, and submitted the names of her family members she wished to sponsor for immigration to Canada. Tess' eldest daughter is mentally handicapped. Tess had no idea there was a possibility her application would be rejected if Canadian immigration discovered that her daughter had a health problem. Following instructions that ask applicants to list all dependent family members, Tess listed her handicapped daughter.

*Tess:* I have three kids: two boys and a girl. My eldest, a girl, is mentally handicapped. I put down her name on the application when I applied because I had no idea they would check to see if she was ok before approving my permanent residence application. Because she is handicapped, the Canadian government told me she is inadmissible and that there is a chance my application will not be approved because of it. I thought about taking my daughter's name off the application, but I'm not allowed to do that. I am so worried about my application.

Tess' family remains fractured and her right to be reunited with all her children is challenged by the Canadian Immigration's decision to declare her mentally handicapped daughter inadmissible. Tess' stress level was very high when I met her, as she was waiting to hear back about an appeal to grant entry for her daughter and to approve her

own permanent residency status, which she submitted on humanitarian and compassionate grounds with the help of PINAY's pro bono lawyer.

In the time I knew Lith, she was granted permanent residency status and succeeded in sponsoring her husband and two children to join her in Montréal. She left her eldest son behind. Her eldest was denied family sponsorship because he started working after he finished school and no longer has the full-time student status required for sponsorship of children over 18 years old. He is extremely upset about being left behind in the Philippines without any of his immediate family members and wants his family to be all together. Lith told him he has to be as strong as she was in the eighteen years she has been a migrant worker – first in Hong Kong and then in Canada. When Lith started the LCP, her eldest was only 12. She thought she would surely have enough time to complete the program and sponsor him before he was too old. But it took Lith six years to finish the program and sponsor her children, due to long processing delays, getting fired for taking three sick days when she was hospitalized, and losing her second job without explanation.

Strict immigration rules fail to take into consideration the many shapes and sizes that “family” comes in for the individuals who come through the LCP program. The poor design of the program, which opens caregivers up to the abuse through wrongful dismissal and subjects them to long wait times for processing immigration documentation, endangers their chances of reuniting with their family as a whole. Children grow up while caregivers rush to finish the program requirements. Excluding certain members of caregivers' families from family sponsorship serves to further erode the range of their reproductive rights, even after they are no longer bound by the rules of the LCP itself. Families are fractured by these policies and the conditions of poverty in

the Philippines that render the move to Canada and separation from one's family attractive.

Even for those families that are reunited in Canada as a whole, the pain of long years of family separation impacts the family dynamic profoundly. Pilar commented on how women breadwinners who leave the household in the Philippines to provide for their families irrevocably change relations within the family.

*Pilar:* Families are apart for two or three years and then the women sponsor their families to join them in Canada, but you are like strangers.

Throughout years of separation, overseas mothers miss out on the changes their children go through as they grow up, and are taken out of their active role as a member of the family. Lith told me she raised her children "by phone, by money." She reflected on the emotions she anticipated leading up to being reunited with her family after six years of not seeing them face-to-face.

*Shannon:* Did you know it would take that long to finish your LCP? Did you expect it to be that hard?

*Lith:* (Exhales). It's hard because it's been more than five years since I've been here in Canada, a lot of changes, you know. My kids grow up and I don't know them, it's not the same if they grow up and every time you saw how they grow up. If every day you saw their behaviour. Every minute has a change.

*Shannon:* Are you nervous to see them?

*Lith:* I'm not nervous, I'm excited. (Laughs). I love them, I go through this situation, this hardship of life because I love them. No matter what happened, they are coming. But of course I expect a big difference.

Lith remains optimistic about her reunion with her family. After all, it is a dream she has been working towards for five years. But her reflections demonstrate that a crucial aspect of her person – her identity as a mother – has been stifled by the exigencies of the LCP. Family separation of course also impacts the spouses and children of caregivers, who spend their childhood separated from their mothers and grow up without a mothering influence.

Caregivers' reproductive roles are further constrained once they arrive in Canada as the live-in requirement inhibits romantic relationships and makes having a family logistically challenging, if not impossible (Stasiulis and Bakan 2005: 93). Caregivers work up to 16-hour days six days a week, leaving little time to tend to one's own family. Further, by living in their employer's house, caregivers are not given freedom to entertain romantic guests, thus denying the sexual aspects of their identity.

Elsa lived in her employer's house in Rosemère while she was dating Barry. Elsa could not even imagine bringing Barry into her room at her employer's home, and the space they made for their relationship was squeezed in on her off days outside the house.

*Shannon: When you were living in Rosemère, was Barry allowed to come see you? Was it okay for him to come over and hang out?*

*Elsa: There would be days that he would come over, we would eat in a restaurant, but he would drop me off.*

*Shannon: So he would come in the house?*

*Elsa: Never.*

*Shannon: And did you feel like you could kiss or whatever in your room?*

*Elsa: No.*

*Shannon: And that's something your employer said to you or you just didn't...*

*Elsa: I just find it's not normal.*

*Shannon: You just didn't want to – it made you uncomfortable.*

*Elsa: Yeah.*

*Shannon: So even though that was your space, that room, was not a space you could do whatever you want in.*

*Elsa: No! Well of course it's your room, but you don't wanna take a chance.*

*Shannon: Because they might not like it.*

*Elsa: No – because some people they have hidden cameras.*

Elsa linked the reluctance to bring Barry to her room to her discomfort in her employer's home and her suspicions that she was under surveillance. Stories of employers hiding cameras in nanny's rooms undercut the level of privacy and security she felt in her room.

The Canadian welfare state impedes domestic workers from having safe and healthy pregnancies by denying comprehensive medical care and maternity leave during pregnancies. Pregnancy-based layoffs are common but measures to contest wrongful dismissal are time-consuming and complicated for caregivers. The inequality between non-citizen live-in caregivers and Canadian citizens is again laid bare in the differential treatment they receive from the Canadian welfare state for maternity leave and medical care during pregnancies (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley, and Cheung 2004: 26).

Pilar became pregnant while working for her fourth employer, an abusive divorcee who made Pilar work 18 hours a day in her home and restaurant. The employer fired Pilar when Pilar asked for a day off to go to the obstetrician for an ultrasound. This employer would not release Pilar's record of employment, which Pilar needed for her maternity leave and her Ontario Health Insurance Plan (OHIP).

Contesting the denial of her reproductive rights, Pilar began a campaign with the help of a migrant advocacy group in Toronto to achieve permanent residency status on humanitarian and compassionate grounds even though she had not finished her 24 months of live-in care work. Her son Jason was on the way and her OHIP was running out. Pilar fought long and hard and eventually won.

As migration for women becomes normalized in the Philippines, the birthing process is altered to accommodate mothers on the move. Escada's story of living in Hong Kong before and after her two children were conceived and delivered is a case in point.

*Shannon: Were you pregnant in Hong Kong if you were in Hong Kong for twelve years?*

*Escada: Yeah yeah. Every time you know when I'm pregnant and at the time of the delivery, I go home maybe four months before my delivery.*

*Shannon: And your employer was understanding about that?*

*Escada: Yeah yeah yeah.*

*Shannon: And then you left your kids in the Philippines?*

*Escada: With my mom. Yeah yeah. After I delivered, I leave to my mom. Maybe I stay with my babies for maybe two months and then, back to work.*

Incredibly, Escada took six months off work to give birth to her children, nurse them, and recover from her delivery.

## **5.4 CONCLUSION**

The cases of international marriage and reproductive rights have been marshaled here to demonstrate the unique set of gender dynamics at play in the lives of LCP workers in Montréal. Attention to how LCP workers are treated as women by the LCP and other Canadians reveals racist and sexist undercurrents. LCP workers are shown in this section

to creatively negotiate this treatment through negotiating international marriage and assuaging the denial of their reproductive rights through alternative expressions of their maternal and sexual identities. The ethnographic evidence I collected on international marriage attests to a reluctance surrounding the topic of marrying Canadian men and a desire to complete the LCP all on one's own that has not yet been recorded in academic research. I problematized the typical feminist framework for examining the relationship between women employers and women employees under the LCP. The symbolic violence western feminism brought onto third world women subjects makes it an inappropriate framework to apply to the lived experiences of LCP workers in Canada. Feminist thought has attempted to redress this issue by celebrating feminisms based on the idea that an explicitly Filipino feminism (Peminism) will be less likely to misrepresent its subjects. While Peminism is certainly a worthwhile lens through which to examine the lives of LCP workers, a more inclusive feminism is necessary to make sense of the employer-employee relationship in domestic service that involves the oppression of both Canadian citizen employers and non-citizen employees. We may still be some way away from arriving at a more inclusive feminism, but strides were taken during the 1995 UN International Women's Conference in Beijing where participants looked for a common ground upon which women from many different experiences and backgrounds could meet and share (Marchand 2009: 925).

## **CHAPTER 6            NEWSPAPERS AND NANNIES: LCP WORKERS IN THE MAINSTREAM AND FILIPINO NEWS**

Stereotypes are key to understanding how racism operates through the LCP and how expectations become levied on Filipina women in their workplaces. In this section, I examine the emergence of the stereotype that Filipina women are nannies and use three *Montreal Gazette* articles to demonstrate how this stereotype is constituted and reflected in mainstream media in Montréal. I then look at how gender dynamics are taken up by the *Post* and the *Star* and conclude that these papers provide a platform for the writing of Filipina identity beyond the nanny stereotype. To write a story about nannies in Montréal, journalists go out looking for interviews from women who have lived through the LCP. Three of the women I interviewed were interviewed by western journalists for news stories about the LCP. I unpack their experiences with being in the mainstream news in this section.

### **6.1 “ALL FILIPINAS ARE NANNIES”**

In the industrialized countries where many Filipinas migrate to work, they encounter discrimination that at once stereotypes them as maids, nannies, or “granny nannies” (Engelhart 2010) and stigmatizes domestic labour. This ethnic, gendered stereotype plays out in the lives of Filipinas in Canada through the assumption that they work as domestic helpers, even when they do not (McKay 2003: 31). As is the case with most stereotypes, assuming Filipinas work in domestic service is a distorted reflection of the reality that 90 per cent of women coming in through the LCP do indeed originate from the Philippines (32). The mainstream media in Montréal perpetuates the stereotype that all Filipina



women are nannies, as articles about Filipinos are frequently about Filipinas working as nannies. This section considers how the mainstream media depoliticize the LCP and create stereotypes of Filipina women through their coverage on caregivers.

The stigma surrounding the stereotype of the Filipina domestic worker is tied up with Canadian immigration policy. Canadian immigration officials refer to the LCP as a “back door” for applicants because they lack the skills, education, work experience, or family situation to gain entry through the independent immigrant stream (McKay 2003: 32). The segmentation of the immigration avenues into skilled and unskilled – and the funneling of Filipina migrants through the unskilled stream – contributes to the image of the Filipina domestic worker as ‘unskilled’ and ‘uneducated’ (32). This constructed image is grossly distorted, as the minimum requirements of the LCP cut access to immigration off to unskilled and uneducated women.

Elsa shared her encounters with the stigmatization of her work as a caregiver and her reasons for rejecting the insulting classifications.

*Elsa:* Some Filipinas I know feel shy to be friends with other nationalities because they’re afraid people will look down on them. But they don’t realize that people don’t care what you do for your living, so long as you’re not stealing. Some of my friends will be shocked that I have friends from different places. They ask me: “Won’t you be shy to tell what your job is?” and I’m like, “no!” If we’re not here to take care of the kids then who’s gonna do it? It’s not like I’m stealing money.

Elsa calls attention to the importance of her job in childcare when she points out that migrants come in through the LCP to make up for the labour shortage in the reproductive sector. Her description of the tendency for her Filipina friends to remain in social circles composed only of other Filipinos or other LCP workers is evidence of the way that the

stigmatization of reproductive labour can lead to isolating and ghettoizing Filipina women. Elsa takes comfort in the fact that she is paid for her work – regardless of what it is – and her hard work makes her confident that she has no reason to be embarrassed about what she does to support herself.

### **6.12 News about Nannies**

Over Christmas 2010 in Montréal, a Filipina woman was featured on the front page of the *Montreal Gazette* (Appendix E). A serious looking Elenor Diaz is pictured front and center in a half page photo. Behind her, out of focus, sit her employer and her employer's son. A lengthy caption is placed under the photo explaining how Elenor's "holiday dream" to reunite with her family had been "denied."

Filipina nanny Elenor Diaz worked multiple jobs here – including housekeeping for Lissa Matyas in order to save enough money to bring her husband and children to Montréal. But the tickets for the family's Christmas Day journey were cancelled by Manila travel agents who absconded with Diaz's money. "I felt so lonely and frustrated," Diaz said. (Block 2010: A1).

*Gazette* journalist Irwin Block reports that Diaz saved \$4,000 to pay for her husband and three children's one-way tickets to Montréal from Manila while working 15-hour days seven days a week when she became a permanent resident after two and a half years as a "sponsored nanny." Block describes Diaz's typical day: 5 a.m. to 1 p.m.: serving breakfast at a hotel in a Montréal suburb, afternoons at a nursing home, and the rest of her days cleaning homes and nannying for various clients. At the end of the article, Diaz is described waiting on a "Good Samaritan" who will "step forward and give her a hand" (Block 2010: A8).

The article incited a frenzy of donations to Diaz from philanthropic and compassionate readers to finance Diaz's family's journey to Canada. The front page of the following day's *Montreal Gazette* (Appendix F) also featured a smiling Diaz (tissue in hand) and Matyas in an embrace under the headline, "Our readers rally for nanny." In the article that follows, we find out that Matyas, Diaz's employer, initially contacted the *Gazette* about Diaz's story (Montgomery 2010). A reader who runs a remittance-sending company, Larry Mofafferi, paid \$5,800 for flights to Montréal. Another donation came from a man who grew up in a family with a sponsored nanny who felt compelled to contribute because "I am acutely aware of the hardship and hard work involved in starting from the ground up in a new country" (2010: A8).

The articles about Diaz perpetuate the stereotype that Filipina women are nannies. They normalize and applaud inhuman working hours and depoliticize the LCP. The photos of Diaz that show her with her employer or with her employer's baby imply that their relationship is crucial to Diaz's identity and experience with a fraudulent travel agency. Diaz is photographed only once without Matyas: standing in awe in front of a computer screen full of emails from supportive readers offering funds. The articles focus entirely on Diaz's life in Canada, and fail to mention the job or education she had in the Philippines. The erasure of Filipinas' identities before arrival to Canada is part of the process of deskilling and facilitates stereotyping them as nannies. The articles feed into a discourse on the hard work of caregivers that disciplines Filipinas into working hard and normalizes the inhuman conditions they work under. Many readers who wrote in wanted to help Diaz precisely because of her hard work, which was venerated in the first article. Elenor is referred to as a "sponsored nanny": the words "live-in caregiver program" or LCP do not

appear anywhere in the article. The root causes of why Diaz is in Canada, why she had to leave her family at home, and why she has to work 17-hour days are left out of the article.

An article in the *Gazette* covering a PINAY press conference on the human rights case against the Super Nanny agency was more political than the Diaz articles. One paragraph hints at the link between the LCP and abuse: “Under federal immigration rules, live-in caregivers must live with the employer designated in their contract. If they change jobs, they must obtain a new work permit, which can take several months” (Scott 2011).

Nonetheless, the article’s analysis of the program is weak and the article fails to provide context in the cases of two caregiver complainants at the press conference. PINAY president Evelyn was upset by most of the coverage generated by the press release, which she felt was “opportunistic” and did not address the way the Quebec Human Rights Commission had grossly mishandled PINAY’s case. The lack of attention to the fight for caregiver rights was glaring in the headline Scott’s article ran under in online Canadian newswires: “Montréal firm mistreated Filipina domestics, agencies contend.” The headline confuses PINAY with an agency, as it is PINAY who is contending that Super Nanny mistreated Filipina domestics. I wrote an email on behalf of PINAY to Scott asking that the headline be changed. We never got a response.

The article on the Super Nanny case reveals that the media want stories about the Filipina nanny arriving in Montréal with no one to turn to, manipulated into paying more and more fraudulent fees to the agency that brought them here, and inhuman living conditions where more than one woman share a bed. Stories of exploitation make good reads. Stories about the protracted and courageous struggle of LCP workers for more equal rights do not make the cut.

The *Montreal Pinoy Post* and the *North American Filipino Star* provide a more varied depiction of Filipina femininity because there are more images of Filipina women to choose from within their pages. Filipina women are depicted running for FAMAS office, organizing fundraisers, becoming entrepreneurs, in beauty pageants, as successful playwrights or artists, as mothers, and as nannies. Sometimes the portrayals perpetuate constraining gender norms. For example, The *Post* categorizes former Philippine president Corazon Aquino as “the first woman president in Asia who rose with power and wings within the confines and sanctuary of her home to stand alone on the open arena of a shifting world order” (Belgica 2009). Belgica normalizes the connection here between women and the home and portrays Aquino as managing her presidency from the confines of her home.

The coverage of beauty pageants in the Filipino newspapers<sup>16</sup> in Montréal is also problematic from a gender standpoint.

Shannon: *And do you think the beauty queens are sex symbols when they're on the front cover or do you think they're simplified?*

Evelyn: To me they are commercialized. Commodity. They don't really see them as human beings with their own brain. My middle son's girlfriend participated in this beauty contest and she said 'never again' because she said it's destroying women's dignity if they fail to get in the final thing and there's also a personal attack between each other. She said it's not a very nice experience.

Some very progressive versions of Filipina femininity surface from the *Post*, evidenced in Veraida's article about playwright Cecille Hernandez. Hernandez is quoted describing how Filipina femininity is reinvented in her play about a young girl who mourns her

---

<sup>16</sup> The third Filipino newspaper in Montréal, the *Filipino Forum* frequently covers beauty pageants and has featured photos of participants in bikinis on its cover. The *Post* and the *Star* give much less attention to beauty pageants, but do also occasionally cover them.

mother by learning an ancient Filipino dance. “In the beginning of the play, we emerge from the fabric slowly. This challenges the audience to see Filipinas in a way that isn’t conventional. We have faces, we look different, we can be sexual but not sex objects. We are strong” (Bermejo 2009).

## 6.2 NANNIES IN THE NEWS

Three of the women I interviewed who work as caregivers had been featured in news articles about the abuses suffered by LCP participants. Propelled into local fame through the articles, two of the women felt their stories had been distorted and found the process of rehashing dark memories of rough times in Canada taxing and damaging. Lith, on the other hand, felt positively about her experience. In our interview, she reflected on the positive impacts of her participation in an interview with her employer that ran in the French-language press in Quebec about her difficulty in getting permanent residency.

*Lith:* In Waterloo<sup>17</sup> they said, “Hi Madame, comment-ça-va? Ça va?” Because they know about my story and they are touched about my story. Being far from my family and how many years it’s been since I’ve seen my family and I wish to be reunited with my family. And then about my situation that one employer kick me out.

*Shannon:* And what did you think of the report?

*Lith:* The impact? I like it because it helps. And I think one officer from the immigration saw – I receive a call from immigration and ask me what happened. The article helped me also to solve my problem, to get my permanent residency.

Lith’s experience speaks to the empowerment that can be derived from being in the news or writing news. Alacantha remembers the feelings of validation she came to know through starting her own zine (Bamboo Zine) “I felt validated, like my words had weight

---

<sup>17</sup> A small city in Quebec where Lith works as a live-in caregiver.

– after all, they were printed officially on paper! That began a feeling of confidence in my own words” (Alacntra 2005: 347).

Pilar had a similar experience with being recognized from news coverage in the *Toronto Star* about her fight to get free medical coverage during her pregnancy. They took her picture and the article was much bigger than Pilar thought it would be.

*Pilar:* I once went to a salon and I was recognized from the newspaper. The ladies at the salon said, ‘is this you?’ they told me that they wished my story was also printed in this and this newspaper to expose all these kinds of things. It’s not that we want to be in *Time Magazine* or something like that, they were the ones thinking of that.

The reaction from the Filipino community in Toronto to Pilar’s news coverage was negative. They thought Pilar had done the interview just to gain popularity. But Pilar shrugged off these attacks by reminding herself that if she didn’t “come out and talk about what I’m going through, people will keep suffering because of systematic barriers.” Looking back, Pilar is thankful for the media attention she received because it was instrumental to having her permanent residency status approved on humanitarian and compassionate grounds. The news stories incited MPs to write to the Canadian Government on her behalf and rallied people around her cause.

Elsa’s reaction to sharing the story of her difficulties during her first year in Canada with the press is different from Lith and Peidad’s.

*Elsa:* I don’t want to be famous or anything like that. I tried to move on. After I did the TV-interview, I said to myself I will never do anything like that again.

*Shannon:* *Why is that?*

*Elsa:* Because I felt that I was remembering my first year.

*Shannon: And you didn't want to remember it?*

*Elsa: It's not that I didn't want to remember it. It was that I want to move on from it. I realized that if I don't say it, no one will know that (abuses through the LCP) are happening. So I just put it on a minimum. I will not do it every month or something like that.*

We have seen here that experiences with being in the news vary among LCP workers. Lith and Pilar were flattered and validated by the recognition they received after being featured in the news. News coverage served a purpose for Pilar and Lith: to sway the government's decision about their applications for permanent residency in their favour. Elsa's experience speaks to the pain involved in giving interviews about LCP exploitation that makes the stuff of most mainstream news articles about the program.

### **6.3 CONCLUSION**

The stereotype that all Filipinas are nannies is perpetuated by the mainstream news. This stereotype is damaging to Filipina's imagination and self-image and is the basis upon which much exploitation in the home operates. Filipino femininity is elaborated in the pages of the *Post* and the *Star* by reports that place Filipinas in many roles other than that of nanny. But these papers still create gender discourses that can stifle creative and individual expressions of Filipina femininity. The real life experiences of three LCP workers with being in the news were examined to demonstrate the ambiguities of collaborations between western journalists and Filipina domestics. The fact that mainstream media outlets are eager to print stories of exploitation among LCP workers can be to the advantage of caregivers encountering difficulties with their immigration status. The media can be operationalized by these women for their own benefit.



## CHAPTER 7 CONCLUSION

The thesis affirms that a transnational lens constitutes the daily experience of Filipino live-in caregivers which is revealed through their differing forms of engagement with both Canadian and Philippine media. Sometimes they eschew the latter for reasons that bring us back to the development agenda. Through detailed investigation of their immigration pathway to Canadian citizenship and an ethnographic investigation of the role transnational media play in their lives, the thesis demonstrates that Philippine LCP migrants in Montréal struggle against the reductiveness accorded to their social identities in both locations and the invisibilization of their contributions to Canada.

For example, as part of the volunteer work I did with PINAY, I was invited to give a news-writing workshop that would build the groups' media skills to ensure the longevity and quality of their quarterly newsletter, *Alingawngaw* (Echoes of Dissent). On eight letter-sized pages stapled together, the winter 2011 issue of *Alingawngaw* features stories by members on the changes to the LCP, conferences PINAY participated in, the Morong 43 Campaign,<sup>18</sup> and the Palestinian Popular Resistance. *Alingawngaw* is also used as a tool for communicating with members and supporters: a list of PINAY achievements in 2010, a preview of International Women's Day activities, and an agenda for PINAY's general assembly were all included in the newsletter. The PINAY executive wanted to encourage more members to contribute to the newsletter, which is why they asked me to animate a news-writing workshop.

---

<sup>18</sup> A campaign launched in September 2010 protesting the illegal detainment of 43 health care workers in the Philippines who were arrested while providing free health care in the shantytowns of Manila.

The workshop was designed to give participants a chance to interview another member and then create a news story based on their notes, which would hopefully eventually get published in *Alingawngaw*. I asked participants to get started by writing down a topic they wanted to be interviewed about and that they thought would make a good news story. The responses included: the G8 summit, vacation, first husband, death of husband, International Women's Day, becoming a permanent resident: the stressful side, non-accreditation of diplomas, gratitude journals, wrongful dismissal, employer doesn't pay salary, friends' love life, and grand reunion with family. These topics attest to the variety of experiences that LCP workers wish to see reflected in the news. They paint a portrait of the fullness of the lives of LCP workers, which entail much more than just being a maid.

Most LCP workers do indeed *work* as maids, though, and their occupation in domestic service factors prominently into their daily-lived realities. Their access to media is sometimes constrained by the long hours they work and their isolation in the home. Other times, their employers broker their access to Canadian media when LCP workers are invited to watch the news at night with the family or when they browse print media offerings in their employers' homes. For individuals who are systematically rendered invisible through the labour processes of their employment, media is a bridge towards the attainment of a public profile. When caregivers are interviewed for news stories, when they write the news, or when they read the news, they exercise a public identity that the LCP systematically effaces. Isolated within their employer's private home, the live-in requirement of the LCP impedes caregivers from living public lives as full citizens in Canada.

Barber defines citizenship as “the relationship between people, governments, and the national territory” (2006: 61). In the context of globalization, Parreñas offers that citizenship “defines one’s sense of belonging” (2001: 1130). The negotiation of belonging is couched in the exclusionary and unequal expressions of citizenship in liberal societies (Barber 2006: 63). Dobrowolosky links the constriction of meaningful citizenship to processes of securitization, marketization, racialization, and invisibilization of women (Dobrowolosky 2007). While citizenship implies that an individual is a “full member of a modern state and as such has legal rights in that state, including the right to vote, hold political office, and claim public benefits,” not all people with citizenship in a given nation state receive the same treatment or are able to claim the same rights (Glick Schiller and Fouron 2001: 24).

The LCP provides a good example of the unevenness of citizenship that Glick Schiller and Fouron point to. It systematically constricts the citizenship rights of its participants through the live-in requirement, which restricts reproductive rights, makes home workers vulnerable to abuse, and denies the division between work and home that is crucial to personal privacy and protection from exploitation. Pratt uses a feminist geographer lens to demonstrate how the identity category of live-in caregivers is defined in opposition to Canadian citizens and how Filipina caregivers are defined along racial and class lines in opposition to the trope of the European nanny (Pratt 2004: 40). The difference between citizen and non-citizen that these oppositional categories operate along forms the basis of the status of LCP workers, which in turn structures their working conditions (41). Pratt also poses important questions about the ways in which Canadians are complicit with the program through an acceptance of the fact that some categories of people living within

Canada are undeserving of protection from the state when it comes to labour, which is extended to other citizens (42). She brings up a question that has also sustained this thesis: what should citizenship in Canada cost? The LCP makes the terms of exchange clear: Filipinas are granted a pathway to immigration and citizenship through years of indentured servitude (45). Live-in caregivers are “differentially included” in the Canadian nation state because they are “deemed integral to the nation’s economy, culture, identity, and power – but integral only or precisely because of their designated subordinate standing” (Espiritu 2003: 47).

Pratt’s analysis echoes Spener’s “global apartheid theory” (Spener 2009). The theory of global apartheid sheds light on how the architecture of immigration and security at borders segregates the world at a global level to bestow control over the world’s wealth upon elites through the simultaneous and systematic exclusion of most of the world’s population (Spener 2009: 14). Under the global apartheid system, one’s passport becomes a “legitimate instrument of discrimination” (14). Global apartheid theory shows that borders are not always just physical elements of geography. Rather, the border can continue to operate on migrants even once they are in the receiving country through ongoing surveillance, incomplete citizenship rights, invisibilization, exclusion, and subjugation. In the case of the LCP and Canada, newly arrived live-in caregivers are denied full citizenship through state policies and racism that circumscribe the possibilities of their daily lived realities and place them in a precarious position in society. Pratt frames these issues geographically by asking how the “effects of discourse emerge out of and extend exploitative north/south international relations through the sedimentation of

Filipina immigrants to Canada within a limited range of low-paid occupations” (Pratt 2004: 66).

The activities of PINAY take on a distinctly civil dimension when the LCP is viewed from a citizenship lens. When PINAY members occupy public space to protest injustices in the Philippines or Canada, they are making “claims to belong to the state through collectively organizing to protect themselves against discrimination, gain rights, or make contributions to the development of that state and the life of the people within it” (Glick Schiller and Fouron 2001: 25). PINAY activities give members an opportunity to “substantively act[] as citizens, whether or not they have the legal documents to recognize such a status” (25).

Filipino media can also be an avenue for LCP workers to negotiate fuller citizenship rights. The *Post* and the *Star* serve the Filipino community in Montréal, to which many of the women I interviewed felt they belonged to. By giving LCP workers a way to exercise their public identities, the *Post* and the *Star* assuage processes within the LCP that restrict the citizenship of participants.

This thesis acknowledges the heterogeneity of the Filipino community in Montréal and the newspapers it produces by looking at a special audience group – LCP workers – and their opinions on two Filipino newspapers. We have seen that the *Star* and the *Post* elaborate Filipino and Filipina transnational identities against the backdrop of the misrepresentations typical in mainstream news. The impact of these elaborated identities is curbed by power dynamics within the Filipino community that play out along class lines and by the narrow distribution range and content focus of the newspapers.

A transnational framework has sustained this study since its inception. Transnationalism is key to the ways in which Filipina domestic workers negotiate their lives in the Philippines and Canada and the structure and content of the *North American Filipino Star* and the *Montreal Pinoy Post* are transnational. Transnationalism remained a productive lens for considering the role of media in the lives of live-in caregivers because they certainly do live transnational lives that span borders and the newspapers they read reflect this transnational orientation. Some women told me that they elected not to read about Philippine politics because they found them too challenging and difficult. They preferred to shut out information about corruption and mismanagement of their home state, which factored into their decision to leave the Philippines and secure a better life for their families in the first place. The political disruption and chaos in the Philippines brings us back to questions about development. Development discourse both creates and responds to the unequal positioning of countries and people within countries on the global stage.

The gulf in power, stability, and resources separating the first world and the third world shape global migration flows, which tend to involve people from poor places moving to richer places. The conditions of poverty that arise as a consequence of free trade and neoliberalism compel individuals in the third world to imagine and pursue life outside of their home country, where access to employment, education, and welfare may be more complete. It is important to remember that bureaucrats and politicians in indebted and low-income countries plan and promote the export of their workers to the developed world as a development strategy. Such strategies are based on the belief that remittances from emigrant populations feed the foreign currency coffers of developing countries, curb social unrest, contribute to livelihood, education, and health care provision for families

left behind, and stimulate consumption. Those who sing the praises of remittances often omit the realities migrants face in Canada in order to send money home: labour exploitation, deskilling, racial discrimination, feelings of not belonging, and separation from loved ones.

Development replaced earlier colonial architecture of dependence and extraction and involves the provisioning of aid through diplomatic ties between specific countries. Due to its zealous belief in modernization and its insistence on a unique western path to economic prosperity, the development discourse portrays third world peasants as backwards and traditional (Escobar 1995: 161). Such representations reflect back an aura of superiority on the west that was both modern and powerful enough to impose its modern implements on third world farmers. In order to justify western interventions based on its scientific and modern knowledge, an image of the third world as underdeveloped first needed to be produced. When migrants from the third world move to richer countries, the categories imposed upon them through development discourse continue to define their profiles in the eyes of destination country nationals. “The Third World is no longer ‘out there’ in some far off land; it is ‘here’ and located within the so-called First World. In fact, every large-scale metropolitan city in America harbors several small Third Worlds whose relations of power within the metropolis appear to duplicate in large measure the previous relations between the Third World and the First World” (Naficy 1993: 4). Indeed, the representation of the third world and its people can form the basis of cultural racism directed against migrants in host societies. Cultural racism ‘others’ newcomers in order to produce a concrete image of Canada and instills feelings of inferiority and self-deprecation among new comers. Barber observes that the

propensity for depictions of sealed-off and homogenous communities in western immigration discourses – which we have also seen accomplished through the mainstream media – is a mechanism through which insiders and outsiders are produced (2006: 68). To create a natural image of itself, powerful Canadians assign ‘otherness’ to newcomers (68).

Migration viewed through a development lens elucidates the ways in which global dynamics of power shape both the movements of people and the lives they lead in receiving countries. The political economic forces that give rise to Filipina women on the move arise from a context of colonialism and development. Immigration does not always constitute a moment of forced severance, and can in fact for some migrants feel like a new birth. Excited by the chance to leave behind an old life and start a new one, the cusp of migration can be exhilarating for those who regard their departure as a part of an adventure, a way to discover the world, and expand or improve themselves, as my interview with Elsa revealed.

*Elsa:* When my mom told me about the LCP, I was excited for sure. I’m going to go to another country. And I thought, ‘you know what?’ I’ll go to Canada and it’s like starting all over again. It’s like a chance to change. Coming to Canada was like a chance to change all my faults. It felt like I was being reborn.

## **7.1 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY**

While this study never could have happened without PINAY, the focus in my participant observation and interviews on PINAY members biases my work. PINAY members are introduced to a discourse on the exploitation of women’s migration from the Philippines and the LCP that was often referred to during the interviews I conducted. While this



thesis is about live-in caregivers in Montréal, it is greatly informed by the activist caregivers I met through PINAY.

Migration scholars remind us always that a single-sited approach to migration only tells half the story. To fully investigate how migration – and its specific institutionalization through the LCP – circumscribes citizenship, both the Philippines and in Canada must be considered. Similarly, the study of transnational media in Montréal would be improved by incorporating an investigation of how media from Canada is read and written about in the Philippines. Such a move would acknowledge the circular nature of transnational media flowing across porous borders.

## **7.2 AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS**

Looking at news from the Philippines in Montréal grows out of the transnational turn in migration studies and acknowledges that immigrants in Canada sustain social, political, financial, kin, and other ties to the countries they came from. Some recent literature on transnationalism critiques the approach for disregarding the rootedness of some migrants who settle permanently in their new homes and elect not to sustain a connection with their countries of origin (Espiritu 2003: 3). Filipino newspapers testify to both the rootedness and the rootlessness of migrants in Montréal, signifying that Espiritu's critique can in fact be compatible with a transnational approach. The *Star* and the *Post* are produced by teams of people who have settled in Montréal and who have permanent networks within the city through which they go about the process of making news. The audience they write for is often assumed to have transnational interests in the Philippines and capable of transnational acts such as donating, sending remittances, voting, and imagining that involve both the Philippines and Canada. The *Star* and the *Post* are both deeply knitted in

to the social fabric of Montréal by nature of their production within the bounds of the city and deeply invested in sustaining connections to the Philippines for readers. Examining the implications of the newspapers on the permanency of settlement for its producers would be a worthwhile area of further research.

Single-sited migration studies that apply a transnational framework can overlook the ways in which the lives of Filipinos in the Philippines who do not migrate can also live transnational lives. Immigration is a culturally normal phenomenon in the Philippines and most families have at least one family member abroad. Foreign pop culture, commercial goods, news, and information reach Filipinos in the Philippines from far-flung places via transnational family networks or by virtue of the conditions set in our increasingly globalized world. The media diet of the family members Filipina domestic workers leave behind in the Philippines when they participate in the LCP may include news about Canada, for example. These family members in the Philippines may keep up with news about Canada for the same reasons LCP workers in Montréal told me they kept up with news about the Philippines: to scan for natural disasters, to ensure their family members were safe, and to get educated about the Philippines or Canada so they could intelligently handle queries. Further studies on immigration and transnational media should investigate flows of Canadian media into the Philippines and especially its significance to people there with family members in Canada or who aspire to migrate to Canada themselves. Emmy read a news story about a Filipino elementary student in Montréal who was punished and scolded for eating his lunch with a spoon and a fork (which is culturally normal in the Philippines) when she was in the Philippines before she ever made the journey to Montréal through the LCP.

*Shannon: What about the fork and spoon incident?*

*Emmy: Actually when I heard that one I was still in the Philippines. And I was like, “oh what’s that?” Because in the Philippines, we use a fork and spoon which was introduced to us by the Spanish. And we are used to it.*

*Shannon: Do you think it was fair that they got mad at him for that?*

*Emmy: No.*

*Shannon: Did you feel mad?*

*Emmy: I feel bad. Because it’s just about a fork and spoon. And it’s a big deal?*

Media can be a powerful force in creating ideas about places one has never visited, as seen here with Emmy making judgments about Canada while still in the Philippines. Emmy’s critique of the prejudice evidenced in the fork and spoon incident inverts Espiritu’s positioning of American media’s formative role in creating a colonial relationship between the US and the Philippines. American media saturates the Philippine imagination, according to Espiritu, who links her own admiration for American cultural products to the pervasiveness of Nancy Drew, *Little Women*, *Life*, *Reader’s Digest*, *National Geographic* in her media diet (73). She learned to feel American by reading American media, which provided a cultural roadmap to what the US stood for and how its citizens behaved. Further research on media and minorities would be enriched by attention to how media from countries that receive Filipino migrants circulates within the Philippines and the feelings of admiration or disapproval they inspire.

Under contemporary conditions of globalization, media vectors cross borders and bring disparate social worlds into contact with one another. It is important to remember, though, that these media vectors are not all equal in force and media from powerful nations tends to penetrate less powerful nations more completely than the other way around. That is to

say that American and international news and media is more pervasive in the Philippines than Filipino media is in Canada. Filipino newspapers in Montréal help tip this balance by strengthening the presence of media about the Philippines in Montréal. The success of the ethnic media is crucial to fighting racism and trying to ensure that representations of minorities do not damage popular opinion or self-esteem. A policy recommendation that arises from my research is that the Canadian government should ensure the survival of ethnic media outlets through financial support. Similarly, mainstream media outlets would be wise to scan ethnic newspapers for stories and to collaborate with immigrant journalists to reduce the symbolic violence of mainstream misrepresentations of migrants.

This project is a first step in moving beyond studies of LCP work that remain isolated within the private homes of employers. LCP workers' lives also take place before and after they arrive at their employers' homes, and scholarship on domestic work in Canada must reflect that in more diverse ways. The news media habits of LCP workers help us to arrive at a more complete picture of their lives but other aspects must be considered to achieve even greater fullness. These could include looking at LCP workers' experiences with recertification, romantic relationships in Canada, public transportation, healthcare, racism, and studying French in Quebec, among others. The ethnographic evidence marshaled throughout this thesis attests to the impossibility of making generalizations about groups of migrants, even when they share the same entry route (the LCP) and similar working conditions (in domestic service). The media is a bridge to the public lives of live-in caregivers in their efforts to break the isolation of domestic work in Canada.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abdon, Al. "Ask the video guy: video projects for children." *The North American Filipino Star* August 2009: 10.
- ACNA Canada. Association of Caregiver & Nanny agencies Canada. "The Live-in Caregiver Program in Canada is in Serious Trouble". July 5, 2010. Free Press Release. <<http://www.free-press-release.com/news-the-live-in-caregiver-program-in-canada-is-in-serious-trouble-1278349903.html>>
- ACNA Canada. Association of Caregiver & Nanny agencies Canada. "The Live-in Caregiver Program in Canada is in Serious Trouble" *North American Filipino Star* September 2010: 11.
- Anderson, Bridget. *Doing the Dirty Work?: The Global Politics of Domestic Labour*. London: Zed Books, 2000.
- Appadurai, Arjun. "Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy." *Anthropology of Globalization, a Reader*. Ed: Jonathan Xavier Inda and Renato Rosaldo. Oxford: Blackwell publishers Ltd, 2002.
- Bakan, Abigail B, and Daiva K. Stasiulis. *Not One of the Family: Foreign Domestic Workers in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997. Print.
- Barba, Bernadette "Bangg." "A sports' life". *The North American Filipino Star* August 2009: 10.
- Barber, Pauline Gardiner. "Transnational Lives: Gendered Work and New Social Fields in Coastal Philippines." *Culture*, 15.2 (1995): 5-26.
- Barber, Pauline Gardiner. "Contradictions of Class and Consumption When the Commodity Is Labour." *Anthropologica*. 46.2 (2004): 203-218.
- Barber, Pauline Gardiner. "Locating Gendered Subjects in Vocabularies of Citizenship." *Women, Migration, and Citizenship: Making Local, National, and Transnational Connections*. Eds. E. Tastsoglou and A. Dobrowolsky. London: Ashgate, 2006.
- Barber, Pauline Gardiner. "The Ideal Immigrant? Gendered Class Subjects in Philippine Canada Migration." *Third World Quarterly* 29.7 (2008): 1265-1285.
- Barber, Pauline Gardiner. "Cell phones, complicity, and class politics in the Philippine labor diaspora." *Class, Contention, and a World in Motion*. Eds. Winnie Lem and Pauline Gardiner Barber. New York: Berghahn Books, 2010.
- Belgica, Elenita. "A Call for Leadership" *Montreal Pinoy Post*. July-August 2009.

- Bermejo, Veraida-Lyn. From One Mother to Another. *Montreal Pinoy Post*. November December 2009.
- Basch, Linda Green, Nina Glick Schiller, and Cristina Szanton Blanc. *Nations Unbound: Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments, and Deterritorialized Nation States*. London, Routledge, 1994.
- Billones, Amir. "First World Filipinos dreaming of a First World Philippines." *North American Filipino Star* Aug 2009, 17.
- Bird, S E. *The Anthropology of News & Journalism: Global Perspectives*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010. Print.
- Block, Irwin. "Fraudsters steal family's Christmas dream." *Montreal Gazette*. 22 Dec 2010, A8.
- Bonifacio, Glenda Lynna Anne Tibe. "A Bridge too Far: Filipino Caregivers, Education, and the Labor Market in Canada." *Perspectives on Labour shortages, Exploring the Education-Jobs Gap*. Conference at the University of Alberta: Lethbridge, 2008
- Calhoun, Craig J. *Habermas and the Public Sphere*. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 1992.
- Calugay, Evelyn. "The costs of the LCP: who should pay?" *PINAY blog*. 20 Sept 2010.
- Cheng, Hau Ling. "Constructing a Transnational, Multilocal Sense of Belonging: An Analysis of Ming Pao (West Canadian Edition)." *Journal of Communication Inquiry*. 29(2005): 141-159.
- Choy, Catherine Ceniza. "Asian American History: Reflections on Imperialism, Immigration, and 'the Body'." *Pinay Power: Peminist Critical Theory: Theorizing the Filipina / American Experience*. Ed. Melinda L De Jesús. New York: Routledge, 2005.
- CIC Citizenship and Immigration Canada. "The Live-in Caregiver Program: Who can apply." *cic.gc.ca* 3 Feb 2011. <<http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/work/caregiver/apply-who.asp>>
- CIC Citizenship and Immigration Canada. "News Release: Minister Kenney proposes significant improvements to the Live-in Caregiver Program." *cic.gc.ca* 14 Dec 2009. 16 Feb 2011. <<http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/releases/2009/2009-12-12.asp>>
- Clifford, James. *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1997.

- Cohen, Robin. *Migration and Its Enemies: Global Capital, Migrant Labour, and the Nation-State*. Aldershot, Hampshire, England: Ashgate, 2006. Print.
- Constable, Nicole. *Maid to order in Hong Kong*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1997.
- Cunningham, Stuart and John Sinclair. *Floating Lives: The media and Asian diasporas*. St. Lucia: University of Queensland Press, 2000.
- Cunningham, Stuart. "Popular media as 'public sphericules' for diasporic communities." *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 4.131 (2001): 147.
- Daly, Perla Paredes. "Creating NewFilipina.com and the Rise of the CyberPinays." *Pinay Power: Peminist Critical Theory: Theorizing the Filipina / American Experience*. Ed. Melinda L de Jesús. New York and London: Routledge, 2005.
- De Jesús, Melinda L. *Pinay Power: Peminist Critical Theory: Theorizing the Filipina / American Experience*. New York and London: Routledge, 2005.
- De Jesús, Melinda. "Fictions of assimilation: Nancy Drew, Cultural Imperialism and the Filipina/American Experience." *Pinay Power: Peminist Critical Theory: Theorizing the Filipina / American Experience*. New York and London: Routledge, 2005.
- Dobrowolsky, A. "(In)Security and Citizenship: Security, Im/migration and Shrinking Citizenship Regimes." *Theoretical inquiries in Law*. 8.2 (2007): 628-66.
- Ebron, Grace. "Not Just the Maid: Negotiating Filipina Identity in Italy." *Intersections Gender, History and Culture in the Asian Context*. 8 (2002).
- Ehrenreich, Barbara and Arlie Russell Hoschschild. *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the new economy*. New York: Metropolitan Books, 2002.
- Eley, Geoff. "Nations, Publics, and Political Cultures: Placing Habermas in the Nineteenth Century." *Habermas and the Public Sphere*. Ed. Calhoun, Craig J. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 1992.
- Embassy of Canada. "Application Kit– Live-In Caregiver Program." Canadian Embassy: Manila. December 2009.
- Engelhart, Katie. "Granny nannies: This new class of caregiver is booming, and quite unregulated." *Macleans.ca*. January 14, 2010.
- Enloe, Cynthia H. *Bananas, Beaches & Bases: Making Feminist Sense of International Politics*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.

- Escobar, Arturo. *Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World*. Princeton, N.J: Princeton University Press, 1995.
- Espiritu, Yen L. *Home Bound: Filipino American Lives Across Cultures, Communities, and Countries*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003.
- Fleras, Augie and Jean Lock Kunz. *Media and Minorities. Representing diversity in a multicultural Canada*. Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing inc, 2001.
- Fleras, Augie. "Ethnic and Aboriginal media in Canada: Crossing Borders, Constructing Buffers, Creating Bonds, Building Bridges." In *Media, Migration, Integration: European and North American Perspectives*. Eds: Geissler, Rainer, and Horst öttker. Bielefeld: Transcript, 2009.
- Friesen, Joe. "The Philippines now Canada's top source of immigrants." *Globe and Mail*. 18 Mar 2011. Web. 14 Apr 2011.
- Giles, Wenona and Sedef Arat-Koç. *Maid in the Market: Women's paid domestic labour*. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 1994. Print.
- Government of Canada. "Response to the Report of the Standing Committee on Citizenship and Immigration: *Temporary Foreign Workers and Non-Status Workers*". *parl.gc.ca 19 Aug 2009*. <<http://www2.parl.gc.ca/House/Publications/Publication.aspx?DocId=4017803&Language=e&Mode=1&Parl=40&Ses=2>>
- Gupta, Akhil and James Ferguson. *Culture, power, place. Explorations in critical anthropology*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1997.
- Habermas, Jürgen. *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into Category of Bourgeois Society*. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 1991.
- Hall, Stuart. "New Ethnicities." *Stuart Hall: Critical Dialogues in Cultural Studies*. Ed: Stuart Hall, David Morley, and Kuan-Hsing Chen. London: Routledge, 1996.
- Harvey, David. *The New Imperialism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Harvey, David. *Spaces of Global Capitalism*. London: Verso, 2006.
- Hochschild, Arlie Russell. *The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983.
- Hochschild, Arlie Russell. "Love and Gold." *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Se Workers in the new economy*. Eds. Barbara Ehrenreich and Arlie Russell Hochschild. New York: Metropolitan Books, 2002.



- HRSDC Human Resources and Skills Development Canada. "Temporary Foreign Worker Program: Live-in Caregiver Program." *rhdcc-hrsc.gc.ca* 2011. 24 Mar 2011 <[http://www.rhdcc-hrsc.gc.ca/eng/workplaceskills/foreign\\_workers/lcpdir/lcpone.shtml](http://www.rhdcc-hrsc.gc.ca/eng/workplaceskills/foreign_workers/lcpdir/lcpone.shtml)>
- Ignacio, Emily. *Building Diaspora: Filipino Community Formation on the Internet*. New Brunswick, N.J: Rutgers University Press, 2005a.
- Ignacio, Emily Noelle . "Ain't I a Filipino (Woman)?: An Analysis of Authorship/Authority through the Construction of Filipino/Filipina on the Net." *Pinay Power: Peminist Critical Theory: Theorizing the Filipina / American Experience*. New York and London: Routledge, 2005b: 239-259.
- Jiwani, Yasmin. "On the outskirts of Empire: Race and Gender in Canadian TV News." *Painting the Maple, essays on race, gender, and the construction of Canada*. Eds: Veronice Strong-Boag et al. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998.
- Jiwani, Yasmin. *Discourses of Denial: Mediations of Race, Gender, and Violence*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2006.
- Kama, Amit. "Labor migrants' Self-Empowerment via Participation in a Diasporic Magazine: Filipinos at Manila-Tel Aviv." *Asian journal of Communication*.18:3 (2008): 223-238.
- Kalb, Don. "'Bare legs like ice': recasting class for local/global inquiry. *Critical Junctions: Anthropology and History Beyond the Cultural Turn*. Eds. Don Kalb and Herman Tak. New York: Berghahn Books, 2005.
- Kelly, Philip et al. "Profile of Live-in Caregiver Immigrants to Canada, 1993-2009." *Toronto Immigrant Employment Data Initiative*. TIEDI Analytical Report 18. March 2011.
- Kunz, Rahel. "Remittances are Beautiful"? Gender Implications of the New Global Remittances Trend." *Third World Quarterly*. 29.7 (2008): 1389-1409.
- Lem, Winnie, and Pauline G. Barber. *Class, Contention, and a World in Motion*. New York: Berghahn Books, 2010.
- Li, Peter S., and Yahong Li. "The Consumer Market of the Enclave Economy: A Study of Advertisements in a Chinese Daily Newspaper in Toronto." *Canadian Ethnic Studies* 31.2 (1999).
- Li, Peter S. "Deconstructing Canada's Discourse of Immigration Integration." *Journal of International Migration and Integration*. 4.3 (2003a): 315-333.
- Li, Peter S. "The Place of Immigrants: The Politics of Difference in Territorial and Social Space." *Canadian Ethnic Studies* 35.2 (2003b): 1-13.

- Macklin, Audrey. "On the inside looking out: foreign domestic workers in Canada." *Maid in the Market: Women's paid domestic labour*. Ed. Wenona Giles and Sedef Arat-Koç. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 1994.
- Mahler, Sarah and Patricia Pessar. "Gender Matters: Ethnographers bring Gender from the Periphery toward the Core of Migration Studies" *International Migration Review* 40.1(2006): 27-63.
- Mahtani, Minelle. "Representing minorities: Canadian Media and Minority Identities." *Canadian Ethnic Studies* 33.3 (2001): 99-133.
- Mahtani, Minelle. "How are Immigrants Seen - and What do they Want to See? Contemporary Research on the Representation of Immigrants in the Canadian English-Language Media." *Immigration and Integration in Canada in the Twenty-First Century*. Eds. James Frideres, M L. Burstein, and John Biles. Kingston: Queen's University Press, 2008: 231-251. Print.
- Mahtani, Minelle. "The Racialized Geographies of News Consumption and Production: Contaminated Memories and Racialized silences." *GeoJournal*. 74 (2009): 257-264.
- Malkki, Liisa H. "National Geographic: The Rooting of Peoples and the Territorialization of National Identity among Scholars and Refugees." *Culture, power, place. Explorations in critical anthropology*. Eds. Akhil Gupta and James Ferguson. Durham and London: Duke University Press. 1997.
- Marchand, Marianne H. "The Future of Gender and Development after 9/11: insights from postcolonial feminism and transnationalism." *Third World Quarterly* 30.5 (2009)
- Marx, Karl and Friedrich Engels. (1848). *The Communist Manifesto*. Bompacrazy.com, 2003. web.
- Maynard, Robyn and Sophie Le-Phat Ho. "Accommodate This! A Feminist and Anti Racist Response to the "Reasonable Accommodation" *Women and Canadian Multiculturalism: Canadian Woman Studies*. 27.2.3 (2009): 21-26.
- McKay, Deirdre. "Filipinas in Canada – De-skilling as a Push Toward Marriage" *Wife or Worker?: Asian Women and Migration*. Ed. Nicola Piper and Mina Roces. Lanham: Md: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2003. Print.
- Mendez, Jennifer Bickham. "Of Mops and Maids: Contradictions and Continuities in Bureaucratized Domestic Work" *Social Problems*, 45.1 (1998): 114-135.

- Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism*. Eds. Chandra T Mohanty, Ann Russo, and Lourdes Torres. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991.
- Montgomery, Sue. "Our readers rally for nanny." *Montreal Gazette* 28 Dec 2010, A8.
- Morley, David. "Theories of Consumption in Media Studies." *Cultural studies, an Anthology*. Ed: Michael Ryan. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2003.
- Naficy, Hamid. *The Making of Exile Cultures: Iranian Television in Los Angeles*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993.
- Nakano Glenn, Evelyn. "From servitude to service work: The historical continuities of women's paid and unpaid reproductive labor." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 18.1 (1992): 1-44.
- Ong, Aihwa. *Flexible citizenship: The cultural logics of transnationality*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1999.
- Opiniano, Jeremiah M. "More Remittances From Women Emphasize Feminization of Migration — ADB Study". *Tinig.com* 30 Sept 2005. 22 Mar 2011.  
<<http://www.tinig.com/2005/11/30/more-remittances-from-women-emphasize-feminization-of-migration-adb-study/>>
- Regulatory and administrative changes to the Live-in Caregiver Program. Operational Bulletin 192 – April 1, 2010. Citizenship and Immigration Canada. April 1, 2010.  
<http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/resources/manuals/bulletins/2010/ob192.asp>
- Ojo, Tokunbo. "Ethnic Print Media in the Multicultural Nation of Canada." *Journalism*. 7.3 (2006): 343-361.
- Ong, Aihwa. "Women out of China: Traveling Tales and Traveling Theories in Postcolonial Feminism." *Women Writing Culture*. Eds. Ruth Behar and Deborah A. Gordon. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995.
- Ong, Aihwa. *Flexible Citizenship: The Cultural Logics of Transnationality*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1999.
- Oxman-Martinez, Jacqueline, Jill Hanley, and Leslie Cheung. "An analysis of an Action Research Survey Conducted by PINAY, the Quebec Filipino Women's Association with the Centre for Applied Family Studies." *Centre de recherche Interuniversitaire de Montréal sur L'immigration, l'intégration, et la dynamique urbaine*. 24 (2004).

- Park, R.E. and E. Bruggess. *Introduction to the Science of Sociology (1921 Reprint)*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969.
- Parreñas, Rhacel Salazar. "Transgressing the Nation State: the Partial Citizenship and 'Imagined' (Global) Community of Migrant Filipina Domestic Workers. *Signs. Globalization and Gender* 26.4 (2001): 1129-1154.
- Parreñas, Rhacel Salazar. *Servants of Globalization. Women, Migration, and Domestic Work*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001b.
- Parreñas, Rhacel Salazar. "Migrant Filipina Workers and the International Division of Reproductive Labor" *Gender and Society* 14:4 (August 2000): 560-580.
- Pessar, Patricia and Sarah Mahler. "Transnational Migration: Bringing Gender In" *International Migration Review* 37.3 (2003): 812-846.
- PINAY and the McGill School of Social Work. *Warning! Domestic work can be dangerous to your immigration status, health, safety, and wallet!: A report on the findings of a community-based survey of the work conditions of Montréal domestic workers* (2008).
- PINAY. *Alingawngaw* (Echoes of Dissent). Winter Issue, Feb 2001.
- Piper, Nicola. *New Perspectives on Gender and Migration: Livelihood, Rights and Entitlements*. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Pratt, Geraldine. "Research Performances." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*. 18(2000): 639-651.
- Pratt, Geraldine. *Working Feminism*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2004.
- Ratha, Dilip and Zhimei Xu. *Migration and remittances factbook 2008*. World Bank Publications: 2008.
- Sassen, Saskia. "Global cities and survival circuits." *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy*. Eds. Barbara Ehrenreich and Arlie Russell Hoschschild. New York: Metropolitan Books, 2002.
- Schiller, Nina G, and Georges E. Fournon. *Georges Woke Up Laughing: Long-distance Nationalism and the Search for Home*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2001.
- Scott, Marian. "'It's like you're in jail,' Filipina domestics say." *Montreal Gazette*. 18 Mar 2011, A12.
- Shi, Yu. "Re-evaluating the 'Alternative' Role of Ethnic Media in the US: the Case of Chinese-language Press and Working-class Women Readers." *Media, Culture & Society*. 31.4 (2009): 597-616.

- Sparks, Holloway. "Dissident Citizenship: Democratic Theory, Political Courage, and Activist Women." *Hypatia*. 12.4 (1997): 74–110.
- Spener, David. *Clandestine Crossings: Migrants and Coyotes on the Texas-Mexico Border*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2009.
- Spitzer, Denise L, and Sara Torres. *Gender-based Barriers to Settlement and Integration for Live-in-Caregivers: A Review of the Literature*. Toronto, Ont: CERIS – The Ontario Metropolis Centre, 2008.
- Stasiulis, Daiva K. and Abigail B. Bakan. *Negotiating Citizenship: Migrant Women in Canada and the Global System*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005.
- Statistics Canada. City profile: Montréal. 2006.
- Steill, Bernadette and Kim England. "Jamaican Domestic Workers, Filipina Housekeepers and English Nannies: Representations of Toronto's Foreign Domestic Workers." *Gender, Migration, and Domestic Service*. Ed: Janet Henshall Momsen. London & New York: Routledge, 1999.
- Tilson, David. "Temporary Foreign Workers and Non-Status Workers." Report of the Standing Committee on Citizenship and Immigration. *House of Commons Canada*. May 2009 <<http://www2.parl.gc.ca/HousePublications/Publication.aspx?Language=e&Mode=1&Parl=40&Ses=2&DocId=3866154&File=9>>
- Tomei, Manuela. "Decent work for domestic workers: Towards New International Labour Standards." *World of Work: The Magazine of the ILO*. 68 (2010): 4-7.
- Tremblay, Gerald. "Message from Montréal." *The Montreal Pinoy Post*. 1.4. Sept-Oct 2009, 2.
- Tufte, Thomas. "Minority Youth, Media Uses and Identity Struggle: the Role of the Media in the Production of Locality." *Black marks: Minority Ethnic Audiences and Media*. Eds. Karen Ross and Peter Playdon. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001.
- UNFPA. "State of World Population 2006." A Passage to Hope: Women and International Migration. A Mighty but Silent River: Women and Migration. *unfpa.org*. 2 Mar 2011  
<[http://www.unfpa.org/swp/2006/english/chapter\\_2/index.html](http://www.unfpa.org/swp/2006/english/chapter_2/index.html)>
- Viswanath, K and Pamela Arora. "Ethnic Media in the US: An Essay in their Role in Integration, Assimilation, and Social Control." *Mass Communication and Society*. 3.1 (2000): 39–56.

- Wahl-Jorgensen, Karin. "News Production, Ethnography, and Power: on the Challenges of Newsroom-Centricity." *The Anthropology of News & Journalism: Global Perspectives*. Ed. S Elizabeth Bird. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010.
- Wanning, Sun. "Media and the Chinese Diaspora: Community, Consumption, and Transnational Imagination." *Journal of Chinese Overseas*. 1.1( 2005): 65–86.
- Wimmer, Andreas and Nina Glick Schiller. "Methodological Nationalism, the Social Sciences, and the Study of Migration: An Essay in Historical Epistemology." *International Migration Review*. 37.3 (2003): 576-610.
- World Bank. "Migration and Remittances Factbook 2011." *World Bank Publications: 2011*.
- Yu, Sherry S. and Catherine A. Murray. "Ethnic Media under a Multicultural Policy: The Case of the Korean Media in British Columbia." *Canadian Ethnic Studies*. 39.3 (2007): 99-124.
- Zhou Min and Guoxuan Cai. "Chinese Language Media in the United States: Immigration and Assimilation in American Life" *Qualitative Sociology*. 25.3 (2002): 419-441.

**APPENDIX A TABLE OF LCP INTERVIEWEES<sup>19</sup>**

Pseudonym	Pilar	Tess	Emmy	Twinny	Elsa	Lith	Escada	Piedad
Age	36	~40, <sup>20</sup>	~40	47	32	46	40	26
Arrival date in Canada	2005	2005	2009	2008	2002	2005	2009	2009
Length of time in Canada	Five years	Five years	One year and a half	Two and a half years	Eight years	Five years	One and half years	One and a half years
Immigration Status	Permanent resident	Temporary foreign worker (caregiver class)	Temporary foreign worker (caregiver class)	Temporary foreign worker (caregiver class)	Canadian Citizen	Permanent resident	Temporary foreign worker (caregiver class)	Temporary foreign worker (caregiver class)
Children	One son (born in Canada, age: 2.5 years)	Three children (two daughters and a son)	Three children (one son and two daughters)	Three sons	None	Three children (two sons and one daughter)	Two children, (a son and a daughter)	None
Marital Status	Divorced	Married to a man in the Philippines	Married to a man in the Philippines	Married to a man in the Philippines	Married to a Canadian man	Married, recently sponsored her husband	Single	Single

<sup>19</sup> Demographic and migration/employment history information about eight of the women I interviewed is summarized here. The ninth woman I spoke to, Dora, did not provide me with any demographic information. Our conversation was much briefer than the eight interviews represented here, which typically lasted 1.5 - two hours.

<sup>20</sup> In some interview settings, it seemed inappropriate to ask certain demographic, migration, or employment questions. Omitting these questions helped in establishing trust and comfort. Tess and Emmy's ages are estimates, as I did not ask them how old they were in our interview.

Pseudonym	Pilar	Tess	Emmy	Twinnny	Elsa	Lith	Escada	Piedad
Wage	\$250 - \$300	?	?	\$290 - \$400	\$250	\$250	\$315 - \$400	\$310
Monthly remittances	\$300	?	?	\$1,000	\$800 when she first arrived. Elsa no longer remits.	?	\$500	Irregularly remits back to her mother and grandmother
Location, nature, and length of migrant work prior to arrival in Canada	N/A, Canada is the first overseas country Pilar has worked	Worked as a domestic helper in Hong Kong for three months	Worked in neonatal patient out-care in a hospital in Saudi Arabia for three years	Worked as a maid and nanny in Paris for five and a half years	N/A, Canada is the first overseas country Elsa has worked	Worked as a nanny in Hong Kong for twelve years	Worked as a nanny in Hong Kong for twelve years	Worked as a geriatric nurse for two years in Taipei, Taiwan. Worked in geriatric patient out-care in Riyadh, Saudi Arabia for 10 months.
Occupation / education in the Philippines prior to out migration	Pilar used to own a small financing business. She has a bachelors degree in physiotherapy	Tess tended to her family's rice farm and managed the household	Registered midwife	Twinnny ran a money-lending business for 11 years. Her degree is in secretarial administration and worked as a secretary for five years prior to starting her own business.	Two semesters away from completing a Bachelor's of Psychology	Garment factory worker	Registered midwife	Registered nurse
Total number of years of family separation	Five years from her parents (Pilar's son was born in Canada)	Six years	Five years	Eight and a half years	Eight years, but half of her family lives Canada	17 years	13.5 years	Four and a half years





## Long census form debate lingers on



Ottawa — The Canadian Press  
Published on Monday, Aug. 16, 2010  
4:59PM EDT Last updated on Monday,  
Aug. 16, 2010 5:33PM EDT

The NDP is calling for an emergency debate on the Conservative government's controversial census changes.

Party leader Jack Layton sent a letter to the Speaker of the Commons today asking for a debate on the "integrity of the census" when the House resumes next month.

He made the call as the Commons industry committee met to discuss the census issue.

The Conservatives have been facing heavy criticism since they announced in July that they are making the long-form census voluntary.

They argue that the survey, which has been mandatory, is too intrusive.

But experts say a narrower cross-section of society will participate in any voluntary survey, making the data less representative and incomparable to previous census surveys.

"The ability to change the long form diminishes with each passing day, as printing deadlines loom and preparations by Statistics Canada proceed," Mr. Layton wrote in his letter.

"At stake, of course, is the continuity and reliability of the country's historic data on which so many Canadians and their institutions depend."

Last week, the government blinked in the face of a francophone group's court challenge, but it's still refusing to bend on its overall plan to scrap the mandatory long-form census.

Industry Minister Tony Clement announced last Wednesday that the government will add three questions

See Page 4      Census



**FEATURED  
OP. ED.**

*By Budz  
Sarmiento*

See Page 5

## FAMAS receives accolades for a successful town festival

See Report on Page 4



Contents	
Editorial .....	2
Cooperative News .....	3
Any Which Way (Op.Ed.) .....	5
Earth Talk .....	8
Tagalog Corner .....	9
Ask the Video Guy .....	10
Philippine Cuisine .....	15
Showbiz Gossip .....	17
Classified Ads.....	21

Photo on the left shows Father Frank Alvarez celebrating mass for the Philippine community in Montreal during the annual town fiesta called "Pista sa Nayon" organized by FAMAS, July 18, 2010 at MacKenzie King Park on Cote Ste Catherine Road.(Photo by Budz Sarmiento)

## Editorial

### Bringing the community closer together

In reading about community unity the following excerpt is quoted to underscore the values which can be derived from this idea:

*Individuals and families function within the context of a community, which in turn functions within a larger society, nation, and world. The individuals and families well-being is bound up with the community's well-being, and likewise its well-being is inseparable from the peace and prosperity of the society, the nation, and ultimately, the world. Religious precepts undergird community by teaching the virtues of cooperation, friendship, justice, and public-mindedness. These create the spirit of unity by which community can thrive and prosper.*

As can be gleaned from the above quote, unity promotes a healthy relationship starting from within a family, among friends and neighbors, different communities, countries, and the whole world. It is also conducive to the development of many virtues which include generosity, industry, teamwork, cooperation and fellowship. These are essential aspects of living a full and better life.

In spite of obvious benefits, community unity is often elusive or difficult to achieve. For example, in the Philippine community in Montreal, many leaders often speak about their wish for unity but they appear to be just rendering lip service to its promotion. Furthermore, many associations are regularly formed out of the same regionalistic tendencies of people to band together because of their common dialects, common origins and interests. Perhaps, there is really nothing wrong with this social phenomenon except when it causes some unintended results of competition among themselves in trying to sell tickets to their anniversaries and other celebrations to raise funds. After all, they have to offer these tickets to the same people in the community. On the other hand, there may be a way to make these associations become united in pursuing a common goal of community unity by forming a town hall meeting of sorts. If their leaders are willing to participate in a friendly debate of issues, they could discover that there are really more similarities than differences among themselves.

In fact, we believe that the recent controversies published in this paper over the past three months may have contributed to the public's awareness that things must change if we want to have unity in this community. We have to develop a sense of balance and to believe that for every question, there are always two sides. To be fair, we believe that everyone has the right to express his or her opinion. As a newspaper, our responsibility is to provide our readers information in a timely manner and to allow them to make their own opinions from what they read or hear. It is important for us to help promote good citizenship and positive values. But our utmost desire is to promote community unity. This is the reason why we often write about the cooperative movement as we believe that supporting a social economy enterprise is one of the ways to empower our citizens economically as well as socially and politically.

We hope that the recent, unusual articles that appeared in the North American Filipino Star will help bring the community closer together. Judging from the feedback we received, many people believe that political intrigues and discords should no longer be allowed to go on. We can accomplish more by building up something we can all be proud of rather than engage in constant creation of conflicts that are perpetuated by the minority. Moreover, it is fundamentally important to recognize that we may have said enough about the subject of these controversies and we should not prolong the debate needlessly. On the other hand, if there is a reason to clarify issues that affect everyone, it is our obligation to inform our readers in order to allow them the opportunity to exercise their freedom of expression and the right to agree or disagree with the opinions expressed by our contributing editors.

It is our firm belief that for every right there is a corresponding responsibility. This is the basic premise under which a democracy must function in order to keep our democratic institutions intact. By being objective and open minded, we believe that we can help bring our community closer together. ■

Zenaida Ferry Kharroubi

### Make Parliament work in order not to hold unnecessary elections, Prime Minister says

OTTAWA – Prime Minister Stephen Harper says making Parliament work is essential if Canada is to avoid an unnecessary election that would jeopardize our economic recovery.

"The economy remains the number one priority of Canadians and of our Government," said the Prime Minister. "An unnecessary election is the last thing that Canadians need, that the economy needs, at this time."

To advance the objective of making Parliament work, the Prime Minister today announced the appointment of one of his most experienced, senior Ministers to the position of Leader of the Government in the House of Commons. The Honourable John Baird has a mandate to work cooperatively with the other parties and make Parliament function.

"Canadians need Parliament to work so that Canada's Economic Action Plan is not interrupted," said the Prime Minister. "We want to do our part and to work cooperatively with all opposition parties to put the economy first."

This crucial role is the latest of many in which Minister Baird has served with distinction. He secured passage of the landmark Federal Accountability Act, served as Minister of the Environment, and most recently, oversaw the implementation of infrastructure stimulus, a vital part of Canada's Economic Action Plan.

Other changes made as part of today's fine-tuning of the Cabinet are as follows:

- The Honourable Chuck Strahl succeeds Mr. Baird as Minister of Transport, Infrastructure and

Communities.

- The Honourable John Duncan, of British Columbia, enters the Cabinet by succeeding Mr. Strahl as Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, Federal Interlocutor for Métis and Non-Status Indians and Minister of the Canadian Northern Economic Development Agency.

"Minister Strahl will take on his new responsibilities with the same dedication and hard work that he's shown in his previous portfolios," said the Prime Minister. His immediate priority is the ongoing implementation of the infrastructure stimulus component of Canada's Economic Action Plan.

In announcing the appointment of the newest member of his Cabinet, the Prime Minister noted that "John Duncan's solid work as Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development makes him a natural choice for this important role, allowing him to continue to build on the important work that Chuck Strahl and our Government have done in this area."

The Prime Minister paid tribute to the former Government House Leader, the Honourable Jay Hill. Earlier this summer Mr. Hill announced that he will not stand as a candidate at the next general election following 17 years of elected service to his constituents and Canadians.

Mr. Baird was recently named "Parliamentarian of the Year," an award decided by votes of MPs and Senators from all parties. ■

**The Filipino(Marché) Coop  
Blessing, Inauguration &  
re-opening for Business  
Tuesday, September 7  
3:30 P.M.  
5710 Victoria Avenue**

**THE NORTH AMERICAN  
FILIPINO STAR**

Montreal, Quebec, Canada

5450 chemin de la Cote-des-Neiges Suite 511  
Montreal, Quebec H3T 1Y6  
Tel.: 514-485-7861 Fax: 514-485-3076  
E-Mail: advertising@filipinostar.org  
Published by Filcan Publications, Inc.

Zenaida Ferry Kharroubi  
Chief Editor & Publisher

Al Abdon  
Jerry Estrada  
Columnists

Sam Kevin  
News & Layout Editor

Hilda T. Veloso  
Community News

Mark Flores  
Advertising Representative

Bert Abiera  
Founder

Mary Joy Lizarondo  
Sports News

The opinions expressed by the writers and columnists do not necessarily reflect that of the management of the North American Filipino Star, and its editors.

#### The North American Filipino Star

5450, chemin de la Cote-des-Neiges Suite 511  
Montreal, QC H3T 1Y6  
SUBSCRIPTION ORDER

Name \_\_\_\_\_  
Address \_\_\_\_\_  
Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_ E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_

1 year - \$25  
 2 years - \$45

Your copy will be mailed to you every month.  
Please make your cheque payable to the  
North American Filipino Star.

## Cooperative News Starting over at a new location

The Filipino Solidarity Cooperative, founded by five people in 2004, should have closed down when the first president left it in shambles in July 2006. It did not cease to operate because those who were left behind thought that something could be done to save it. It has been more than four years ago, and nothing much has changed, except the location. In order to avoid paying a huge rent, the Coop had to move to a duplex apartment temporarily but because we signed a lease for 6 months, it was not possible to move out before its expiration on July 31, 2010.

Moving two times in a period of six months is not an easy task. Needless to say, it is even more difficult if not impossible to do it almost singlehandedly. I had two volunteers who helped in some of the packing. Sophie Toledo came at 2 p.m. and we finished working at 2:30 a.m. I also asked Betty Corpuz to come and she helped to watch the Coop's stuff that were placed outside the building while waiting for the movers to pick them up. The landlord of the duplex, Mr. and Mrs. Rico Capulong and their children also helped in bringing out the stuff to be moved to make it easier for the movers to put them into the truck. There were so much stuff that it took four loads to finish moving them. Through this newspaper, I wish to thank all of these people who helped, including the mover, Romy Lalisan and his assistants. I also wish to thank Flor Rillo who volunteered to do the electrical work which is urgently needed to make sure our freezers work properly.

The Filipino Coop is now located at 5710 Victoria, in the basement of the Cuisine de Manille Restaurant. But the place needs a lot of work - there are no electrical outlets for the freezers and the other equipment. It also needs to be properly secured before storing more merchandise in it. I thought it would just need a week to set up shop but I was extremely disappointed that it took more time than I thought. For the past two weeks, I have been running back and forth to the hardware store, buying and returning materials. Even nuts, bolts and screws caused me a lot of headaches as the work could not be done without these little things. Romy Lalisan, the one who helped us move, installed the iron posts to hang the display baskets. It was not easy to

do the job because he needed a special tool to drill holes on tiles. He also installed the airconditioner but because of the electrical problem, I had to ask the help of Flor Rillo, a retired electrical engineer, and past president of FAMAS, to come and help us. He has been working for four days now as of press time, trying to connect the wires to the outlets. Due to the fact that the original wires were cut, it was difficult to find the connection.

As there is no door to the basement of the restaurant, I had to buy a door and have it installed. This is not an easy task as installing a door must be done by someone who knows how. Again, the work cannot be done fast enough as the man who is supposed to install it is working overtime and cannot tell me when he can come. Hopefully, he will not make me wait too long.

Pastora Emma Denny called me a week ago, and mentioned that she could ask some handy people to volunteer in the Coop. I explained to her that it would be helpful if they would become members first before doing volunteer work and patronize the Coop. She then said that she would be interested in becoming a member herself and see what she could do to encourage the others to do likewise. I was happy to know that Pastora Emma Denny had been reading the Filipino Star and that the cooperative news had made an impact on her.

Even though it is taking a lot of my time to re-establish the Filipino Coop, I am encouraged to continue because of the positive feedback that I have been receiving from many people. They believe that the location of the Coop is a big factor. There are also other factors at play which may have made people more aware of important issues in the community. It seems as if the time has come for all of us to focus on our common goals of promoting a harmonious relationship with our fellow citizens in Montreal. Slowly but surely, change of attitudes will happen sooner than later. After all, we will surely be better off if we focus on improving our economic life and helping one another instead of creating conflicts and all kinds of political intrigues.

It is our dream to be able to become as successful as another solidarity cooperative called Maison Verte which has 6000 members. They

were able to buy the building on the corner of Somerled and Sherbrooke where they are located. During the first Great Citizens Award ceremony organized by the City of Montreal, this solidarity cooperative was given an award for being a successful enterprise. There is no reason why The Filipino Coop cannot do the same thing. It is located in Cote des Neiges where there are more than 12000 Filipinos living in one area. If 50% of this population will become members and patronize the Coop, the Filipino Coop is surely going to be successful and profitable.

To make sure that the Coop will stay on the right track, we would like to have its inauguration and blessing on Tuesday, September 7, 2010 at 3:30 PM. We will invite Father Frank Alvarez of the Filipino Catholic Mission and Pastora Emma Denny of the International Christian Fellowship to officiate in the ceremony and to offer prayers for the success of the Coop which is designed to be open to all, regardless of race, religion and

creed. It is therefore fitting to practice ecumenism in an important ceremony that will signify renewal of faith in God and the power of prayers. We believe that the Coop will continue to exist for it has a role to play in building our community. We also would like to invite everyone, both members and prospective members to join us. Please let us know your attendance by calling 514-733-8915, or 514-485-7861.

It has been almost a month since we moved to 5710 Victoria but we cannot operate the store yet until all the work is completed. Moreover, I have to find the time to get the necessary permits for the sign, occupation, change of address, and declaration of changes to the board of directors. Then the next step is to finish all financial reports for presentation to the general assembly which will probably be held either on October 2, or 16, 2010. The time and location will be announced in the September issue of the Filipino Star. ■  
Zenaida Kharroubi



**Coopérative de Solidarité Filippino, Inc.**  
Filippino Solidarity Cooperative, Inc.

5710 Victoria Avenue  
Montreal, QC H3W 3H2 (New Address effective July 31, 2010)

Téléphone: 514-733-8915  
Télécopieur: 514-485-3076

---

**PLEDGE OF COMMITMENT**  
"Box of Basics" a Month

Name \_\_\_\_\_ ID Control No. \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_ Res. Tel.: \_\_\_\_\_

Cell: \_\_\_\_\_

E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_

Box No. \_\_\_\_\_ Amount: \_\_\_\_\_ Shipping method: \_\_\_\_\_ Pickup \_\_\_\_\_ Delivery \_\_\_\_\_

Starting date of commitment: \_\_\_\_\_

  
1 - \$24.99

  
2 - \$34.99

  
3 - \$49.99

To support the Filippino Solidarity Cooperative (Marché Coop Filippino), members are urged to commit to buy their basic grocery items from their own store. If there are at least one hundred members (100) who will participate in this program, the COOP will certainly become profitable sooner than later.

According to rules and regulations established for Quebec cooperatives, members who are active and who patronize their cooperative shall be entitled to a patronage dividend. Their share of the rebates shall be in proportion to the amount of business they do with their own cooperative.

To show commitment to this "Box of Basics" program, I hereby sign this form on this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2010 in the City of Montreal, Quebec, and promise to buy at least once a month from the Filippino Solidarity Cooperative (Marché Coop Filippino) on or about the same date as when I started this program.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_  
Print Name: \_\_\_\_\_



**Filippino Dentist**  
**DR. GENE SANTANDER**  
DENTAL SURGEON/CHIRURGIEN DENTISTE  
5165 Queen Mary Rd., Suite 304  
Montreal, Quebec H3W 1X7  
**TEL. (514) 484-3110**



**From Page 1      Census**

on language skills to the obligatory short-form 2011 census. In the past, the questions have been part of the long-form census.

Mr. Clement's move was aimed at short-circuiting a court challenge by Federation des communautés francophones et acadiennes du Canada. The group maintains that scrapping the mandatory nature of the long-form census would violate the Charter of Rights and the Official Languages Act.

Earlier Wednesday, the Federal Court agreed that the situation is urgent and set a Sept. 27-28 hearing date for the federation's case.

Mr. Clement also announced that the government will introduce legislation this fall to remove the threat

**The long-form census is your civic duty**



of jail time for people who refuse to fill out any mandatory federal survey.

The Industry Minister said the changes are as far as he's prepared to go to mollify critics of the census changes.

All three opposition parties have been calling on the government to eliminate the threat of jail time and reinstate the mandatory nature of the long-form census.

National Post August 9, 2010 – 4:30 pm. The following thought occurred to me in recent days, as arguments have been presented by the government about why the long-form census questionnaire should no longer be mandatory.

To be blunt: I was wondering what all the fuss was about. Why are some citizens arguing that the state has no right to ask certain questions, such as how many bedrooms are in their house? Why is this viewed as an unacceptable intrusion into their lives?

Context is important. If a stranger stopped me in the street and asked me how many bedrooms I had in my house, I would tell him to get lost. However, when the government of Canada asks me the same question in an official census long-form questionnaire, I react in a completely different manner.

Canada is recognized as having one of the top statistics agencies in the world, and I know from my background as an engineer that there are good reasons for asking each question.

Statisticians will carefully review each question to make sure it generates answers pertinent to the information they need — information that guides government policies on everything from veterans programs to language-support services, from housing priorities to public transit planning. I don't see a bogeyman behind every government form.

Secondly, I expect the

government to protect the privacy of that information. Besides, I know that the number of bedrooms I have in my house is no big secret. I could walk around the outside of any Canadians' home and probably nail the right number of bedrooms most of the time.

Yes, I can imagine other ways of spending my time than filling out the questionnaire, but I also know this will happen to me only a few times in my life.

It seems that the great majority of Canadians feel the same way. They realize that the census is for the greater good — which brings me to the issue of civic duty. Does this concept resonate with Canadians anymore? I believe it does. In fact, 95% of Canadians filled out their 2006 census long-form questionnaire without a fuss.

Personally, this is how I look at it: I live in the best country in the world. I dare you to find a better one in terms of democratic institutions, freedom and fairness, not to mention natural resources and beauty and so many other things we value so much.

Does my country insist that I serve in the military as part of my civic duty? No, it does not. Does my country require me to vote when there is an election? No, it does not (although everyone should do their duty as a citizen and cast a ballot).

What does my country insist that I do? Well, it requires me to pay my taxes and respect the law. If called upon for jury duty, it generally requires me to accept that task. And of course, up until now, it has required me to answer some questions at census time. Is this really asking too much of Canadians? Is this going too far?

The answer is no. This is not a big deal.

The equation in my mind is a simple one, and it has to do with fairness: My country does many things for me and it's only fair that I reciprocate. I do not start from the premise that the state has no business in my life and that it should get out of my face. That's a selfish approach.

That might be acceptable if I lived in the woods and never called upon any government services to help me out. But because I do rely on government for a multitude of services, I feel that answering a few questions is not the end of the world. In fact, I insist on it, because I expect my government to make wise decisions based on sound information.

Thank goodness most Canadians agree with me. Thank goodness most Canadians aren't paranoid and fearful, believing that they owe nothing to their country. Thank goodness that most Canadians believe in the notion of civic duty.

National Post  
Marc Garneau is the MP for Westmount-Ville-Marie and the Liberal Critic for Industry, Science and Technology ■

**The Filipino Coop  
opens for business  
beginning  
Tuesday, Sept. 7, 2010  
Inauguration and Blessing  
at 3:30 P.M.  
at its new location  
5710 Victoria Avenue  
(near Cote-St.-Catherine-Road)**

**FAMAS receives accolades for a successful town festival**

FAMAS, the oldest and biggest association of Filipinos in Montreal and suburbs, organized the "Pista sa Nayon" last July 18, 2010 at MacKenzie King Park. Manny Lagasca and Dr. Gene Santander, collaborated well in making the event run smoothly. According to reports, there were many "firsts" in this event. The reigning Bb. Pilipinas of Montreal, Ms. Andrea Neufeld, who was given the title of Goodwill Ambassador for the first time,

volunteers were available to observe all the security measures and rules were respected by all.

A report made by Ms. Andrea Neufeld acknowledged the participation of the following partner organizations:

Knights and Ladies of Rizal, Seafarers Brotherhood of Montreal, Filipino Nurses Association, FCAWI (Filipino-Canadian Associations of the West Island), UPS (United Filipino



Photo from left: Westward Lions Club member, Ben Bade, unidentified Filipino, Budz Sarmiento, Alex Robles, and another Lions Club member.

was the emcee. This was the first time that a reigning beauty queen was given the task of being the master of ceremonies. She said: "My participation as emcee for the event was such an honor! It was beyond touching to see each association stand proud as we gathered together, united in celebration. Truly touching was the incredible amount of effort that each person, family, group and association exerted that day to really make Pista sa Nayon 2010 a success through the spirit of Bayanihan."

Seniors), PAMANA ng Luzviminda, and the Heritage group. She also acknowledged the participation of some youth led by Mark Vicente in the new one-hour exercise called Zumba, and a dramatic performance by the Tessri Duniya theatre group.

Filipino-owned businesses were also represented along with the non-profit organizations like then Westward Lions Club, and the Filipino Solidarity Cooperative, Inc..

A community observer reported unofficially that Angie Ogerio,



The Parade of Colors with officers of FAMAS and other organizations

Other firsts included an aspect of ecumenism. Father Frank Alvarez of the Filipino Catholic Mission officiated the celebration of the holy mass at 2 p.m. after which a prayer for the community was offered by Pastora Emma Denny of the International Christian Fellowship. Also for the first time, some other ethnic groups participated in the festival. This was a requirement by the City of Montreal. During the meeting of FAMAS officers with the Borough councilors, they were told that the City was satisfied with the work done by FAMAS because more

president of the Federation of Filipino Canadian Associations of Quebec, contributed food for the pot luck of Famas while James de la Paz paid for a tent on behalf of his association to signify his participation for unity.

Some people had expressed the wish that if FAMAS could manage the Pista sa Nayon so well, maybe it should be given the responsibility to organize our Philippine Independence Day parade next year. This seems to show people's vote of confidence in FAMAS as a unifying force. ■

APPENDIX C FOUR COVER PAGES OF THE MONTREAL PINOY POST



VOLUME 1 N° 3 MONTREAL, QUEBEC, CANADA JULY-AUGUST 2009

# FUTURE OF FAMAS IS IN YOUR HANDS



**KILUSANG BAYANIHAN**

CHRIS BAUTISTA  
President

**DIRECTORS**  
Julius Abad  
Edsel Canto  
Romy Emboscado  
Vivian Espinosa  
Lina Flores  
Vicky Laya  
Zean "Chico" Quiblat  
Elizabeth Raquel  
Felix Reyes  
Mercy Umipig



**LINGKOD BAYAN**

MEL DOMINGO  
President

**DIRECTORS**  
Boy Pimentel  
Neil Castro  
Vangie Visario  
Helen Catacutan  
Lily Padida  
Loreto Acebedo  
Ruben Majaducon  
Portia Madriaga  
Helen Racuya  
Estela Bajoyo



**MABUHAY TEAM**

AU OSDON  
President

**DIRECTORS**  
Dr. Gene Santander  
Ramon Vicente Jr.  
Melle Lugod  
Shinette Khoury  
Joan Junio  
Gina Medina  
Anton Fernandez  
Terry Esguerra  
Erwin Fausto  
Debbie Resureccion



**SAMAHANG MAKABAYAN**

FLOR RILLO  
President

**DIRECTORS**  
Ma. Cristy Canillo  
Nora Antenor Cruz  
Felix de Luna  
Riza Esmeralda  
Emily Gonzaga  
Manny Lagasca  
Marites Manuel  
Michael Narciso  
Nida Quirapas  
Romy Razon

**INDEX**

Editorial.....p. 3	Youth Blog.....p.21
Interviews.....p. 4	Kid's Zone.....p.22
Travel & Tourism.....p. 8	Stay Fit.....p.24
Borough News.....p.11	What's Cooking.....p.24
Multicultural Window.....p.11	Reflection.....p.25
Arts & Culture.....p.12	Senior's Corner.....p.25
Environment.....p.12	Infotainment.....p.27
Calendar of Events.....p.13	Horoscope.....p.30
Community Times.....p.14	Classified Ads.....p.31
Dear Ate V.....p.21	



DR. JESUS PELAUSA  
Feature Page 7



FATHER JOHN LYNG  
Page 9



EX-PRES. CORY AQUINO  
Homeland Page 23

Alicia Atayde-Lee  
CEO/Founder  
25 years of experience

## Ajennat Coiffure Inc.

COIFFURE ET ESTHÉTIQUE / HAIRDRESSING & ESTHETICS

- Tired of always looking the same?  
- Why don't you come discover a one stop full service...  
...AJENNAT COIFFURE will give you the look you always wanted with an affordable price.

**SPECIAL**  
Valid until August 30, 2009  
\$40.00 - Massage  
\$40.00 - Facial  
\$15.00 - Cut

**SPECIAL DISCOUNT 15%**  
• with this invitation  
• the first visit  
• for Senior Citizens  
• Mondays & Wednesdays

**6210 Decarie (corner Van Horne), Montreal, QC H3X 2J9**

514-731-8881

Tel. No.: 514-345-0357

E-mail: montrealpinoypost@yahoo.ca

Creative ways to help your child's development? Try our music classes and learn how to play musical instruments at an affordable cost than any other private music classes in town!

**R.V.V. PIANO LESSONS**

a fast growing private music classes in Montreal, now offers the following lessons for all ages, beginners and advance level for:

**PIANO & KEYBOARD ORGAN & GUITAR**

So dear parents, why not ENROLL your child at R.V.V. Piano Lessons.

Register now! For particulars, please call: Raymond at (514) 735-4009 (telefax) or email at rvpianolessons@yahoo.ca



**Typhoon Ondoy/Tropical storm Ketsana leaves Northern Philippines in disaster & calamity**



Typhoon Ondoy started off with strong rainfalls in the evening of September 25, 2009. Many were not prepared for its tremendous disastrous strength. The unexpected down-pour was comparable to a month's rainfall. Many were stranded along the way.

Affected areas: Quezon City, Taytay Rizal, Marikina City, Ortigas Extension, Pasig City, San Jose Del Monte, Montalban Rizal and more in the provincial areas of Luzon.



**RE/MAX**  
 Real Estate Services  
 (514) 735-0099

**Plaisirs d'or Gold Delights**  
 "A true taste of Filipino Delights"

- Pastry
- Bakery
- Hot Meals
- Pâtisserie
- Boulangerie
- Mets chauds

514-903-2777  
 3539 Van Horne  
 Montreal (Qc) H3S 1R7  
 (corner Côte-des-Neiges)  
 Kharen & Marivi

**Ajennat Coiffure Inc.**  
 COIFFURE ET ESTHÉTIQUE / HAIRDRESSING & ESTHETICS

**SPECIAL 514-731-8881**

Just call for an appointment for this exciting prices

**Facial-\$40.00 (Wed. & Thurs.)**  
**Haircut-\$20.00 (Monday)**  
**Massage-\$40.00 (Wed. & Thurs.)**

**GIFT PACKAGES**

- \* Facial Massage, Manicure, Pedicure & Spa
- \* 5 Facial Treatments

**WAXING**

- \* Under Arm
- \* Eyebrow
- \* Eyebrow + Upper Lip
- \* Trio + Wax (Under arm, Eye brows & Upper lip)
- \* Half Leg
- \* Full Leg
- \* Brazilian
- \* Bikini Ax

**HAIRCUT**

- \* Women
- \* Men
- \* Children
- \* Cut-Style-Blow dry
- \* Hair Style
- \* Blow Dry-Style with Shampoo
- \* Permanent Color
- \* Highlight
- Half
- Full Long
- \* Perm
- Short
- Long
- \* Hair Straightening Rebonding Yaco System
- \* Hair Straightening Regular Yaco System

**ESTHETICS**

- \* Facial - 30 minutes
- Full
- \* Make-up
- \* Make-up & Hair do
- \* Eyebrow Coloring
- \* Permanent Make-up
- \* Eye Lashes Perming
- \* Eye Lashes & Extension
- \* Manicure
- \* Foot Spa - Pedicure

**MASSAGE**

- \* 30 minutes
- \* One hour

Make-up & Hair do/ Any Occasion/ Price will be discussed  
**6210 Decarie (corner Van Horne), Montreal, QC H3X 219**

Alicia Atayde-Lee  
 CEO/Founder  
 25 years of experience

Tel. No.: 514-345-0357

www.montrealpinoypost.com

E-mail: montrealpinoypost@yahoo.ca

**Philippine Pastry, Bakery & Restaurant**  
**Gold Delights**  
 1550 Van Horne (corner Côte des Neiges) 514-963-2777

**WEDNESDAY SPECIAL**  
**Buffet**  
 Every Wednesday  
**FOR ONLY \$9.99!**

**New Products:**  
 - Mamiy Pasta  
 - Tasty Bread  
 - Hupis (Mango & Raisin)  
 - Palet (Choco-Swirl)  
 - Cheese Bread  
 - Taho  
 - Spanish Bread  
 - Pan de Coco

**Special Inclusions:**  
 Buffet with cashed  
 for only \$22.99

**Other Services:** Cakes, Catering & Photo Video

**MONTREAL PINOY POST  
 FIRST ANNIVERSARY  
 AND AWARDS NIGHT**



The theme of the awards night and anniversary celebration was to honor and express gratitude. It was an evening of paying tribute to the achievements and contributions of people to progress and grow in the human community. It gave importance to what is significant from simple acts and gestures to the grandiose goals and visions.

The management, staff and volunteers are please to see the support and acceptance of the newspaper's vision and mission from the readership and they return it back with the Lakandula Awards, an act of gratitude and recognition to the awardees.

Congratulations to the awardees and thank you to the support and presence of everyone in the first anniversary celebration.



**ANDREA NEUFELD**  
 Ms. Philippines Montreal 2010  
 Ambassador of Goodwill

**Century 21**  
 Rachel Reyes  
 Agent immobilier agréé

Century21 Innovation  
 Carre immobilier agréé

Cell.: 514-817-5000  
 chrcr2004@shaw.com

Téléphone: 514-481-5238 Fax: 514-481-5231  
 402, Square St-Laurent, Montréal, QC H2K 3S1  
 Dépannage 24 heures / Service à domicile 7 jours / 24 heures

**Radha Sivagnanam**  
 Agent immobilier agréé  
**514-941-1177**

**RE/MAX**  
 REALTY INC.

**New Philippine President:  
 Benigno Simeon "Noy" Cojuangco Aquino III**

Benigno "Noy" Aquino III, is the only son of the People's Power First Woman President, Corazon Aquino who passed away last August of 2009. His father Ninoy Aquino was assassinated during the Marcos dictatorship.

President Noy Aquino got the sentiments of the people with his motto "Walang Mahiarap, Kung Walaong corrupt" (There are no poor people where there is no corruption).



**RESTAURANT  
 BLANCHE NEIGE**  
 DEPUIS 1959  
**Tél.: 738-3251**

LIVRAISON GRATUITE / FREE DELIVERY  
 LIVRAISON MINIMUM DELIVERY \$7.00  
 Cartes de crédit acceptées / We accept all major credit cards

**5737 COTE DES NEIGES**

HEURES DE LIVRAISON  
 DIMANCHE & JEUDI DE: 11:00 A.M. - 1:45 A.M.  
 VENDREDI ET SAMEDI DE: 11:00 A.M. - 3:30 A.M.  
 Nous livrons Bière / We deliver Beer: 11 am - 11 pm

**SPECIAL \$1.99** (tax) (1am-3am) (tax-1pm Sat & Sun)  
**BREAKFAST**  
 - 2 eggs  
 - bacon ou jambon ou saucisse  
 - roties  
 - bread  
 - cafe

**SUPER \$4.95** (tax) (11am-3am)  
**SPECIAL**  
 \* assiette de souvlaki  
 \* sous-marin au steak  
 \* bambino pizza  
 \* foie de boeuf  
 \* fish N chips  
 \* spaghetti A/V  
 \* salade Grecque  
 \* cuisson de poulet B.B.Q

**Friday & Saturday  
 OPEN 24 Hours**

**Probex** VENTE ACHAT FINANCEMENT  
 REFRIGERATION new used

**Equipments for restaurant and grocery**

**Eric Jasmin**  
**(514) 594-2703**  
 195 Louvain Ouest, Montréal, QC H2N 1A3

**Century 21**  
 Rachel Reyes  
 Agent immobilier agréé



Century 21 Innovation  
 Carte immobilière agréée  
 Cell.: 514-817-5000  
 checaro2004@yahoo.com

**Radha Sivagnanam**  
 Agent immobilier agréé  
**514-941-1177**



RE/MAX  
 REALTY INC.

## BACK TO SCHOOL

Summer has ended and it's school time again. Everyone in the city is feeling excited about the adventure in a brand new school year. Parents of children who will be in kindergarten are nervous about leaving their children alone for the first time. New students from all levels in the educational ladder are anxious about new teachers, new friends, new environment and new school? Mounting expenses from school supplies, books and other paraphernalia are basic concerns.



But what is important is that back to school means education, knowledge, socialization and the opportunity for everyone to learn and grow. And that a good education is a vital factor to human progress.

**Sutton**  
 Courtier immobilier  
 Real Estate Broker  
 Groupe Sutton Distinction



585 ave. St-Charles #175  
 Vaudreuil-Dorion, Qc J7V 8P9  
**Office: (450) 455-7333**  
**Cell: (514) 882-9626**  
 ailagan@sutton.com

Service offert à Vaudreuil, Ouest De l'île, Montréal et Laval.  
 Consultant de courtier en maison  
 Estimation Gratuite.

Working in Vaudreuil, West Island, Montreal and Laval Areas.  
 In house mortgage advisor  
 Free Evaluation

Handang Tumulong Sa Inyo Ng Pagbili Or  
 Pagrenta Ng Bahay! Tawag Lang Po Kayo!

**Mapapagkatiwalaan**



**RE/MAX**  
 REALTY INC.  
 COURTIER IMMOBILIER AGRÉÉ  
 Franchisé indépendant et autonome  
 de RE/MAX Québec Inc.

**Elvicy Daquioag (Elvie)**  
 Agent immobilier affilié

1850, Panama, Suite 118  
 Brossard (Québec) J4W 3C6  
**Bur.: 450-466-6000**  
 Cell: 514-497-8705  
 Fax: 450-466-2000  
 elvicy.daquioag@remax-quebec.com  
 elvied@hotmail.com

**RESTAURANT**  
**BLANCHE NEIGE**  
 DEPUIS 1959  
**Tél: 738-3251**

LIVRAISON GRATUITE / FREE DELIVERY  
 LIVRAISON MINIMUM DELIVERY \$7.00  
 Cartes de crédit acceptées / We accept all major credit cards

**5737 COTE DES NEIGES**

HEURES DE LIVRAISON  
 VENDREDI ET SAMEDI DE 11:00 A.M. - 1:00 A.M.  
 Nous livrons Bière / We deliver Beer 11 am - 11 pm

**SPECIAL \$1.99** (tax) (4pm-11pm) (tax 2pm-8pm)  
 BREAKFAST  
 - 2 eggs  
 - bacon ou jambon ou saucisse  
 - roties  
 - bread  
 - café

**SUPER \$4.95** (supplément) (tax)  
 SPECIAL  
 \* assiette de souvlaki  
 \* sous-marin au steak  
 \* bambino pizza  
 \* foie de boeuf  
 \* fish N chips  
 \* spaghetti A/V  
 \* salade Grecque  
 \* cuisson de poulet B.B.Q

Friday & Saturday  
**OPEN 24 Hours**

**Probox** VENTE ACHAT FINANCEMENT  
 new used

REFRIGERATION



**Equipments for restaurant and grocery**

**Eric Jasmin**  
**(514) 594-2703**  
 195 Louvain Ouest, Montréal, QC H2N 1A3



APPENDIX D

'VERY IMPORTANT PINOY' AD

very important pinoy ka ba?

**YES!**

I am a caregiver in Vancouver. Through my hard work, I am able to provide for my family's daily needs in Nueva Ecija. I am also able to put two of my nephews through school and build a house for my family. I am proud to be a Pinoy in Canada!

*Teresa Yeth*  
Teresa Yeth  
Caregiver

Get **20% OFF**  
the transfer fee on your next qualifying Western Union® money transfers to **Hong Kong**  
Use promo code: **B8892**  
Expires August 31, 2010

**VIP**  
VERY IMPORTANT PINOY

**WESTERN UNION**

© 2010 WESTERN UNION. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. WESTERN UNION IS A TRADEMARK OF WESTERN UNION.

*North American Filipino Star June 2010: 13*

**The Gazette**  
 MONDAY, DECEMBER 27, 2010 | SINCE 1778 | BREAKING NEWS AT [MONTREALGAZETTE.COM](http://MONTREALGAZETTE.COM)  
 A DIVISION OF POSTMEDIA NETWORK INC. SPORTS FINA

**DAYS of CHRISTMAS** **MAD MEN** On the 5th day of Christmas, iTunes and The Gazette gave to you ... **FREE DOWNLOAD**  
 five Mad Men episodes! Visit [montrealgazette.com/12days](http://montrealgazette.com/12days) to get them free on iTunes.

# A HOLIDAY DREAM DENIED



**CHRISTMAS FRAUD** Filipina nanny Elenor Diaz worked multiple jobs here – including housekeeping for Lissa Matyas (in the background with son Keenan Tully) – in order to save enough money to bring her husband and children to Montreal. But the tickets for the family’s Christmas Day journey were cancelled by Manila travel agents who absconded with Diaz’s money. “I felt so lonely and frustrated,” Diaz said, recounting her story to **Irwin Block, Page A8**

# Fraudsters steal family's Christmas dream

IRWIN BLOCK  
THE GAZETTE

Eleanor Diaz went all out to make this year's Christmas a day to remember, forever.

As a Filipina who came here in May 2006 as a sponsored nanny, that meant working unbelievably long hours to save enough money to bring her husband and three kids here.

Now 43, Diaz started working 15 hours a day, seven days a week in January 2009 when she became a permanent resident, eligible to sponsor her immediate family.

Her working day starts at 5 a.m. when she arrives at the Dorval Marriott Hotel, serving breakfast five days a week until 1 p.m.

At 2 p.m., at least three days a week, she heads over to a nursing home in Pointe Claire, where she helps care for seniors.

Her third job is house-keeping at the home of Lissa Matyas and Quentin Tully in Pointe Claire and helping care for their 18-month old son Keenan. Whenever possible, Diaz does similar work in other homes.

It is a classic story of a newcomer using all her resources to build a new life in a new land, and getting her family to share that new life.

It was all supposed to come together on Christmas Day when, thanks to all this work, Diaz had been able to save \$4,000 for four airline tickets and sent the money in several

instalments to her husband, Nilo Diaz, in Lipa City, a suburb of Batangas.

She also rented an apartment at \$725 a month in Dorval, and bought a used car in preparation for his arrival, and that of their children Niel John, 19, Niel Princess, 16, and Niel Joshua, 8.

Nothing could go wrong. They bought their ticket at what seemed like a good deal from Honor Travel & Touring in Manila, which featured a "special price" for travel on Christmas Day: \$975 one way and \$800 for the 8-year-old.

"I told him to grab it," Diaz said yesterday.

They paid cash, got their tickets, cancelled their Internet connection, sold the family car, said goodbye to

relatives and friends, showed up at the airport and checked in their bags.

The news came as a total shock: The agency owners, Apostol and Myra Yabot, had cancelled the tickets, pocketed the \$4,000, fired their staff and absconded with the funds.

"I felt so lonely and frustrated," Diaz said, sobbing, as she relived a Christmas Day that became a horror story.

"I keep seeing in my mind the eight suitcases, coming back to my family. And my little boy running and talking to the policeman and saying: 'What happened. Are we going to fly?'"

For all the wrong reasons, Diaz said "this is the Christmas that I will never ever for-

get."

"Me, I can handle any kind of problem, because I know I am strong. But I am concerned with my children. They were supposed to be flying for the first time, with such big emotions, and they are suffering now."

The family is stunned, and Diaz is worried.

"I am afraid their feelings will be so affected they might become depressed."

It is a police matter, and the agency owners have disappeared, so there is little chance of recovering the money any time soon.

There is nothing the International Air Transport Association can do, either, said Steve Lott, a spokesperson based in

Washington, D.C.

"We are a clearing agency for 230 airlines, and when there is a case of fraud by a travel agency, it's up to local police to pursue it," he said.

His advice: always pay with a credit card, which offers some protection, do some research before dealing with a travel agency, especially online, and reconfirm your booking a few days before travelling.

But none of this is any consolation to Diaz and her family who are hoping a Good Samaritan, in the spirit of the holiday, will step forward and give her a hand so she can live that holiday dream, sooner rather than later.

iblock@montrealgazette.com

Block, Irwin. "Fraudsters steal family's Christmas dream." *Montreal Gazette*. 22 Dec 2010, A8.

## Our readers rally for nanny



PETER McCABE THE GAZETTE  
Elenor Diaz (right) is comforted by Lissa Matyas, for whom the Filipina works as a nanny, as she reacts emotionally to emails from Gazette readers offering financial support to bring her three children and husband to Montreal from the Philippines.

### Filipina's hopes of reuniting with her family were dashed by fraud

Sue Montgomery reports that Gazette readers have responded overwhelmingly to a story about Elenor Diaz, 43, a Filipina who worked three jobs seven days a week

in Montreal to save enough money to bring her husband and three children to Canada – only to be bilked by a fraudulent travel agent. Readers have offered dona-

tions ranging from \$25 to four airplane tickets to right the wrong that dashed Diaz's hopes – after four years of hard work – of reuniting with her family and build-

ing a life together in Canada. “Thank you so much, thank you, thank you,” an overwhelmed Diaz said when told of the generosity of others.

Page A8

# Strangers help unite family

## DONATIONS POUR IN

### Montrealer scammed by travel agent, but readers offer tickets

SUE MONTGOMERY  
THE GAZETTE

If all goes as planned, the Diaz family will be reunited tonight, after generous Gazette readers rescued a heartbreaking Christmas ruined by a fraudster.

"Now I can smile," said Elenor Diaz, overwhelmed after learning that people from Chilliwack, B.C., to Brewster, N.Y., responded with offers to help get her husband and three children to Canada from the Philippines. "I'm crying, but they are tears of joy."

Diaz, 43, who came to Canada as a sponsored nanny in 2006, worked three jobs to save \$4,000 to bring her family here in time for Christmas. But when they arrived at the airport in Manila, they discovered the travel agent had cancelled the tickets, fired his employees and skipped town with the money. They returned to their village, humiliated after having already said goodbye to envious friends and neighbours.

Lissa Matyas, who'd hired Diaz to look after her 18-month-old son, contacted the Gazette with the story. Reaction was swift, with offers for everything from \$25 to the entire cost of the tickets. Some were moved by personal experience.

"I grew up in a family with a sponsored Filipina helper and I am acutely aware of the hardship and hard work involved in starting from the ground up in a new country," wrote one reader, who offered \$100 and said his nanny was like a second mother to him. "In a perfect world I would love to be able to whisk her entire family over first class immediately, but unfortunately my current situation can't afford that."

In the end, Montrealer Larry Modafferi paid \$5,800 for Air Canada flights to Montreal, scheduled to arrive today just before midnight.

Modafferi, the president of Ria Canada, a company that wires remittances to countries including the Philippines, said he was touched by the story, which reminded him of a local money wire service company that ripped off the Filipino community last year for \$180,000.

Another Montrealer, Sam Hornstein, emailed while vacationing in

## Gazette readers respond

*Readers were swift to respond yesterday after reading Gazette reporter Irwin Block's story about Elenor Diaz. Here are just some of the emails we received:*

I read your article this morning about the fraud perpetuated on the Diaz family, and was disgusted by it. I imagine the same thing being done to my immigrant grandparents. So many Canadians have a shared immigrant history I hear you, when you call out and ask for a good Samaritan for the Diaz family. I would like to help, and I would ask you to tell Elenor right away that help is on the way to give her hope right now, don't let her despair.

—Reader wished to remain anonymous

I was touched by all the hard work she has gone through to do this. I know many hard-working members of the Filipino community in Montreal and can relate to this story. I would like to help. Please let me know if there is already a collection of money for Mrs. Diaz that I can contribute to or if not then perhaps you could assist me in starting one up.

—Adam Gavsie

I read the story in this morning's Gazette, and would like to participate in helping Elenor to bring her family to Montreal. I am presently on vacation with

the Caribbean and offered to employ Diaz's husband.

"It's just amazing," Matyas said. "I thought we could raise maybe \$1,000 but I never thought we'd be in a position where we're turning people away."

"But this is what Canada is all about," she said, as she scrambled to respond to all the emails forwarded to her from The Gazette. "Total strangers helping total strangers."

Reached in their village, with a rooster crowing in the background, an understandably skeptical Nilo Diaz was once again packing the children into a rental car to make the two-hour trip to Manila. How, he wondered, will they get on a flight with no tickets and just a reference number given to them over the phone by a stranger?

"I think once they're on the plane, they'll be excited, but right

my family, however if you can contact me, either by email, or phone, and tell me if anybody else has offered to help, and how much more will be needed to complete what is required, I will be happy to supply it.

—Sheldon Mintzberg

I would like to help out Elenor Diaz get her family to her new home (Canada). Could you guys at the Gazette add something to the article about starting some kind of fund? We could have this family here for the start of the New Year! Let's make a difference!

—Brian and Carolyn Finnerty

How can we send some funds for Elenor Diaz?

—Urs A. Reinhardt, Brewster, N.Y.

I would like to donate some money to Elenor Diaz ... is there a bank account number or similar I could give her a few dollars? I don't have much but hopefully other people will help out too.

—Joanna Emery, Hamilton, Ont.

If you could provide my contact information to Ms. Diaz, I would greatly appreciate it. I would like to know if her family was able to come and if there is a way to donate. Please advise.

—Anna Maria Tosso, Chilliwack, B.C.

now they're afraid they'll be disappointed again," Elenor Diaz said.

Diaz, who hasn't seen her family since a 2007 trip home for her father's funeral, became a permanent resident last year, which allowed her to sponsor her husband and their three children—Niel John, 19, Niel Princess, 16, and Niel Joshua, 8. She's been preparing the ground work for their arrival ever since.

She's rented a two-bedroom apartment for the family in Dorval, but so far the only furniture she has are beds. She has applied to McGill University for her son to study and has bought a second-hand car.

"I'm so proud to be part of this country and I'm so grateful I'm just speechless," she said. "From the bottom of my heart, I'm thankful to all those people."

smontgomery@montrealgazette.com

A8

# YOU'LL LIKE THIS

A WEEKLY FOCUS ON POSITIVE NEWS IN TROUBLED TIMES



Elenor Diaz reads emails sent to the Gazette yesterday offering money to help bring her three children and husband to Montreal from the Philippines, after a travel agent absconded with money she had saved.

PETER McCABE THE GAZETTE

Montgomery, Sue. "Our readers rally for nanny." *Montreal Gazette* 28 Dec 2010, A8.