



BOARD OF GOVERNORS

**APPROVED Minutes of the Meeting (Open Session)
held on Tuesday, April 18, 2017 at 3:00 p.m.
University Hall, Macdonald Building**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Larry Stordy (Chair), Sara Austin, Michelle Awad, Ian Bezanson, Wadih Fares, Richard Florizone, Kati George-Jim, Elaine Gibson, Robert (Bob) Hanf, Kevin Hewitt, Laurie Jennings, Courtney Larkin, Anne McLellan, Audrey Palmeter, Kathleen Reid, Robert Richardson, Paula Simon, Bart Soroka, Candace Thomas, Gail Tomblin Murphy, Michele Williams

NON-MEMBERS PRESENT: Peter Fardy (Vice-President Advancement), Ian Nason (Vice-President Finance and Administration), Carolyn Watters (Provost and Vice-President Academic), Susan Brousseau (University Secretary)

REGRETS: Joyce Carter, Cassandra Dorrington, Jody Forsyth, Sherry Porter, Martha Crago (Vice-President Research)

GUESTS: Co-Chairs, Universities Canada Principles on Indigenous Education: Keith Taylor (Faculty, Dept. of Mathematics & Statistics) and Patti Doyle Bedwell (College of Continuing Education); Co-Chairs, Re-visioning the Ceremonial Mace: Peter Dykuis (Director/Curator, Dalhousie Art Gallery) and Christine Macy (Dean Architecture & Planning); Nathan Rogers (Assistant Director Capital Planning), Laurene Rehman (DFA Observer), Andrea Power (Associate Secretary, Senate)

1. Approval of Agenda

S. Austin moved, seconded by L. Jennings:

THAT the agenda be adopted as circulated.

CARRIED.

2. Consent Agenda

2.1 Approval of Minutes of Meeting of February 14, 2017

THAT the minutes of the meeting held on February 14, 2017 be approved as circulated.

Approved by CONSENT.

2.2 Board of Governors Appointments 2017-18

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Human Resources Committee, approve the nomination of Candace Thomas for recommendation to the Governor in Council for reappointment to the Board of

Governors of Dalhousie University for a three-year term from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2020.

Approved by CONSENT.

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Human Resources Committee, approve the nomination of Eleanor Bernard for recommendation to the Governor in Council for appointment to the Board of Governors of Dalhousie University for a three-year term from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2020.

Approved by CONSENT.

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Human Resources Committee, approve the appointment of Amina Abawajy as a Student Board member on the Board of Governors for a one-year term from May 1, 2017 to April 30, 2018, and the appointment of Jeremy Ryant as a Student Board member on the Board of Governors for a two-year term from May 1, 2017 to April 30, 2019

Approved by CONSENT.

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Human Resources Committee, approve the appointment of Elaine Gibson as a Senate-appointed faculty representative on the Board of Governors of Dalhousie University for a three-year term from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2020.

Approved by CONSENT.

2.3 Interim Spending Authority

THAT in order to allow the continued operation of the University until such time as the 2017-18 operating budget is given final approval, it is recommended that the Board of Governors authorize expenditures of up to 25% of the 2016-17 approved operating budget amounts. The President or his designate, in consultation with the Executive Committee of the Board, is authorized to approve expenditures in excess of 25% in special cases to permit the orderly management of the University

Approved by CONSENT.

2.4 Matters from Senate

2.4.1 New Program: BA in Law, Justice and Society

THAT the Board of Governors approve the new program proposal for the Bachelor of Arts in Law, Justice and Society, Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, as presented.

Approved by CONSENT.

2.4.2 US Public Health Service Research Misconduct Policy

THAT Board of Governors approve the US Public Health Services Research Misconduct Policy, as presented.

Approved by CONSENT.

3. Business Arising from the Minutes

There were no matters arising.

4. Chair's Report

L. Stordy noted the following in his report:

- A welcome to Amina Abawajy and Jeremy Ryant as incoming student members of the Board of Governors effective May 1, 2017. Mr. Stordy also thanked retiring student members Kathleen Reid and Bart Soroka for their contributions and presented them with small parting gifts.
- Thanks and gratitude to Dr. Martha Crago, Vice President Research, for her tremendous service to Dalhousie over the past nine years. It was noted that this was the last Board meeting for Dr. Crago before she takes up her new position as McGill's Vice Principal of Research and Innovation.
- Congratulations to this year's student Governors Awards winners. Sarah Dobson, Bai Bintou Kaira, Nicole Daia, Salman Sajid, and Kym Sweeny received their awards for exceptional leadership and community service on March 23, 2017 at the Student Impact Awards Ceremony.
- A reminder that spring convocation ceremonies are upcoming from May 12 to June 3, 2017. Mr. Stordy encouraged Board members to attend these celebrations of student accomplishments.

5. President's Report

R. Florizone referred members to his written report and offered comments on several items, including various events, results and metrics that speak to the very positive year for Dalhousie in terms of academic, research and student success, and record fund-raising results. He also spoke briefly to the current budget gap in terms of the 1% increase in government funding in the face of increasing costs and commended the balanced approach taken by the Budget Advisory Committee in the report presented today. At the conclusion of his report, President Florizone thanked Board members for their support of the Mental Health Foundation of Nova Scotia's "A Different Stage of Mind" event; Dalhousie's team of Richard Florizone, Catherine Bagnell-Styles (Assistant Vice-President Communications & Marketing), and Peter Fardy (Vice-President Advancement), raised \$109K for the Foundation.

Following this report, the President addressed brief questions on his modes of engaging with students (and what he finds to be most effective), and next steps for the MIT/REAP initiative following the recent visit to Halifax by the Icelandic team.

6. Dalhousie Student Union President's Report

K. Reid thanked the Board for the opportunity to serve during this past year, noting that she enjoyed the opportunity to engage and collaborate with Board members and members of administration. She highlighted several aspects of her written report, including the DSU's first racial justice symposium on April 1st (organized by incoming DSU President and student Board member Amina Abawajy), and the motion today to approve a student levy to support a Survivor Support Centre and plans to move this service forward in the coming months. She also noted the package of letters provided to Board members from student society representatives that speak in student voices to the impact of the proposed 2017-18 BAC recommendations for tuition and fees.

7. Items for Discussion

7.1 Budget Advisory Committee Final Report LIV

C. Watters presented the final report of the Budget Advisory Committee (BAC), highlighting the approach taken by the BAC this year, the assumptions guiding its work, the process employed and the recommendations resulting from its deliberations. Following the report, Board members engaged in significant discussion, with the points noted below forming the focus of the comments. At the request of the student Board representatives, the Board chair also granted permission for two students to briefly address the Board on the impact of tuition increases. Amina Abawajy, incoming DSU President, and Cassie Martell, Faculty of Agriculture student, each spoke to these concerns.

- The Board Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee has engaged in a deep consideration of these issues and commends Management for an admirable job in working to balance the competing issues of students who are challenged by increasing tuition costs, faculty and staff who seek fair compensation, and steadily increasing costs for the University's operations. This situation has developed over roughly ten years, and while Administration has tried to deal with the challenges, the current situation does not appear to be sustainable and there are likely to be further challenges in the future.
- A longer-term strategy is needed beyond balancing budgets on a year-to-year basis.
- It is unclear what the 2018-2019 changes in provincial funding will look like. It was noted that, in discussions between post-secondary institutions and the Province, institutions can have differing interests, and so it is difficult to predict the outcome of upcoming conversations. It is also unclear who exactly will attend these discussions.
- Student members suggested that student consultation during the budget process should be reviewed. It was noted that the town hall meetings did not provide enough time for many students to ask questions and the feedback on the process was less than positive for the most part. It was also noted that student representation on BAC could be increased to include more than one student. In response, C. Watters noted that the BAC learned a great deal this year, particularly in terms of the need to engage the community earlier than had been the case in the past. She did note, however, that 690 students responded to the survey and this was very positive this year and provided valuable feedback to the BAC. Student members indicated that it is their view that a review of the Board's financial planning should include a review of BAC and the budget process.
- Competition from universities in other provinces is also a concern and universities in Nova Scotia may face a bleaker future because of the efforts in other provinces around post-secondary funding, tuition and student retention. It was noted that if Dalhousie and other Nova Scotia universities want to compete on these matters, it will require government support.
- It was suggested that a joint, collaborative effort between the Board of Governors and students to develop a transparent and strategic plan to lobby the government for increased funding may be the best hope of moving forward. It was noted that the success of universities in Nova Scotia is essential to the growth and health of the Province itself and the Nova Scotia economy. On the other hand, it was noted that "we are a collective of partnerships" and, in that sense, there should be some caution that Dalhousie and others not create another "other"; it is clear that the provincial government would share many of the same aspirations and objectives as Dalhousie and its students.
- It was suggested that other funding partners be consulted in order to expand sustainable funding beyond tuition and government funding.

At the conclusion of this discussion, the Chair proposed moving Item 10.4 out of the *in camera* session for a discussion of the proposed ad hoc Financial Planning Committee which is intended as a Board initiative to further consider some of the issues raised today.

In response to comments from members, President Florizone noted that he would like the proposed committee to take a holistic approach, proposing that part of the answer is to look at internal and external factors. While government funding is a concern, the solution may not lie solely in lobbying for increased funding from government. He noted that Dalhousie has a long-term plan - Strategic Directions – as well as plans around financial planning, deferred maintenance, etc. This exercise, however, is about re-visiting these plans and essentially “lifting the lid” to look at the assumptions made over the past decade or more. He noted that he is a big proponent of collaboration and partnership and there are places where the University and students have common ground, even if there is not agreement on every issue – so there is certainly possibility in working together on these matters, including lobbying government.

8. Items for Decision

8.1 2017-2018 Student Fee Proposals

8.1.1 2017-2018 Tuition and Facilities Renewal Fees

A. Palmeter introduced the motion on behalf of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee. Staff addressed a question of clarification on the proposed fees for programs at the Agricultural campus and the designation for the tuition re-set approved last year.

Moved by A. Palmeter, seconded by M. Awad:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve the 2017-18 tuition fees as presented in the tuition fee schedule including:

- **A 3% general tuition fee increase applied to tuition fees for all programs and the international differential fee effective April 2017.**

B. Soroka proposed an amendment to the motion presented.

Moved by B. Soroka, seconded by K. Reid:

THAT the tuition fee schedule be amended to give programs at the Agricultural Campus a one-year reprieve from the 3% general tuition fee increase.

The proposed amendment was DEFEATED.

The original motion CARRIED. (K.George-Jim, K. Reid, B. Soroka opposed).

A. Palmeter moved, seconded by I. Bezanson:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve a 3% increase in the auxiliary fee for facilities renewal to \$89.50 per term for full time students effective April 2017.

CARRIED.
(K. George-Jim, K. Reid abstaining)

8.1.2 Auxiliary Fees

Moved by A. Palmeter, seconded E. Gibson:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve the Auxiliary fee changes for 2017-2018 as presented.

CARRIED.
(K. George-Jim, K. Reid abstaining).

8.1.3 Student Services Fee

Moved by A. Palmeter, seconded R. Richardson:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve the 2017-18 Student Service fees as follows:

The Student Services fees for all Halifax campus students be increased by:

- **\$4.60 per term for a full-time student,**
- **3.00 for a full-time summer student, and**
- **\$1.25 for part-time students in fall, winter and summer terms.**

The Student Services fees for professional faculties on the Halifax campus be increased by \$9.20 per 8-month period for full-time students in Medicine and Dentistry.

The Student Services fees for the Agriculture campus students be increased by:

- **\$4.15 per term for a full-time student,**
- **\$2.60 for a full-time summer student, and**
- **\$0.80 for part-time students in fall, winter and summer terms.**

CARRIED.

8.1.4 Residence and Food Service Fees

Moved by A. Palmeter, seconded B. Soroka:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve the 2017-18 residence room and meal plan rate schedule as presented.

CARRIED.

8.1.5 Student Referendum Fee Proposals

Board members agreed to deal with the four motions together.

Moved by A. Palmeter, seconded K. Reid:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve an increase to the DASA fee of \$1.52 per full-time student and \$0.75 per part-time student, per semester on the Truro campus.

CARRIED.

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve the increase to the Dalhousie Bike Centre fee of \$0.50 per full-time student, per semester on the Halifax campus, as well as the introduction of the Dalhousie Bike Centre fee of \$0.50 per part-time student, per semester on the Halifax campus.

CARRIED.

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve the increase to the Dalhousie Loaded Ladle fee of \$1.50 per full-time student per semester (to a total of \$4.50 per semester) on the Halifax campus.

CARRIED.

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve a new 2017-18 Dalhousie Survivor Support Centre levy of \$2.50 per full-time student and \$1.50 per part-time student per semester on the Halifax campus.

CARRIED.

In response to a question regarding electoral process for these referenda, it was clarified that student societies have the opportunity each year to request a levy. These levies are subject to approval by DSU Council and then presented as referendum questions during the general elections. This year, there was 13% voter turnout. Each of these motions was approved by a majority of votes cast.

8.1.6 Metro Transit U-Pass Fee Increase

Moved by A. Palmeter, seconded B. Soroka:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Finance, Audit, Investment & Risk Committee, approve the 2017-18 U-Pass fee of \$155.20 for full-time (fall/winter) students (pro-rated to \$77.60) for the winter and summer terms, effective for the Fall term 2017.

CARRIED.

8.2 Universities Canada Principles on Indigenous Education

B. Hanf introduced the motion on behalf of the Academic and Student Affairs Committee and the Community Affairs Committee.

Moved by B. Hanf, seconded by K. Reid:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Academic and Student Affairs Committee and the Community Affairs Committee, adopt the Universities Canada Principles on Indigenous Education.

CARRIED.

8.3 Agricultural Campus Master Plan

W. Fares introduced the motion on behalf of the Capital Projects & Facilities Committee.

Moved by W Fares, seconded by L. Jennings:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Capital Projects & Facilities Committee, approve the Dalhousie University Agricultural Campus Master Plan dated March 2017.

CARRIED.

8.4 AC Feed Barn/Ruminant Animal Centre Phase 1 & Phase 2 (Board 1 Approval)

W. Fares spoke to the Agricultural Campus Feed Barn and Interpretive Centre project, noting that the previous feed barn was destroyed in a fire last year and that costs of the project will largely be covered from insurance monies.

W. Fares moved, seconded by A. Palmeter:

THAT the Board of Governors approve the expenditure of a sum not to exceed \$50,000 to complete the Schematic Design Stage of the Feed Barn Replacement and Interpretive Centre Construction Project (Board 1 Approval).

In response to a question regarding animal care standards, it was confirmed that the building designs were developed in consideration of stringent animal care requirements and these have not been comprised with the scaled-down approach.

CARRIED.

8.5 AC Student Learning Commons (Board 1 Approval)

W. Fares spoke to the AC Student Learning Commons proposal, noting that there is currently no space on the Agricultural Campus for students to gather socially and that the project will be funded by fundraising. It was also noted that there has been strong support for the project from the community and from donors.

W. Fares moved, seconded by R. Richardson:

THAT the Board of Governors approve the expenditure of a sum not to \$300K for the Design Phase of the Agricultural Student Learning Commons Project (Board 1 Approval).

CARRIED.

8.6 Board Appointments Process – Amendments to current document

C. Thomas spoke to the amendments to the Board Appointments Process, noting that these arose out of the recent governance review. The Committee is recommending some revisions of a “house-keeping” nature to reflect current language and process, but more significantly, the addition of new language to more formally reflect the work that the Committee (and previously the Governance & Nominating Committee) has undertaken in recent years to promote increased diversity of Board membership.

It was agreed that, under the section heading “Criteria for Board of Governors Membership”, the reference to “racially underrepresented” members should be amended to read “racially visible”.

C. Thomas moved, seconded by M. Awad:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Human Resources Committee, approve the revised Board of Governors Appointment Process, as amended.

CARRIED.

8.7 Draft Policy on Policies

C. Thomas introduced the draft Policy on Policies, noting that Dalhousie currently lacks a clear policy framework to guide members of University administration with authority for policy development. The purpose of the proposed Policy on Policies is to establish an appropriate mechanism for the development, approval, amendment and revocation of University policies in a consistent and coordinated manner. It will also assist in establishing an understanding and use across the institution of an appropriate hierarchy of governing documents (policies, procedures, guidelines and protocols).

Ms. Thomas noted that the work of S. Brousseau, University Secretary, and Karen Crombie, General Counsel, throughout the development of this Policy is particularly appreciated. K. Hewitt commented that the draft Policy was also reviewed and approved by Senate and that he wanted to note the input of senators to the final document.

C. Thomas moved, seconded by K. Hewitt:

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Human Resources Committee, approve the draft Policy on Policies as presented.

CARRIED.

9. Items for Information

9.1 Re-vision of Ceremonial Mace

Peter Dykhuis and Christine Macy spoke to the re-visioning of Dalhousie's ceremonial mace, noting that this project emerged as a response to the *Belong* Report and to Dalhousie's 200th Anniversary. They highlighted the importance of commissioning a new ceremonial symbol that will represent an inclusive and holistic representation of Dalhousie's history. The design of the new symbol will be determined via an open call to artists, and so the continued inclusion of the mace is therefore to be determined.

Board members expressed support for the initiative, noting that symbols matter and have power. It was noted that the Board will be updated on this initiative as it moves along.

9.2 Board Standing Committee Reports

It was requested that any questions regarding the circulated reports be directed to the appropriate Committee Chair.

10. In Camera Session

The Board moved to an *in camera* session.

11. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 6:25 p.m.